



**INTERNATIONAL TROPICAL  
TIMBER COUNCIL**

**COMMITTEE ON  
REFORESTATION AND FOREST MANAGEMENT**

Distr.  
GENERAL

CRF(LII)/5  
8 November 2018

ENGLISH ONLY

FIFTY-SECOND SESSION  
5 - 9 November 2018  
Yokohama, Japan

**REPORT TO THE INTERNATIONAL TROPICAL TIMBER COUNCIL FROM  
THE FIFTY-SECOND SESSION OF THE COMMITTEE ON  
REFORESTATION AND FOREST MANAGEMENT**

**Table of Contents**

**Report**

**Appendix A: Shortlist of Completed Projects in the Field of Reforestation and Forest Management Considered Relevant for Ex-post Evaluation**



**Item 1 - Opening of the Session**

The Fifty-second Session of the Committee on Reforestation and Forest Management (CRF) was opened on 6 November 2018 by Mr. Dambis Kaip (Papua New Guinea), Chairperson of the CRF. The CRF Session adopted the provisional agenda as contained in Document CRF(LII)/1.

**Item 2 - Adoption of Agenda and Organization of Work**

The Provisional Agenda for the CRF, as contained in Document CRF(LII)/1, was duly adopted. To expedite proceedings, the Agenda items 4 and 6 were considered at the Joint Session of the Committees convened on 6 November in order to ensure that all agenda items are covered within the limited time available to the Committee. The Chairperson of the CRF proposed to organize the Session in the following order: Item 3, Item 5, Item 7, Item 9, Item 10, Item 8, Item 11, Item 12, Item 13, Item 14 and Item 15. The list of participants is presented in Document ITTC(LIV)/Info.2.

**Item 3 - Admission of Observers**

The Committee admitted the Observers listed in Document ITTC(LIV)/Info.3 Rev.1, as approved by the Council.

**Item 4 – ITTO Annual Market Discussion - 2018**

The Committees noted the summary of the ITTO Annual Market Discussion – 2018, held in the Joint Session of All Committees on 6 November 2018, as contained in Appendix A to Document CEM-CFI(LII)/4. The theme of the Market Discussion was “Private Sector Tropical Timber Promotion Initiatives – An Opportunity for Collaboration”. Mr. André de Boer (TAG Co-coordinator) chaired the Market Discussion.

The following feature presentations were made during the Market Discussion (available on [www.itto.int](http://www.itto.int)):

Mr. Benoît Jobbé-Duval, Managing Director Association Technique Internationale des Bois	<i>Fair and Precious, the Umbrella Brand to Support Certified Tropical Timber</i>
Ms. Françoise van de Ven, Secrétaire-Générale Union des Forestiers Industriels du Gabon et Aménagistes (UFIGA)	<i>Tropical Forest, Legality, Sustainability, Certification and .... Soccer Fields!</i>
Dr. Qian Meng, Research Associate Research Institute of Forestry Policy and Information Chinese Academy of Forestry	<i>The Newly Launched Global Green Supply Chain (GGSC) – A Chinese Private Sector Initiative for Sustainable Timber Purchasing</i>
Mr. Eric D. de Munck, MSc. Netherlands Timber Trade Association (NTTA) Timber Information Centre	<i>Strengthening Sustainable Tropical Timber in Civil Works – a Dutch Private Sector Promotion Initiative</i>
Mr. Ngo Sy Hoai, Vice Secretary General Vietnam Timber and Forest Products Association Secretary General, Vietnam Forester Club	<i>Promoting Partnership between Private Sector and Small Households for Sustainable Production and Marketing of Planted Wood in Vietnam</i>
Mr. Gleisson Tagliari, Director Mato Grosso State Timber Production and Exportation Industries Center (CIPEM)	<i>Responsible Production – Forest Guardians</i>
Ms. Cindy Squires, Executive Director International Wood Products Association (IWPA)	<i>North America – A Multi-Modal Collaborative Tropical Timber Promotion Strategy</i>

The Committees further noted the statement of the Trade Advisory Group (TAG) presented during the Market Discussion as contained in Appendix B to Document CEM-CFI(LII)/4.

### **Item 5 - Policy Work**

The Committee considered the progress in the implementation of the following policy-related matters:

**(i) Restoration, conservation and sustainable use of mangrove ecosystems  
[Activity 5, ITTO Biennial Work Programme 2018-2019]**

The Secretariat reported to the Committee on the progress made in the implementation of this Activity as follows:

- This activity was approved as a part of the ITTO Biennial Work Programme (BWP) 2018-2019 by the Council in November 2017. It aims to conduct a global mangrove thematic study to review the future potential of sustainable management of mangroves in securing ecosystems and in improving the resilience of vulnerable coastal communities.
- This activity is a follow-up to the recommendations of the International Conference on Sustainable Mangrove Ecosystems held on 18-21 April 2017 in Bali, Indonesia with the generous contribution of the Governments of Japan and the United States. The conference was organized jointly by ITTO, the Ministry of Environment and Forestry of Indonesia and the International Society of Mangrove Ecosystems (ISME) with the support of many partners, including the Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR), FAO, US Forest Service, and AFoCo as well as civil society groups and the private sector in Indonesia.
- The outcomes of the International Conference on Sustainable Mangrove Ecosystems, including “Bali Call to Action for Sustainable Mangrove Ecosystems, are available on the ITTO Website. ITTO’s Tropical Forest Update (26 No 3) reported on the International Conference. The outcomes were also introduced in an official side event of UNFCCC COP23 titled “Mangroves in the Tropics: Realizing the potential for Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation” on 13 November 2017.

The Committee noted that this activity is still pending financing and it will be implemented in collaboration with close partners as soon as the necessary financing is made.

**(ii) Monitor progress in the application of criteria and indicators for sustainable forest management, collaboration on criteria and indicators for SFM  
[Activity 8 (a) & (b) and Activity 15, ITTO Biennial Work Programme 2018-2019]**

The Secretariat reported to the Committee on the progress made in the implementation of the Activity 8 (a) & (b) and the Activity 15 as follows:

- No national workshop on the promotion of the ITTO Criteria and Indicators, approved by the council in 2016, was organized by the ITTO Secretariat in 2018 because the Activity 8 (a) is pending financing. These national workshops on ITTO Criteria and Indicators are supposed to give priority to new ITTO member countries, while taking the opportunity to incorporate some related topics such as forestry auditing, forest certification, international reporting requirements, etc.
- As the Activity 8 (b) is pending financing, the revision of the ATO-ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators (PC&I) for the sustainable management of African natural forests was not undertaken by the ITTO Secretariat. This revision is considered as an urgent matter for the African ITTO member countries, as the current set of ATO-ITTO PC&I was already endorsed by many ITTO member countries in Africa as part of their national forest policies. It is also used as a reference policy document contributing to the implementation of the Voluntary Partnership Agreement (VPA), under the Forest Law Enforcement Governance and Trade (FLEGT), being negotiated by some ITTO member countries in Africa with the European Commission. This ITTO Policy publication is a tool contributing to strengthen the cooperation and collaboration on SFM issues between ITTO and African member countries, because it had been promoted through the implementation of the ITTO phased regional project PD 124/01 (M).
- There was no participation of ITTO in international meetings regarding Criteria and Indicators because the Activity 15 is pending financing. Thus, ITTO could not take advantage of synergies with other international organizations (FAO and others) dealing with the use of Criteria and Indicators as a guidance tool for the promotion of sustainable forest management in the tropics. As the 2016 version of the ITTO Criteria and Indicators is closely correlated to the ITTO Voluntary Guidelines for the sustainable management of natural tropical forests, adopted by the Council through the Decision 4(XLIX) and published in 2015, it is important to give priority to the holding of the third regional workshop on the ITTO Voluntary Guidelines for Latin American countries if funds are made available by the 54th ITTC session.
- Work will commence for the Activity 8 (a) & (b), as well as for the Activity 15, upon funds being made available.

During the discussion on this Item 5 (ii) of the Committee agenda, the Delegation of Cambodia made comments on the implementation of this Activity in relation to the definition of forests in the ITTO publication on Voluntary Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests which is focused on natural forests and is not taking into account the man-made forests. The Secretariat clarified that there is a separate ITTO publication on the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests.

**(iii) Update the ITTO Guidelines for Forest Landscape Restoration  
[Activity 10 (b), ITTO Biennial Work Programme 2018-2019] [Document CRF(LII)/4]**

The Secretariat reported to the Committee on the progress made in the implementation of this Activity as follows:

- As part of the ITTO Biannual Work Programme (BWP) 2018-2019 adopted by the Council in November 2017, the activity is to revise the ITTO Guidelines for the management of secondary tropical forests, the restoration of degraded tropical forests and the rehabilitation of degraded forest land which was published in 2002, taking into account global emerging issues and priorities.
- ITTO has been engaged in the analysis of on-going Forest Landscape Restoration (FLR) programmes of the Collaborative Partnership on Forests (CPF) members under the CPF Joint Initiative on FLR which is being implemented by IUCN with funds from the Global Environment Facility (GEF).
- Two consultants, Prof Jürgen Blaser (Switzerland) and Dr. Cesar Sabogal (Peru) are currently analysing the FLR programmes of the CPF members. Partial financial support was provided by the Korean government and the consultants recently produced a comprehensive report in Document CRF(LII)/4. They are also reviewing the proposed revision of the ITTO restoration guidelines (2002).
- A FLR expert group meeting will take place in Bangkok, Thailand, to facilitate the review of the on-going FLR programmes and development of ITTO/CPF restoration guidelines for degraded tropical forest landscapes which would contribute to developing policies and actions for a wide range of committed stakeholders of the CPF and the Global Partnership on Forest and Landscape Restoration (GPFLR)

The consultant, Prof Jürgen Blaser made a presentation on ITTO's restoration guidelines and highlighted the following points:

- The objectives and overall focus of new ITTO/CPF Restoration Guidelines for Tropical Forest Landscapes could focus on "Building sustainable forest landscapes in the tropics" and the scope of new guidelines could include mainstreaming FLR in national development programmes/plans with technical guidance on restoration assessment, integrated landscape management, capacity development and cost-effective monitoring schemes.
- Missing aspects in the current FLR process include tenure and resource use rights, market strategies and value chains for FLR products, partnership building at multiple levels and strategies to build connectivity of fragmented forests
- Possible restoration situations for FLR options include forest production areas, forest protection areas, riparian strips, regenerating forest areas in mosaic landscapes, degraded agriculture areas, degraded pasture/grazing areas and degraded mangrove areas

In the ensuing discussion to review the focus, purpose and scope of the new guidelines, key comments made by delegates include the following:

- The Delegation of Benin, supported by the Delegation of Mexico, noted the importance of identifying the causes of forest degradation for development of more effective restoration strategies and encouraged the inclusion of guidance for forest fires and sacred forests in new guidelines.
- The Delegation of Germany highlighted that revised/new guidelines should provide guidance on restoring degraded tropical forests and should be a practical technical guide. He also underscored the importance of providing guidance on securing land tenure to ensure long-term management responsibility of restored degraded tropical forests along with cost-effective monitoring schemes to support the success of long-term restoration efforts.
- The Delegation of Cambodia, supported by the Delegations of Thailand and Guatemala, emphasized the importance of providing guidance on plantations for timber production and engagement of the private sector for investment.
- The Delegation of Republic of Korea commented on the importance of restoration in achieving sustainable forest management and informed the Committee that the Korean government would finance an amount of US\$150,000 to this restoration policy work for the implementation of ITTO BWP 2018-2019.

- The Delegation of the United States supported the need for clear geographical coverage of new guidelines and refined definition of FLR in terms of economic, social and ecological aspects. She noted some missing aspects in the current FLR process such as tenure and resource use rights, market strategies and value chains and partnership building at multiple levels. In the new guidelines, she recommended the inclusion of the existing tools developed by partners including the World Research Institute and looked forward to the advancement of new guidelines with inputs from CPF members.
- The Delegation of Japan noted the importance of more clear specification of the target audiences including the private sector; generic guidance in line with ITTO's mandates and core businesses to enhance fundraising strategies and sustainable use of planted forests.
- The Delegation of Mexico noted the need for country specific management approaches to address land tenure issues, introducing the national restoration strategies including the provision of environmental services to support recovery of ecological resilience as well as human well-being. Regarding monitoring of restoration activities, he pointed out that appropriate indicators are useful to assess the progress of FLR.
- The Delegation of Guatemala suggested the development of national FLR strategies with identification of active goals to address degraded ecosystems including soil degradation and specifying the role of the government in promoting restoration practices.
- The Delegation of Finland encouraged inputs from CBD and UNFCCC in reconciling biodiversity and carbon in restoration of degraded tropical forests. She emphasized the need to provide more guidance on gender aspects/empowering women in FLR in new guidelines.

The Committee commended the consultant, Prof. J Blaser for his comprehensive report and presentation. The Committee expressed its gratitude to the Korean government for pledging an amount of US\$150,000 to support the implementation of this activity. The Committee looked forward to the advancement of the development of ITTO/CPF restoration guidelines for degraded tropical landscapes, incorporating the comments made during the current session and inputs from the upcoming FLR expert group meeting in Bangkok and CPF members.

**(iv) Prevention and management of fire in tropical timber-producing forests  
[Activity 12, ITTO Biennial Work Programme 2018-2019]**

The Secretariat reported to the Committee on the progress made in the implementation of this Activity as follows:

- This activity aims to enhance synergies between ITTO forest fire projects and international mechanisms. More specifically this activity intends to assist the participation of ITTO forest fire related project teams/stakeholders in national/regional forest fire meetings and in the 7th International Wildland Fire Conference (IWFC) which will be held in October 2019 in Campo Grande, Mato Grosso do Sul, Brazil.
- The 7th IWFC is being hosted by the Ministry of Environment of Brazil through IBAMA. The 7th IWFC is being organized in collaboration with FAO, UN International Strategy for Disaster Reduction (UNISDR), Global Fire Monitoring Center, USFS and other partners. The main theme of the 7th IWFC is "Facing Fire in a Changing World: Reducing Vulnerability of Landscapes and People by Integrated Fire Management". The sub-themes to be discussed during the IWFC 2019 are:
  - Role / Contribution of Civil Society in Integrated Fire Management (IFM),
  - IFM Concepts for Promoting and Stabilizing Resilient Landscapes,
  - Contribution of IFM to Mitigate Impacts on Atmosphere and Climate,
  - Technological Advances on Prevention and Fighting Wildfires, and
  - IFM as Key Element of Fire Management Policies. This policy discussion will include fire management in the international agendas such as the Sustainable Development Goals, the Paris Agreement and the Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction 2015-2030 (Sendai Framework).
- In its policy work, ITTO developed Guidelines on Fire Management in Tropical Forests in 1997 after the extensive fires in SE Asia during the El Niño of 1982-83. In terms of building capacity to address challenges in fire management, ITTO has supported many projects and made an Ex-Post Evaluation of the Thematic Group on Forest Fire covering 11 Projects in 2015.
- ITTO is currently a member of the Global Wildland Advisory Group of the United Nations International Strategy for Disaster Reduction (UNISDR) and International Liaison Committee (ILC) of International Wildland Fire Conferences. ITTO provided support to the 6th IWFC which took place in October 2015 in South Korea by providing assistance to 14 participants from ITTO member countries and organizing a side event. As such, ITTO will continue to seek support for capacity building fire management capacities in its Producer Member Countries through strengthening partnerships to develop a tropical forest fire prevention and management programme.

In the discussion, the Delegation of Benin noted that forest fires have been one of the most threatening factors destroying long-term SFM achievements and practices on the ground and considered this activity as a high priority. He suggested that all forest fires-related projects awaiting financing should receive good support from donors and wanted the revitalization of the unfunded forest fire project in Benin. The Committee noted the importance of this policy activity in the implementation of the BWP 2018-2019.

**(v) Developments in the UNFCCC regarding Forests and their Potential Implications for Tropical Forests and the World Tropical Timber Economy [Decisions 2(XXXIX) and 1(XLI)]**

The Committee took note that this policy activity has been an agenda item of the Council to provide an update on the recent developments in the UNFCCC regarding forest in particular REDD+ in developing countries. The invited REDD+ expert, Dr. Makino Yamanoshita (Senior Researcher, Forest Conservation Team at the Institute for Global Environmental Strategies (IGES), Japan) made a presentation on the developments in the international climate change discussion regarding forests, highlighting the following:

- IPCC's Special Report on Global Warming of 1.5°C released in October 2018 showed the important role of the forest as there is an increasing need for large scale emission reductions from deforestation and removals by afforestation and restoration. Land sector needs to turn into the sink.
- Overall progress with REDD+ is moving slowly from readiness to results-based payments. It is essential to scale up REDD+ financing in order to speed up its implementation. The pilot programme for REDD+ plus results-based payments which was adopted at the 18th meeting of the Green Climate Fund's Board held in 2017 is operational with a maximum amount of USD 500 million until 2022.
- Japan's JCM (Joint Crediting Mechanism) REDD+ is a public-private partnership. Guidelines for JCM REDD+ have been agreed between concerned organizations between Japan and Cambodia and one forest conservation project is in the pipeline with support of a NGO and a private company in Japan.

In the discussion, Delegation of Cambodia pointed out that plantations in degraded tropical forests would be an important solution in addressing the global warming highlighted in the IPCC's Special Report on Global Warming of 1.5°C. He underlined the importance of planted forests and agroforestry in directly contributing to job creation and livelihood improvements of local communities while reducing pressures to natural forests. He encouraged ITTO to play an increasing role in promoting the sustainable use of planted forests. The Delegation of Benin said that REDD+ has been promoted as an important solution to climate change mitigation issues but its progress has been slow due to limited access to REDD+ financing. He encouraged ITTO to support his country's access to REDD+ financing. The Delegation of Thailand said that plantations of fast-growing species would bring quicker results in tackling the urgent global warming challenge. The Delegation of Japan noted the importance of financing of forest sector to reflect the increasing roles of forest sector in climate change mitigation.

The Committee commended Dr. Yamanoshita (IGES) for her presentation.

**(vi) Joint ITTO-CBD Collaborative Initiative for Tropical Forest Biodiversity [Decision 6(XLVI)]**

The Committee took note that this policy activity has been an agenda item of the Council to update the implementation of the ITTO-CBD Collaborative Initiative for Tropical Forest Biodiversity. This Joint Initiative aims to provide support to ITTO producer member countries in enhancing local capacity for biodiversity conservation in production forests and improving conservation and management of protected areas, especially in association with buffering protected areas and transboundary conservation. The Secretariat reported to the Committee on the progress made in the implementation of this Joint Initiative as follows:

- Under the ITTO-CBD Collaborative Initiative, 12 projects are operational in the three tropical regions as of Oct 2018 and a total of over USD 15 million has been mobilized.
- Information on the projects under the ITTO-CBD Collaborative Initiative was welcomed by the CBD Subsidiary Body on Implementation at its Second meeting in July 2018. In the draft decisions of the 14th Meeting of CBD COP (Sharm El-Sheikh, Egypt, 17-29 November 2018) under Item 14 (Cooperation with other conventions, international organizations and initiatives), paragraph 27 specifies "further strengthening the collaboration of the CBD Secretariat with the International Tropical Timber Organization under the Collaborative Initiative for Tropical Forest Biodiversity".
- Collaboration with the CBD Secretariat would include the development of a communication strategy on the outcomes generated by the Initiative in the coming years.
- This Initiative is already visibly contributing towards the achievement of the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011-2020, in particular, the forest-related Aichi Biodiversity Targets 5, 7, 11 and 15.

During the discussion, the Delegation of Benin commended the work of the Secretariat under the Collaborative Initiative and looked forward to the effective implementation of the Initiative including a sacred forest project in his country.

**(vii) Development and implementation of “Guidelines for Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts Assessment (ESIA) in ITTO Projects”**

As a new item of policy work, the Committee reviewed the development and implementation of “Guidelines for Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts Assessment (ESIA) in ITTO Projects”. The Secretariat reported to the Committee on the implementation of the Guidelines for ESIA, highlighting that these guidelines were approved by the Committee at its fifth session in November 2016 with a recommendation for its implementation in a pilot phase. The 2016 Guidelines for ESIA were amended to reflect the guidance of ITTO Policy Guidelines on Gender Equality and Empowering Women (GEEW) which were adopted by the Council in 2017 in a consistent and coherent way. The amended version of the 2016 Guidelines for ESIA was briefly introduced to the Committee for review.

In the discussion, the Delegation of Cambodia requested clarification on who will conduct the environmental and social impact assessment independently from a proposal proponent team. He also requested clarification on who will pay the costs in engaging an accredited agency specialized for such assessment which would require not only a certain financial resource but also a long public consultation process. He recommended that an in-depth review should be implemented of existing environmental and social impact assessment practices at national and local levels in order to refine the 2016 ESIA guidelines. The Delegation of the United States recommended more inputs from countries should be encouraged and that the 2016 ESIA guidelines should be reviewed by the Expert Panel for Technical Appraisal of Project Proposals at its next meeting. Noting that the current ITTO Manual for Project Formulation already contains social and environmental impacts and risks assessment, the Delegation of Togo considered that guidance on environmental and social impact and risk assessment is already provided in the Project Formulation Manual and this is sufficient without developing new guidelines for ESIA. He recommended revision of Project Formulation Manual providing more guidance on ESIA.

In light of the importance of practical implementation of the 2016 Guidelines for ESIA, the Committee recommended that the 2016 Guidelines be refined to address the implementation problems requiring a high cost and long consultation process when a proposal proponent undertakes ESIA. It also recommended that the Expert Panel for Technical Appraisal of Proposals at its next meeting should have an interactive review of the issue of ESIA with more inputs from countries. The Committee further recommended that the refined version of the 2016 Guidelines for ESIA, with track changes, be made available to member countries for their inputs. The track changed version of the refined version, incorporating member countries inputs, will be made available in advance to facilitate its review at the next session of the Committee.

**Item 6 - Report of the Expert Panel for Technical Appraisal of Project Proposals**

The Joint Session of All Committees considered the report of the Expert Panel for Technical Appraisal of Project Proposals presented by panel member, Mr. Jobst-Michael Schroeder (Germany), as contained in document ITTC/EP-53.

In its general findings and recommendations, as derived from the appraisal of 39 proposals (33 projects and 3 pre-projects), the Fifty-third Panel noted that the quality of the proposals improved in comparison to those assessed in the previous Panel, which is reflected by the fact that:

- Five (5) Proposals (13 percent of the total) received a category 4, indicating that the Expert Panel does not commend these to the Committee for approval as they require complete reformulation;
- Eighteen (18) Proposals: 1 Pre-project and 17 Project Proposals (46 percent of the total) will be sent back to proponents for essential revisions, rated as category 2;
- Sixteen (16) Proposals: 2 Pre-project and 14 Project Proposals (41 percent of the total) were commended to the Committee for final appraisal with minor modifications required (category 1).

Only 3 of the total 39 proposals were categorized under Forest Industry, 5 were categorized under Economics, Statistics and Markets and 31 (79%) under Reforestation and Forest Management. Government agencies submitted 15 proposals, research organizations submitted 13 proposals, and NGOs submitted 11 proposals. Only 2 proposals were submitted from a Women’s Association and none from youth related Associations. Only one proposal focused on transboundary conservation and two proposals were focused specifically on gender issues. Although the Panel noticed that more proposals included gender aspects, there is

still a need to further integrate gender according to the ITTO Policy Guidelines on Gender Equality and Empowering Women (GEEW).

The presentation also highlighted general findings and recommendations of the Expert Panel at its Fifty-third meeting, which include the need to include relevant elements from the ITTO Policy Guidelines on Gender Equality and Empowering Women (GEEW) and the Guidelines for Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts Assessment in ITTO Projects in the Panel members' Scoring Sheet.

### **Item 7 – New Projects and Pre-projects**

The Committee noted the projects and pre-projects that were approved under the time-bound electronic no objection procedures to accept the Expert Panel's ratings and circulated to member countries pursuant to Decision 6(XLIII), as contained in Document ITTC/EP-52, following the recommendations of the Expert Panel at its Fifty-third Meeting held in Yokohama, Japan from 9-13 July 2018, as follows:

### **Fifty-third Expert Panel**

Category 1:

PD/PPD NUMBER	TITLE	SUBMITTING COUNTRY
PD 781/15 Rev.3 (F)	Master Plan for the Repositioning of Forest Management as A Competitive Land Use in the Agroforestry Landscape of the Northern Region of Costa Rica	Costa Rica
PD 842/17 Rev.2 (F)	Exploring Innovative and Appropriate Tenure Conflicts Resolution Model on State Forest for Strengthening Forest Management Unit ( <i>Kesatuan Pengelolaan Hutan/KPH</i> ) in Implementing Sustainable Forest Management	Indonesia
PD 849/17 Rev.2 (F)	Increasing Commercial Reforestation Competitiveness in Costa Rica	Costa Rica
PD 868/18 Rev.1 (F)	Improving Local Governance for Landscape Restoration in the San Alejandro River Subwatershed, Padre Abad Province, Department of Ucayali, Peru	Peru
PD 873/18 Rev.1 (F)	Integrated Management of Natural Resources and Biodiversity in the Tacaná Volcano and its Area of Influence in Mexico and Guatemala – Phase II	Guatemala
PD 881/18 Rev.1 (F)	Gender Mainstreaming in the Development of Actions to Control Deforestation and Forest Degradation in the Congo Basin	Cameroon
PD 884/18 Rev.1 (F)	Pilot Sustainable Management Systems for Secondary Natural Forests in the Collective Afro-descendant Community Territory of the Bajo Calima Community Council, Municipality of Buenaventura, Colombia	Colombia
PD 887/18 Rev.1 (F)	Production and Availability of Teak Clone Varieties: Development of Improved Plant Material for Reforestation in Togo	Togo
PD 888/18 Rev.1 (F)	Enhancement of the Participatory Bushfire Prevention and Management System in Togo	Togo
PD 891/18 Rev.1 (F)	Bamboo for Life: An Alternative for the Rehabilitation of Degraded Forest Lands and Sustainable Rural Development in the San Martin Region, Peru	Peru
PPD 191/18 Rev.1 (F)	Support to the Local Communities of the Mono Plain for the Promotion and Sustainable Management of Community Forests in Togo	Togo
PPD 192/18 Rev.1 (F)	Formulation of A Project Proposal on “Strengthening Forest Research to Improve the Efficient Use of Timber and The Conservation and Sustainable Development of Forests in Guatemala”	Guatemala

Category 4:

PD/PPD NUMBER	TITLE	SUBMITTING COUNTRY
PD 869/18 (F)	Developing Decision Support System for Private Forest Governance in Java	Indonesia
PD 872/18 (F)	Exemplary Indigenous Species Reforestation With Legally Registered Land Ownership Title Deeds For 100 Marginalized Women On Apeguso-Frankadua Degraded Savanna Woodlands, Ghana	Ghana
PD 875/18 (F)	Fighting Ecosystem Deforestation in Mexico's Caribbean Coast	Mexico
PD 882/18 (F)	Reduction of the Vulnerability of Mangrove Ecosystems to Combat Climate Change and Improve the Living Conditions of Communities, Abbreviated to "REVEMAC AP"	Cameroon
PD 885/18 (F)	Finding and Report of Typical Cases on the Conversion of Planted Tropical Forest to Natural Tropical Forest (Secondary Tropical Forest) in Hainan Province, China	China

The Committee took note that the Fifty-fourth and Fifty-fifth Meetings of the Expert Panel are tentatively scheduled for 4-8 February 2019 and 24-28 June 2019, respectively based on Document ITTC(LIV)/Info.6 – Project Cycle Calendar for Spring 2019 and Document ITTC(LIV)/Info.7 - Project Cycle Calendar for Autumn 2019.

**Item 8 – Review of Projects and Pre-projects in Progress**

The Committee was informed that the Secretariat's report and the Committee's discussion were limited to the following projects and pre-projects in order to expedite proceedings, in accordance with the Section VI of Annex A to Decision 4(XXV):

- Those having implementation problems;
- Those requiring additional funds;
- Those requesting extension of more than six months beyond the original duration; or
- Those requesting essential major modifications of the work plan and budget.

**8.1 Projects**

The Committee took note of the status of projects that had been approved by the Council, as contained in Document CRF(LII)/2, as categorized: (A) projects under implementation (twenty-three projects); (B) projects awaiting implementation agreement (one project); and (C) projects awaiting financing (twenty-one projects).

Then, the Committee considered the implementation issues, details of which were as follows:

**(A) Projects under implementation**

**1) PD 383/05 Rev.2 (F) Community Forest Development in Gabon**

The Committee took note that the implementation of this project had contributed to the sustainable management of the rural forest estate in Gabon and organizing the village estates and combating poverty in the communities established in the rural areas through the development of community forests. The project contributed to experiment the establishment of three pilot community forests and to develop SFM guidelines for community forests based on the results derived from established pilot community forests. Referring to question from the Delegation of Germany, the Secretariat explained to the Committee that the project specific objective was still relevant although its operation period lasted 89 months instead of 36 initially planned by the implementing agency because of the restructuring of the executing agency and very frequent turn-over of project coordinators.

The Committee also noted that, in August 2016, the Secretariat received the Completion Report. However, the Final Financial Audit Report has not been submitted by the Executing Agency. The Secretariat sent several reminder correspondences to the Executing Agency asking for the submission of the Final Financial Audit Report, at its earliest convenience, in order to strictly abide to ITTO's rules and procedures applying to ITTO projects. The Committee recalled that it had already urged the Executing Agency to submit

the Final Financial Audit Report at its Fitty-first Session. There was no Delegation attending the Committee in order to comment on this issue prior to the adequate decision to be made by the Committee.

The non-compliance with ITTO rules and procedures, by not submitting the required final financial audit report to the ITTO Secretariat, as well as the lack of reaction of the implementing agency to reminder messages sent by the ITTO Secretariat, was a basis for the Committee to consider recommending the termination process of this project in accordance with the rules and procedures applying to ITTO projects.

However, the Delegation of Japan did not support the recommendation for the termination process of this project and asked the Secretariat to continue reminding the implementing agency the urgent need to submit the Final Financial Audit Report. In addition, the Delegation of Togo suggested that the Secretariat could consider undertaking a special financial monitoring mission in order to assess the use of the ITTO funds not covered by the previous Financial Audit Reports, if the Final Financial Audit Report is not submitted by a new deadline to be proposed by the Secretariat. Therefore, the Committee urged the project implementing agency to submit the Final Financial Audit Report, by 31 March 2019.

**2) PD 456/07 Rev.4 (F) Building the Capacities of Forestry Training Institutions Members of the Network of Central African Forestry and Environmental Training Institutions (RIFFEAC) for Providing SFM Training for Forest Concessions**  
***“Capacity Building for Sustainable Management of Tropical Rainforests and Biodiversity Conservation in the ITTO Congo Basin Countries” (Regional)***

The Secretariat reported to the Committee on the progress made in the implementation of this regional project dealing with the forestry training in the Congo Basin countries, as follows:

- The completion of activities in relation to the capital goods (with all construction/rehabilitation of buildings completed, all vehicles, computers and accessories, as well as forest equipment and materials purchased and delivered) for the benefit of seven RIFFEAC training institutions directly supported by the project (CRESA-Yaoundé in Cameroon, ENEF-Libreville in Gabon, ENEF-Mbalmayo in Cameroon, ERAIFT-Kinshasa in Democratic Republic of Congo, IDR-Brazzaville in Republic of Congo, ISDR-Mbaïki in Central African Republic and University of Dschang in Cameroon).
- The international conference on forestry training in Congo Basin countries, which was held on 5-7 March 2018, in Douala (Cameroon), was attended by more than one hundred experts from Congo Basin countries and from ITTO member countries in Africa, as well as from other continents (America, Asia and Europe). It was the opportunity to adopt the forestry-related training modules to be used by the forestry training institutions operating in the Congo Basin countries.
- The Executing Agency (RIFFEAC Secretariat) submitted a concept note to the Embassy of Japan and JICA Office in Cameroon, in order to start preliminary discussions which could provide appropriate guidance for the preparation of a second phase of this project, under the same partnership involving the COMIFAC, RIFFEAC, JICA and ITTO.
- The project extension was granted until March 2019 in order to allow the project executing agency to ensure the implementation/ownership of the training modules/programmes and associated teaching methodologies in all RIFFEAC training institutions operating in Congo Basin countries, including those not directly supported by the project PD 456/07 Rev.4 (F). The extension period will be also used for the follow-up of the preparation of a second phase of this project.

The Committee took note of the abovementioned achievements and administrative-related information on this project which had been extended until March 2019 in order to allow the executing agency to complete all project activities, including the preparation of the second phase within the partnership of involving COMIFAC, RIFFEAC, JICA and ITTO.

**3) PD 495/08 Rev.4 (F) Guatemalan Forest Productivity Information System (Guatemala)**

The Committee took note that this project has developed a database and information system on productivity (growth rates, species composition, etc.) of various forest types in Guatemala. It has also developed technical packages detailing qualities and end-uses for 11 important forest species (coniferous and broad-leaved). The information system and a project newsletter can be found on the project website ([www.ppm.inab.gob](http://www.ppm.inab.gob)). The final report and all technical outputs of the project were submitted to ITTO in July 2018 and are available on the Project Search function on [www.itto.int](http://www.itto.int) in Spanish. The Committee also noted

that the final financial audit report was just submitted to ITTO by Executing Agency INAB prior to the 52nd Session and that the internal assessment of this audit report was satisfactory.

The Delegation of Guatemala informed the Committee that outcomes of the project such as the database and information system on productivity are playing an important role in improving forest management planning and implementation. He expressed appreciation to the Governments of Japan and the United States for financing the project.

The Committee further noted that all requirements for the completion of a project have been met in accordance with the rules and procedures of ITTO. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

**4) PD 507/08 Rev.1 (F) Development of the National Reforestation Policy and Afforestation Strategy Consistent with Liberia 3C-Approach (Liberia)**

The Secretariat reported to the Committee on the progress made in the implementation of this project by the Forestry Development Authority (FDA) of Liberia, as follows:

- The project implementation had been further extended until December 2017, without additional ITTO funds by the ITTO Secretariat, based on an official request including proper justification with appropriate detailed work plan and budget. It was agreed that the implementation of this project was to be subject to a special arrangement between the executing agency (FDA-Liberia) and a consultancy team led by Juergen BLASER (as supervisor of Liberian students preparing post-graduate degree in HAFL-University of Bern, Switzerland) for updating and analyzing the data and information collected during the implementation of this project, in order to prepare a final technical report. A national workshop was planned for the validation of the final technical report. The most important part of the last installment of ITTO funds were supposed to be directly paid (in tranches) to the consultancy team for the abovementioned activities of this special arrangement.
- However, the project implementing agency (FDA-Liberia) had not submitted neither progress reports nor financial audit reports for the project implementation period covering 2017 and 2018. Therefore, the Secretariat could not assess the implementation of the abovementioned special arrangement which was recommended by the Committee during its 51st session, due to the lack of information.
- The non-compliance with ITTO rules and procedures, by not submitting required reports in 2017 and 2018 to the ITTO Secretariat, as well as the lack of reaction of the implementing agency to reminder messages sent by the ITTO Secretariat, could be a basis for the Committee to consider recommending the termination process of this project in accordance with the rules and procedures applying to ITTO projects.
- The Secretariat was informed about the most recent consultation undertaken between the HAFL-University of Bern in Switzerland and FDA-Liberia in order to revive the special arrangement which was not implemented in 2017 and 2018. Both parties confirmed their commitment to make efforts for the implementation of the abovementioned special arrangement during the new project extension to be granted by the ITTO Secretariat.
- The Delegation of Japan took note of this most recent consultation between the HAFL-University of Bern in Switzerland and FDA-Liberia.

The Committee took note that the new opportunity provided by a special arrangement to be concluded between the Executing Agency (FDA-Liberia) and a consultancy team from HAFL-University of Bern, Switzerland, for the project completion. The Committee asked the executing agency to request for a new project extension duly justified by a plan of operation taking into account the relevant elements of the abovementioned special arrangement between both parties.

**5) PD 653/12 Rev.1 (F) Sustainable, Mixed and Pure Forest Plantation Development in the Transitional Zone of Ghana's Biakoye District Assembly, Employing Poverty Reduction Strategies (Ghana)**

The Secretariat reported to the Committee on the status regarding in the implementation of this project by a national NGO, PICODEV-Ghana, as follows:

- The ITTO Secretariat received the Project Completion Report, but the Final Financial Audit Report was pending at the time of the holding of the 50th Committee session (in November 2016). Although the implementing agency (PICODEV-Ghana) was urged by the 51st Committee session (in December 2017) to strictly abide to ITTO's rules and procedures by submitting the Final Financial Audit Report (FFAR),

not later than the end of March 2018, no report was received by the ITTO Secretariat at the time of the preparation of Committee working documents.

- After an urgent recall sent by the ITTO Secretariat, the implementing agency promised to submit the FFAR, in order to get this project reported as completed by the Committee during its 52nd session in November 2018. However, the Secretariat has not received the Final Financial Audit Report yet, as it was still under preparation.

The Committee took note the promise made by the project executing agency to submit the Final Financial Audit report. Therefore, the Committee urged the project executing agency to submit the Final Financial Audit Report at its earliest convenience, but not later than 31 March 2019.

**6) PD 668/12 Rev.1 (F) Integrated Management of Natural Resources and Biodiversity in the Tacaná Volcano and Its Range of Influence in Mexico and Guatemala**

The Committee took note that this project has promoted sustainable forestry and development on the flanks of the Tacana volcano which straddles the border between Guatemala and Mexico. It has provided training on SFM and implemented alternative livelihoods for local communities in Guatemala and Mexico. The project leader made a presentation on the main achievements of the project to the Committee at its last session in Lima. He highlighted the selection of 7 priority areas for restoration and conservation with the establishment of 12 forest nurseries, livelihood initiatives including ecotourism, agroforestry and silvo-pastoral systems and improved technical and legal frameworks for integrated management in the Tacaná Volcano in the frame of transboundary cooperation between the two countries.

The Committee noted that several technical reports and the final report are available on the Project Search feature on [www.itto.int](http://www.itto.int) in Spanish and two videos summarizing project outputs (available on [www.itto.int](http://www.itto.int)) were submitted to ITTO in the first half of 2018. The implementing agency (Helvetas) and participating governments contributed more to the project than anticipated due to ITTO's impairment of funds. A request to utilize the small amount of remaining funds to produce additional outreach materials (pamphlets, postcards, etc.) to disseminate project results was submitted and approved by ITTO in March 2018. The extra work on outreach materials using remaining project funds was completed in August 2018 and receipts submitted accounting for the use of these funds along with samples of the outreach products produced.

The Delegation of Guatemala commented on the importance of a transboundary cooperation project and expressed its gratitude to the Governments of Japan and the United States for financing the project and to the Secretariat for close cooperation.

The Committee further noted that all required technical reports have been received by the Secretariat and all ITTO funds except additional outreach product development expenditures have been accounted for. The Committee therefore decided to consider this project completed subject to the receipt of a satisfactory audit report for additional outreach product development expenditures.

**(B) Projects awaiting implementation agreement**

The Committee noted that one project is currently awaiting implementation agreement, as contained in Document CRF(LII)/2.

**1) PD 764/14 Rev.3 (F) Enabling Customary Landowners to Participate Effectively in Community Forest Management Schemes Within 6 Pilot Areas of PNG**

The Committee noted that the project aims to establish a model community-based land ownership mapping and forest resource assessment system that supports CFM schemes in PNG by the PNG Forest Authority. The project agreement was sent to PNG Forest Authority after an amendment to the project document. The Delegation of PNG informed the Committee that the signing of the agreement has been delayed due to the official formalities required to get beforehand the no-objection of concerned offices including the State Solicitor's office in PNG. The Committee urged the Executing Agency to expedite the early conclusion of signing the project agreement for the immediate commencement of the project.

**(C) Projects awaiting financing**

The Committee noted that the following twenty-one projects approved at earlier and current sessions were still awaiting funding, out of which nine projects will be sunset if funding is not made available before

the next session. The Chairperson encouraged the Committee members and other donors to provide funding for the implementation of these projects.

- Projects with an asterisk (\*) will become sunset in April 2019
  - Projects with two asterisks (\*\*) will become sunset in July 2019
- 1) \*\*PD 712/13 Rev.2 (F) Enhancing the Implementation of Landscape Management of Giam Siak Kecil-Bukit Batu Biosphere Reserve (GSK-BR) in Riau Province of Sumatra Island, Sumatra (Indonesia)
  - 2) \*\*PD 713/13 Rev.2 (F) Operationalising the Policy on Sustainable Management of Sandalwood Resource Through Improved Livelihood and Increased Participation of Local Communities (Indonesia)
  - 3) PD 723/13 Rev.2 (F) Capacity Building for Strengthening Transboundary Biodiversity Conservation of the Taninthayi Range in Myanmar – Phase I Stage 2 (Myanmar)
  - 4) \*\*PD 735/14 Rev.2 (F) Enhancing Partnership Efforts to Restore Peat Swamp Forests in Sumatra (Indonesia)
  - 5) \*\*PD 736/14 Rev.1 (F) Enhancing Conservation and Sustainable Production of Indonesian Rosewood (*Dalbergia spp*) (Indonesia)
  - 6) \*\*PD 739/14 Rev.1 (F) Initiating the Conservation of Ebony Species (*Diospyros celebica Bakh*) Involving Local Stakeholders in Sulawesi (Indonesia)
  - 7) PD 765/14 Rev.3 (F) Development of A Forest Landscape Restoration Program for Guatemala Based on ITTO Guidelines – Phase II (Guatemala)
  - 8) PD 781/15 Rev.3 (F) Master Plan for the Repositioning of Forest Management as A Competitive Land Use in the Agroforestry Landscape of the Northern Region of Costa Rica (Costa Rica)
  - 9) \*PD 812/16 Rev.2 (F) Promoting Community-Level Forest Landscape Planning, Diversification, Restoration and Protection to Reduce Forest Degradation and Improve Biodiversity and Local Livelihoods (Ghana)
  - 10) \*PD 836/17 Rev.1 (F) Enhancing Capacity of Local Communities and Forest Administration to Effectively Implement Community Forestry Programme (CFP) in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia (Cambodia)
  - 11) PD 842/17 Rev.2 (F) Exploring Innovative and Appropriate Tenure Conflicts Resolution Model on State Forest for Strengthening Forest Management Unit (*Kesatuan Pengelolaan Hutan/KPH*) in Implementing Sustainable Forest Management (Indonesia)
  - 12) PD 849/17 Rev.2 (F) Increasing Commercial Reforestation Competitiveness in Costa Rica (Costa Rica)
  - 13) \*PD 853/17 Rev.1 (F) Forest Fire Prevention and Response in Tropical Forests and Forest Plantations in Peru (Peru)
  - 14) \*PD 861/17 Rev.1 (F) Carbon Storage in Timber Producing Forests as a Value Criterion in Rural Communities in the Yucatan Peninsula, Mexico (Mexico)
  - 15) PD 868/18 Rev.1 (F) Improving Local Governance for Landscape Restoration in the San Alejandro River Subwatershed, Padre Abad Province, Department of Ucayali, Peru (Peru)

- 16) PD 873/18 Rev.1 (F) Integrated Management of Natural Resources and Biodiversity in the Tacaná Volcano and its Area of Influence in Mexico and Guatemala – Phase II (Guatemala)
- 17) PD 881/18 Rev.1 (F) Gender Mainstreaming in the Development of Actions to Control Deforestation and Forest Degradation in the Congo Basin (Cameroon)
- 18) PD 884/18 Rev.1 (F) Pilot Sustainable Management Systems for Secondary Natural Forests in the Collective Afro-descendant Community Territory of the Bajo Calima Community Council, Municipality of Buenaventura, Colombia (Colombia)
- 19) PD 887/18 Rev.1 (F) Production and Availability of Teak Clone Varieties: Development of Improved Plant Material for Reforestation in Togo (Togo)
- 20) PD 888/18 Rev.1 (F) Enhancement of the Participatory Bushfire Prevention and Management System in Togo (Togo)
- 21) PD 891/18 Rev.1 (F) Bamboo for Life: An Alternative for the Rehabilitation of Degraded Forest Lands and Sustainable Rural Development in the San Martin Region, Peru (Peru)

## 8.2 **Pre-project**

The Committee took note of the status of approved pre-projects, as contained in Document CRF(LII)/2 and considered the implementation issues, details of which were as follows:

### **(A) Pre-projects under implementation**

The Committee noted that there was no pre-project currently under implementation.

### **(B) Pre-projects awaiting implementation agreement**

The Committee noted that one project is currently awaiting implementation agreement, as contained in Document CRF(LII)/2.

#### **1) PPD 189/17 Rev.2 (F) Development of A Full Project Proposal to Generate Tools to Ensure the Establishment of Timber Forest Species through Natural Regeneration in the Province of Tahuamanu, Peru (Peru)**

The Committee noted that the pre-project document has been revised to adjust its budget based on the pledge made in the ITTC-53 in Lima. It will be implemented by the National Agrarian University of La Molina (UNALM) in collaboration with the National Forest and Wildlife Service (SERFOR). Reviewing the draft pre-project agreement is under way. It expected it would be finalized soon for the implementation of pre-project activities in early 2019.

### **(C) Pre-projects awaiting financing**

The Committee noted that three pre-projects approved at earlier and current sessions were still awaiting funding, out of which one pre-project will be sunset if funding is not secured before the next session. The Chairperson encouraged the Committee members and other donors to provide funding for the implementation of these pre-projects.

\*In accordance with ITTC Decision 2 (X), Pre-project with an asterisk (\*) will become sunset in April 2019.

- 1) \*PPD 186/16 Rev.2 (F) Establishment of Enabling Conditions for the Restoration and Sustainable Development of Forests in the Southern Area of the Sierra De Lacandon National Park, Maya Biosphere Reserve, Guatemala (Guatemala)
- 2) PPD 191/18 Rev.1 (F) Support to the Local Communities of the Mono Plain for the Promotion and Sustainable Management of Community Forests in Togo (Togo)

- 3) PPD 192/18 Rev.1 (F) Formulation of A Project Proposal on “Strengthening Forest Research to Improve the Efficient Use of Timber and The Conservation and Sustainable Development of Forests in Guatemala” (Guatemala)

### **Item 9 - Report on Completed Projects and Pre-projects**

The Committee considered the completed project contained in Document CRF(LII)/3 and noted that eight projects are to be declared complete by the Council.

#### **9.1 Completed Projects**

- 1) **PD 419/06 Rev.3 (F) EXT Forest Seeds Management and Conservation; Project for Rehabilitation and Restoration of Degraded Forests in Côte d’Ivoire with the involvement of Local Communities (Refugees, Internally Displaced People and Local Populations) (Côte d’Ivoire)**

The Committee took note that implementation of this project had contributed to gradually rehabilitating the Gazetted Forests of Duekoue and Scio in the Western part of Côte d’Ivoire with the participation of local communities (refugees, internally displaced people and local populations). For a post-conflict country like Côte d’Ivoire, the implementation of this project contributed to reinforce the reconciliation and social integration of local communities which were not willing to work together after several years of distrust due to the violence they endured during the civil war in Côte d’Ivoire. The project implementation brought them to work together for the rehabilitation of the Gazetted Forests of Duekoue and Scio that they contributed to degrade during the civil war for their basic needs (mainly food and wood energy). Mr. Constant Yapo, from project executing agency (SODEFOR), made a presentation on the main achievements of this project which was followed by a short video.

The Secretariat informed the Committee that the Completion Report, Consultant’s Report and the Final Financial Audit Report had been delivered by the Executing Agency in accordance with the Project Agreement. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project PD 419/06 Rev.3 (F)-Ext-TICAD5 Rev.1 as completed.

- 2) **PD 450/07 Rev.2 (F,I) Capacity Building for CDM Forestry in the Framework of SFM Emphasizing Community Forests and Poverty Alleviation in Ghana (Ghana)**

The Committee took note that implementation of this project had contributed to improving the capacity for CDM-Forestry in Ghana, through community forestry, for poverty alleviation in conjunction with sustainable forest management (SFM) practices, and by involving the private sector and native communities.

The Secretariat informed the Committee that the Completion Report, Consultant’s Report and the Final Financial Audit Report had been delivered by the Executing Agency in accordance with the Project Agreement. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project PD 450/07 Rev.2 (F,I) as completed.

- 3) **PD 454/07 Rev.3 (F) Community Forest Management: A Sustainable Alternative for the Maués State Forest, Amazonas State (Brazil)**

The Committee took note that this project has been implemented by the Institute of Amazonian Research and Development (IPDA) after replacing the first Executing Agency as this first Executing Agency could not deliver project work. The specific objective of the project was to promote the sustainable management of production forests in the Maués State Forest, in Amazonas State, for the benefit of 17 traditional communities over a total area of 438,440 hectares.

Overall, the project has contributed to the development of five community forest management plans and the application of good forest management practices among 19 local communities, living in the Maués State Forest, in the Brazilian Amazon. The project has also strengthened community organizations and initiated community forest enterprises development.

The Committee also noted that the project’s technical reports and project photos have been posted on the ITTO website for widespread dissemination. They can be downloaded via the online project search engine on the ITTO website. Since the ITTO Secretariat has received the project completion report, several

technical reports, and financial audit report in accordance with the rules of ITTO, the Committee decided to consider the project PD 454/07 Rev.3 (F) as completed.

**4) PD 528/08 Rev.1 (F) Towards Sustainable Indigenous Mahogany Timber Production in Ghana: Phase II, Refining the Silvicultural "Tool Kit" and Practical Training for Industrial-Foresters and Community Farmers (Ghana)**

The Committee took note that implementation of this project had contributed to This project has contributed to refine the mahogany silvicultural "Tool Kit" in order to improve the ability to produce economically viable indigenous mahogany in mixed plantations and to share the knowledge with relevant stakeholders involved in the establishment of forest plantations in Ghana. For that purpose a practical manual titled "*How to Cultivate Indigenous Mahoganies in Plantations*" was prepared and disseminated by the Executing Agency. For information sharing, the Delegation of Côte d'Ivoire requested for the practical manual prepared by this project.

The Secretariat informed the Committee that the Completion Report, Consultant's Reports and the Final Financial Audit Report had been delivered by the Executing Agency in accordance with the Project Agreement. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project PD 528/08 Rev.1 (F) as completed.

**5) PD 530/08 Rev.3 (F) Phase II of ITTO Project [PD 30/97 Rev.6 (F)] Management of Forests Established through Rehabilitation of Degraded Forests by Local Communities in Ghana (Ghana)**

The Committee took note that implementation of this community forest related project had contributed to the main achievements summarized as follows:

- This project has contributed to develop adequate models and identify appropriate strategies and use them for the collaborative management of forests established by local communities through the rehabilitation of degraded forest lands, using the agroforestry modified taungya system (MTS). The aim was to enhance biodiversity conservation, while ensuring the provision of goods and services, in order to contribute to improving the livelihood of local communities.
- The motivation of local communities for their involvement in the project implementation for the rehabilitation of selected Forest Reserves in Ghana was sustained by the following incentives:
  - Temporary land access in Forest Reserves for rehabilitation activities in a country (Ghana) where access to land is not easy for poor farmers;
  - Food crops production for household consumption and contributing to the livelihood of local communities;
  - Benefit sharing agreement endorsed by Ghana Forestry Commission in order to ensure and formalize the current and future shares of tree ownership for local community members involved in the rehabilitation of selected Forest Reserves in Ghana.

The Secretariat informed the Committee that the Completion Report, Consultant's Report and the Final Financial Audit Report had been delivered by the Executing Agency in accordance with the Project Agreement. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project PD 530/08 Rev.3 (F) as completed.

**6) PD 617/11 Rev.4 (F) Promoting Biodiversity Conservation in Betung Kerihun National Park (BKNP) as the Trans-boundary Ecosystem between Indonesia and State of Sarawak Malaysia - Phase III (Indonesia)**

The Committee took note that this project has been implemented by the Betung Kerihun National Park (BKNP), Directorate General of Forest Protection and Nature Conservation, Ministry of Environment and Forestry of Indonesia since November 2013. The specific objective of the project was to strengthen sustainable conservation management of Betung Kerihun National Park (BKNP) as a transboundary ecosystem between West Kalimantan, Indonesia and Sarawak, Malaysia. The project's transboundary conservation cooperation has been focused with Lanjak Entimau Wildlife Sanctuary (LEWS) and Batang Ai National Park (BANP) in Sarawak which are adjacent to BKNP in West Kalimantan, Indonesia.

The Director of the Betung Kerihun National Park made a presentation, outlining the achievements of four outputs: Strengthened cooperation in the conservation of the trans-boundary ecosystems of BKNP in Indonesia and Batang Ai National Park (BANP) and LEWS in Sarawak State of Malaysia; enhanced management planning for biodiversity conservation at BKNP; improved sustainable livelihood of local

communities residing in BKNP buffer zones; and developed community-based forest conservation monitoring system. Among the Important lessons learned from the cooperation in TBCA management between Indonesia and Malaysia, he pointed out that operational planning for joint programs activities need to be developed well in advance and visit to project sites and on-site discussions proved effective for enriching practical knowledge and skills of the participants.

The Committee recognized the Project has made a significant contribution to the ITTO/CBD Collaborative Initiative for Tropical Forest Biodiversity through enhanced cooperation between Betung Kerihun National Park, West Kalimantan, Indonesia and Forest Department Sarawak (FDS), Malaysia in biodiversity conservation and improved sustainable livelihoods of local communities depending on BKNP.

The Delegation of Malaysia informed the Committee that after the ITTO Mission in Sarawak (1989-1990), the Sarawak Forest Department received ITTO support for the development of Lanjak Entimau Wildlife Sanctuary (LEWS) into a totally protected area for biodiversity conservation and started its transboundary biodiversity conservation area (TBCA) with the BKNP. With many achievements and lessons from the implementation of TBCA, in 2014 the Sarawak Forest Department submitted an application to UNESCO's World Heritage for the designation of TBCA between LEWS and BKNP as a World Heritage site. This application was not successful, but the Sarawak Forest Department is planning to resubmit its application. He expressed appreciation to the governments of Japan, Switzerland and the United States for financing TBCA projects in Sarawak.

The Delegation of the United States commended the transboundary biodiversity conservation cooperation between Indonesia and Malaysia, and effort of Sarawak Forest Department to register the transboundary biodiversity conservation areas in Sarawak as UNESCO's World Heritage site. She requested clarification on long-term vision and sustainability of the project. The Secretariat and Delegation of Indonesia replied that the BKNP is now in a good position to associate with the Heart of Borneo (HoB) Initiative and that the local government and NGOs including GIZ and WWF-Indonesia are an important partner to extend the outcomes of the project.

The Committee noted that the project's many technical reports and project photos have been posted on the ITTO website for widespread dissemination. They can be downloaded via the online project search engine on the ITTO website. The Committee was informed that the ITTO Secretariat has received the project completion report and financial audit report. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project PD 617/11 Rev.4 (F) as completed.

**7) PD 635/12 Rev.2 (F) Development of Guidelines for Buffer Zone Management for Pulong Tau National Park and Involvement of Local Communities in Management, Sarawak, Malaysia (Malaysia)**

The Committee took note that this project has been implemented by the Forest Department of Sarawak since August 2014 in order to secure the buffer zone's forest for use by indigenous communities and to strengthen the protection of Pulong Tau National Park.

The Project Team Leader, Dr. Paul Chai, made a presentation on the main achievements of the project. He highlighted the establishment of a 6,000-hectare buffer zone and its integrated management; securing its forest resource base to meet the needs of Penan communities; and providing the Penan communities with training to improve their livelihoods, with the active involvement of stakeholders. Regarding the lessons learned from the implementation of the project, he summarized the following:

- Threats to totally protected areas are real – counter with awareness and urgent action with fierce determination and commitment
- Buffer zones meet conservation and subsistence needs – relevant for Sarawak and others in similar situation
- Multi-stakeholder framework for biodiversity conservation and rural economic transformation is envisaged, with government, timber industry and communities playing key roles – initiated by EA and ITTO, but need clear policy direction and strategic plans
- New horizon - increasing community involvement in commercial forestry and NTFP, for manpower, cost effectiveness, knowledge on indigenous species
- NTFP provides new incentive for social forestry and opportunities to improve productivity at community level

The Committee recognized that the Project has made a significant contribution to the ITTO/CBD Collaborative Initiative for Tropical Forest Biodiversity through establishment of a buffer zone for PTNP, adoption of the concept of buffer zones across Sarawak National Parks, and constitution of communal forests within the buffer zone forest for local use. The Committee noted that the project's technical reports and project photos have been posted on the ITTO website for widespread dissemination. They can be downloaded via the online project search engine on the ITTO website. The Committee also noted that the ITTO Secretariat has received the project completion report, several technical reports, and financial audit report. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project PD 635/12 Rev.2 (F) as completed.

The Delegation of Malaysia expressed gratitude to the governments of Japan and Switzerland as well as Japan Lumber Importers Association and informed the Committee that the sustainability of the project will be enhanced through the social forestry initiative of the Sarawak Forest Department.

**8) PD 725/13 Rev.2 (F) Rehabilitation of Degraded Forest Land in the Ahua Forest Reserve by the Women Members of Association Malebi in Compensation for the Forest Resources Removed to Meet the Need for Fuel Wood (Charcoal and Fire Wood) (Côte d'Ivoire)**

The Committee took note that implementation of this project had contributed to implementing the gradual rehabilitation of the Ahua Forest Reserve with women members of the MALEBI Association, in order to compensate for the wood they removed and used to produce charcoal. With the implementation of this project the women members of the MALEBI Association shifted from the status of persons consuming raw wood for charcoal production to the status of persons contributing to raise the supply of forest resources through rehabilitation activities in the Ahua Forest Reserve. Madam Gnima Kissi, assistant project coordinator, made a presentation on the main achievements of this project which was followed by a short video. Key project achievements had been summarized in videos which can be accessed in the ITTO website through the following link: <https://www.youtube.com/user/ittosfm>

The Delegation of Côte d'Ivoire informed the Committee that the institutional partnership and technical collaboration with SODEFOR, as collaborating agency, contributed to the smooth implementation of this project and led to the abovementioned project achievements and results which led to the selection of the MALEBI Association for the implementation of the gender-related component of the 2018-2022 Forest Investment Programme (FIP) funded by the World Bank in Côte d'Ivoire.

The Secretariat informed the Committee that the Completion Report and the Final Financial Audit Report had been delivered by the Executing Agency in accordance with the Project Agreement. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project PD 725/13 Rev.2 (F) as completed.

**9.2 Completed Pre-project**

The Committee noted that there was no pre-project to be declared complete at this session.

**Item 10 - Ex-post Evaluation**

**(A) Ex-post Evaluation Reports**

The Committees was informed that the following five thematic groups and associated twelve projects were selected for ex-post evaluation by the CRF at its Forty-ninth Session in 2015:

**1) Thematic Group Evaluation: Forest Management / Inventory**

PD 142/02 Rev.2 (F)	Sustainable Production of National Forests under the "Regime of Forest Concessions" (Brazil)
PD 248/03 Rev.4 (F)	Antimary Forest Management Regional Training Centre (Brazil)
PD 438/06 Rev.2 (F)	Sustainable Forest Management for the Forest Production Area of the Northern and Northeastern Regions of the Department of Antioquia, Colombia

**2) Thematic Group Evaluation: Biodiversity Conservation / Conservation Areas**

- |                     |   |
|---------------------|---|
| PD 165/02 Rev.3 (F) | Conservation of Biological Diversity through Sustainable Forest Management Practices (Malaysia)                 |
| PD 288/04 Rev.2 (F) | Development of Lanjak Entimau Wildlife Sanctuary as a Totally Protected Area, Phase IV (Final Phase) (Malaysia) |
| PD 451/07 Rev.1 (F) | Transboundary Biodiversity Conservation Area: The Pulong Tau National Park, Sarawak State, Malaysia - Phase II  |

**3) Thematic Group Evaluation: Forest Rehabilitation / Landscape Restoration / Secondary Forest Management**

- |                     |   |
|---------------------|---|
| PD 372/05 Rev.1 (F) | Contribution to Forest Rehabilitation in Thailand's Areas Affected by Tsunami Disaster  |
| PD 501/08 Rev.1 (F) | Promoting Household Reforestation in Tropical Zone of Southwestern China through Development and Extension of Household-Oriented Techniques |

**4) Thematic Group Evaluation: Improvement and Conservation of Genetic Resources**

- |                     |   |
|---------------------|---|
| PD 54/00 Rev.4 (F)  | Genetic Resistance of Iroko to <i>Phytolyma lata</i> – Phase II (Côte d'Ivoire)                           |
| PD 377/05 Rev.3 (F) | Development of Cloning for Samba (Obéché), West African Mahogany and Tiokoué Tree Species (Côte d'Ivoire) |
| PD 419/06 Rev.3 (F) | Forest Seeds Management and Conservation (Côte d'Ivoire)  |

**5) Thematic Group Evaluation: Teak**

- |                     |  |
|---------------------|--|
| PD 270/04 Rev.2 (F) | Ex-situ and In-situ Conservation of Teak ( <i>Tectona grandis</i> L.F.) to Support Sustainable Forest Management (Myanmar) |
|---------------------|--|
- Ex-post evaluation of PD 270/04 Rev.2 (F)
  - Thematic assessment of all completed projects on Teak in cooperation with TEAKNET, IUFRO, FAO, and other relevant organizations/institutions.

**(B) Selection of Projects for Ex-post Evaluation**

The Secretariat recalled the Committee that the list of ex-post evaluations 2015-2016 was extended for the period of 2018-2019 because of the funding constraints resulting from the impairment of ITTO funds. However, there was a need to undertake the ex-post evaluations for two Thematic Groups which could contribute to the collaboration between ITTO and relevant international partners (such as CBD, IUFRO, IUCN, etc.) in 2019:

- Thematic Group Evaluation on Biodiversity Conservation / Conservation Areas;
- Thematic Group Evaluation on Forest Rehabilitation / Landscape Restoration / Secondary Forest Management.

For these two Thematic Groups, selected relevant projects completed in 2016, 2017 and 2018, have been added to the list of 2015-2016 for consideration regarding the ex-post evaluation in 2019, as the ex-post pooled funds will be made available from projects to be declared complete by the Council. The new shortlist of completed projects under these two Thematic Groups is attached as Annex A.

**Item 11 - Election of Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson for 2019**

Dr. Jobst-Michael Schroeder (Germany) was elected as Chairperson for 2019. Mr. Bruno Enrique Arias Rivas (Guatemala) was elected as Vice-Chairperson for 2019.

### **Item 12 - Dates and Venues of the Fifty-third and Fifty-fourth Sessions of the Committee**

The Fifty-third Session of the Committee would be held in conjunction with the Fifty-fifth Session of the International Tropical Timber Council to be convened in Lomé, Togo.

The Fifty-fourth Session of the Committee would be held in conjunction with the Fifty-sixth Session of the International Tropical Timber Council to be convened in Yokohama, Japan.

### **Item 13 - Other Business**

The Delegation of Benin noted that two projects became sunset because of being pending finance for more than 20 months and was wondering how to revive those projects in order to get them back in the ITTO project cycle. He also stated that projects should not continue be penalized by the financial impairment which has led to the freezing of project financing by donors. The Committee took note of the concern expressed by the Delegation of Benin.

### **Item 14 - Recommendations to the International Tropical Timber Council**

- (A) The Committee recommended that funding be made immediately available for the following projects and pre-project approved under the Project Cycle 2018:

#### **Projects**

PD 781/15 Rev.3 (F)	Master Plan for the Repositioning of Forest Management as A Competitive Land Use in the Agroforestry Landscape of the Northern Region of Costa Rica [ITTO Budget: US\$ 466,893]
PD 842/17 Rev.2 (F)	Exploring Innovative and Appropriate Tenure Conflicts Resolution Model on State Forest for Strengthening Forest Management Unit (Kesatuan Pengelolaan Hutan/KPH) in Implementing Sustainable Forest Management (Indonesia) [ITTO Budget: US\$ 825,138]
PD 849/17 Rev.2 (F)	Increasing Commercial Reforestation Competitiveness in Costa Rica [ITTO Budget: US\$ 346,133]
PD 868/18 Rev.1 (F)	Improving Local Governance for Landscape Restoration in the San Alejandro River Subwatershed, Padre Abad Province, Department of Ucayali, Peru [ITTO Budget: US\$ 380,000]
PD 873/18 Rev.1 (F)	Integrated Management of Natural Resources and Biodiversity in the Tacaná Volcano and its Area of Influence in Mexico and Guatemala – Phase II [ITTO Budget: US\$ 940,248]
PD 881/18 Rev.1 (F)	Gender Mainstreaming in the Development of Actions to Control Deforestation and Forest Degradation in the Congo Basin (Cameroon) [ITTO Budget: US\$ 846,326]
PD 884/18 Rev.1 (F)	Pilot Sustainable Management Systems for Secondary Natural Forests in the Collective Afro-descendant Community Territory of the Bajo Calima Community Council, Municipality of Buenaventura, Colombia [ITTO Budget: US\$ 580,235]
PD 887/18 Rev.1 (F)	Production and Availability of Teak Clone Varieties: Development of Improved Plant Material for Reforestation in Togo [ITTO: US\$ 636,753]
PD 888/18 Rev.1 (F)	Enhancement of the Participatory Bushfire Prevention and Management System in Togo [ITTO Budget: US\$ 677,846.53]
PD 891/18 Rev.1 (F)	Bamboo for Life: An Alternative for the Rehabilitation of Degraded Forest Lands and Sustainable Rural Development in the San Martin Region, Peru [ITTO Budget: US\$ 397,020]

**Pre-projects**

PPD 191/18 Rev.1 (F) Support to the Local Communities of the Mono Plain for the Promotion and Sustainable Management of Community Forests in Togo  
[ITTO Budget: US\$ 71,211]

PPD 192/18 Rev.1 (F) Formulation of A Project Proposal on “Strengthening Forest Research to Improve the Efficient Use of Timber and The Conservation and Sustainable Development of Forests in Guatemala”  
[ITTO Budget: US\$ 99,913]

- (B) The Committee recommended that the 2016 Guidelines for Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts Assessment (ESIA) in ITTO Projects be refined to address the practical implementation problems requiring a high cost and long consultation process when a proposal proponent undertakes ESIA. It also recommended that the Expert Panel for Technical Appraisal of Proposals at its next meeting should review the issue of ESIA with more inputs from countries. The Committee further recommended that the refined version of the 2016 Guidelines for ESIA, with track changes, be made available to member countries for their inputs. The track changed version of the refined version, incorporating member countries inputs, will be made available in advance to facilitate its review at the next session of the Committee.

**Item 15 - Report of the Session**

The Committee accepted this Report for submission to the Council. The members of the Committee expressed their appreciation for the able manner in which the Chairperson conducted the session of the Committee with assistance of the Secretariat.

**APPENDIX A**  
**Shortlist of Completed Projects in the Field of Reforestation and Forest Management Considered Relevant for Ex-post Evaluation**

Project No.	Title	Country	Executing Agency	ITTO Budget (USD)	Actual Starting Date	Completion Document
<b>B) Biodiversity Conservation / Conservation Areas</b>						
PD165/02 Rev.3 (F)	CONSERVATION OF BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY THROUGH SUSTAINABLE FOREST MANAGEMENT PRACTICES	MALAYSIA	FRIM - FOREST RESEARCH INSTITUTE MALAYSIA	\$526,401	17-May-06	CRF(XLVI)/2 2012
PD288/04 Rev. 2 (F)	DEVELOPMENT OF LANJAK ENTIMAU WILDLIFE SANCTUARY AS A TOTALLY PROTECTED AREA, PHASE IV (FINAL PHASE)	MALAYSIA	FOREST DEPARTMENT OF SARAWAK (SFD)	\$568,728	9-Apr-07	CRF(XLVI)/2 2012
PD451/07 Rev.1 (F)	TRANSBOUNDARY BIODIVERSITY CONSERVATION AREA: The PULONG TAU NATIONAL PARK, SARAWAK STATE, PHASE II	MALAYSIA	FOREST DEPARTMENT OF SARAWAK (SFD)	\$950,800	22-Jan-08	CRF(XLVI)/2 2012
PD577/10 Rev.1 (F)	MANAGEMENT OF THE EMERALD TRIANGLE PROTECTED FORESTS COMPLEX TO PROMOTE COOPERATION FOR TRANSBOUNDARY BIODIVERSITY CONSERVATION BETWEEN THAILAND, CAMBODIA AND LAOS - PHASE III	THAILAND, CAMBODIA & LAOS	FORESTRY ADMINISTRATON, CAMBODIA IN COLLABORATION WITH ROYAL FORESTRY DEPARTMENT (RFD), THAILAND	\$2,051,039	31-Jul-12	CRF(L)/2 2016
PD617/11 Rev.4 (F)	PROMOTING BIODIVERSITY CONSERVATION IN BETUNG KERIHUN NATIONAL PARK (BKNP) AS THE TRANS-BOUNDARY ECOSYSTEM BETWEEN INDONESIA AND STATE OF SARAWAK MALAYSIA - PHASE III (INDONESIA)	INDONESIA	BETUNG KERIHUN NATIONAL (BKNP), DIRECTORATE GENERAL OF FOREST PROTECTION AND NATURE CONSERVATION (PHKA), MINISTRY OF FORESTRY (MOF)	\$941,559	5-Nov-13	CRF(LII)/3 2018
PD668/12 Rev.1 (F)	INTEGRATED MANAGEMENT OF NATURAL RESOURCES AND BIODIVERSITY IN THE TACANÁ VOLCANO AND ITS RANGE OF INFLUENCE IN MEXICO AND GUATEMALA	GUATEMALA & MEXICO	HELVETAS SWISS INTERCOOPERATION	\$641,639	16-Jun-14	CRF(LII)/2 2018
<b>F) Forest Rehabilitation / Landscape Restoration / Secondary Forest Management</b>						
PD062/99 Rev.3 (F)	REFORESTATION PILOT PROJECT FOR THE RECOVERY OF DEGRADED AREAS IN THE MEDIUM DOCE RIVER REGION, STATE OF MINAS GERAIS, BRAZIL	BRAZIL	IEF/MG - INSTITUTO FORESTAL ESTATAL DE MINAS GERAIS	\$543,892	15-Sep-04	CRF(XLIX)/2 2015
PD372/05 Rev.1 (F)	CONTRIBUTION TO FOREST REHABILITATION IN THAILAND'S AREAS AFFECTED BY THE TUSNAMI DISASTER	THAILAND	THAILAND ENVIRONMENTAL INSTITUTE	\$790,020	11-Jul-08	CRF(XLVIII)/2 2014
PD419/06 Rev.3 (F)-Ext-TICAD5-Rev.1	FOREST SEEDS MANAGEMENT AND CONSERVATION; PROJECT FOR REHABILITATION AND RESTORATION OF DEGRADED FORESTS IN CÔTE D'IVOIRE WITH THE INVOLVEMENT OF LOCAL COMMUNITIES (REFUGEES, INTERNALLY DISPLACED PEOPLE AND LOCAL POPULATIONS) (CÔTE D'IVOIRE)	COTE D'IVOIRE	SODEFOR - SOCIETE DE DEVELOPPEMENT DES FORETS	\$1,800,000	16-Oct-13	CRF(LII)/3 2018
PD501/08 Rev.1 (F)	PROMOTING HOUSEHOLD REFORESTATION IN TROPICAL ZONE OF SOUTHWESTERN CHINA THROUGH DEVELOPMENT AND EXTENSION OF HOUSEHOLD-ORIENTED TECHNIQUES	CHINA	YUNNAN ACADEMY OF FORESTRY (YAF)	\$353,435	10-Mar-10	CRF(XLVIII)/2 2014
PD530/08 Rev.3 (F)	PHASE II OF ITTO PROJECT [PD 30/97 REV.6 (F)] MANAGEMENT OF FORESTS ESTABLISHED THROUGH REHABILITATION OF DEGRADED FORESTS BY LOCAL COMMUNITIES IN GHANA (GHANA)	GHANA	FORIG - FORESTRY RESEARCH INSTITUTE OF GHANA	\$569,665	08-Mar-12	CRF(LII)/3 2018
PD583/10 Rev.1 (F)	RESTORING SUB-HUMID ECOSYSTEMS IN SOUTHERN PERU THROUGH REFORESTATION WITH <i>Caesalpinia spinosa</i>	PERU	APAIC – ASOCIACION PRO DESARROLLO AGROINDUSTRIAL DE CAMANA	\$149,796	4-Oct-11	CRF(XLVII)/2 2013