



**INTERNATIONAL TROPICAL
TIMBER COUNCIL**
**COMMITTEE ON
REFORESTATION AND FOREST MANAGEMENT**

Distr.
GENERAL
CRF(XLIX)/6
2 October 2015
ENGLISH ONLY

FORTY-NINTH SESSION
16-21 November 2015
Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

**EX-POST EVALUATION REPORT ON
ITTO COMPLETED PROJECT PD 493/07 Rev.1 (F)**

**STRENGTHENING CAPACITY OF FOREST LAW
ENFORCEMENT AND GOVERNANCE IN CAMBODIA**

Prepared for ITTO

By

THANG Hooi Chiew

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Acknowledgements	ii
List of Annexes	iii
Acronyms and Abbreviations	iv
Executive Summary	1
1.0 Introduction	5
(a) Background	5
(b) Project Context	5
2.0 Evaluation Scope, Focus and Approach	6
3.0 Project Facts	7
4.0 Findings and Lessons Learnt	8
(a) Findings	8
<i>Achievements of the Project</i>	8
<i>Outputs and Impacts</i>	8
<i>Sustainability</i>	15
<i>Project formulation and implementation</i>	16
<i>Identification and project design</i>	16
<i>Efficiency and effectiveness of project implementation</i>	17
(b) Lessons Learnt	18
5.0 Conclusions and Recommendations	20
(a) Conclusions	20
(b) Recommendations	21

Acknowledgements

I wish to extend my sincere gratitude to Dr. Emmanuel Ze Meka, Executive Director of ITTO, for assigning me to conduct an ex-post evaluate of this project; and my deepest appreciation to Dr. Ma Hwan-ok, Projects Manager, Division of Forest Management, and Ms. Elsie Yang Ling Yun for their effective coordination and facilitation in making the necessary administrative arrangements that made it possible to successfully accomplish the task.

I am especially indebted to Mr. Eang Savet, the Project Coordinator and Director of the Mekong FA Inspectorate, who facilitated my itinerary, shared information and organized meetings with personnel involved in the project, including meetings with local communities, as well as accompanied me in the field. This had enabled me to gain further insights into the implementation and accomplishments of the project.

I am sincerely thankful to H.E. Dr. Chea Sam Ang, Deputy Director General of the FA, Cambodia, for ably chairing the meeting which, among others, deliberated on the key findings, lessons learnt, and recommendations of the ex-post evaluation, and to all those in attendance who had enriched the meeting with their pertinent inputs.

To H.E. Dr. Cheng Kimsun, Chief of FA, Cambodia, for receiving me in his office to discuss and exchange views on the achievements of the project and the steps taken to sustain and expand the critical activities that were initiated under the project to further control and suppress illegal forest activities in Cambodia.

To all the individuals who had participated in the series of meetings held in the Kratie and Kampong Thom provinces, I would wish to express my most sincere thanks.

List of Annexes

	Page
Annex 1 Terms of Reference: Ex-Post Evaluation of ITTO Project on Forest Governance	23
Annex 2 Program: Ex-post Evaluation of ITTO Project PD 493/07 Rev.1 (F), Phnom Penh, Cambodia, 8 - 18 June 2015	30
Annex 3 List of Personnel Interviewed: Ex-post Evaluation of ITTO Project PD493/07 Rev.1 (F), Phnom Penh, 9 June 2015	31
Annex 4 Field Visit Program: 11-13 June 2015	32
Annex 5 List of Documents Reviewed	33
Annex 6 List of Participants: Ex-post Evaluation of the ITTO Project PD493/07 Rev.1 (F), Phnom Penh, 17 June 2015	34
Annex 7 Logical Framework Matrix	35
Annex 8 Country Management Response to ITTO Ex-Post Evaluation	36

Acronyms and Abbreviations

CF	Community Forestry
CI	Conservation International
CITES	Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora
CTS	Case Tracking System
DANIDA	Danish International Development Agency
FA	Forestry Administration of Cambodia
FLEG	Forest Law Enforcement and Governance
GoC	Government of Cambodia
GPS	Global Positioning System
ha	Hectare
ITTA	International Tropical Timber Agreement
ITTC	International Tropical Timber Council
ITTO	International Tropical Timber Organization
JICA	Japan International Cooperation Agency
m³	cubic meter
NGO	Non-governmental Organizations
PD	Project Development
PPD	Pre-project Development
PSC	Project Steering Committee
RECOFT	Regional Community Forestry Training Center for Asia and the Pacific
REDD+	Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation, Conservation of Forest Carbon Stocks, Sustainable Management of Forest, and Enhancement of Forest Carbon Stocks
SOP	Standard Operating Procedures
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WCS	Wildlife Conservation Society
WWF	World Wide Fund for Nature
%	percent

Executive Summary

Introduction

1. The project was approved at the ITTC Ghana Meeting in June 2008, Accra, Ghana. It was executed by the FA in collaboration with the FA Cantonments, local governments and judicial courts in the four provinces of Kratie, Kampong Thom, Pursat and Preah Sihanouk. The total budget for the project was US\$ 684,362.00 with contribution from ITTO amounting to US\$ 561,195.00, and that from the Government of Cambodia amounting to US\$ 123,167.00.

2. The project was implemented over 42 months from January 2009 till June 2012, including a six-month no-cost extension approved by ITTO for it to complete execution of project activities and in achieving its planned objectives.

Evaluation Scope, Focus and Approach

3. The ex-post evaluation was conducted 36 months after project completion in June 2015 and in accordance with the terms of reference. It included review of project-related documents and materials, a mission to Cambodia to discuss with FA officials, other project stakeholders and target beneficiaries in groups or individually.

Project Facts

4. The project was a follow-up to the pre-project PPD 128/06 Rev.1 (F) which was implemented from July to November 2007 which identified that the main causes of forest cover loss in Cambodia were mainly due to forest land clearing and land encroachment for agriculture purposes; illegal logging; improper management of concession areas, protected areas and non-concession areas; limited reforestation activities; population pressure and poverty.

5. As such, the main problem addressed by the project was weak capacity of the FA in FLEG implementation, including lack of tools and facilities, insufficient FLE trained staff, insufficient monitoring, ineffective judicial procedures and limited rural participation.

6. The two specific objectives of the project were to strengthen capacities for FELG and to develop tools to enable effective suppression of illegal forest activities. This would contribute to the development objective of the project in combating illegal forestry activities and in enhancing sustainable forest management in Cambodia.

7. A total of 17 activities were implemented to achieve the five planned outputs, namely, (i) appropriate facilities in place; (ii) forest law enforcement training implemented; (iii) effective monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices; (iv) effective judicial processing; and (v) effective extension function.

Findings

8. The equipment and facilities procured to enforce forest laws had been installed in the FA offices in the four provinces. They were well kept and maintained and had enabled the FA Cantonments to monitor illegal forest activities and document forest crimes in a more effective manner compared to the pre-project situation.

9. The four developed training modules on FLEG were successfully used to train 545 FA staff at the Inspectorate, Cantonment, Division and Triage levels against a target of 773 local staff as proposed in a study undertaken by the project. In addition, 20 senior staff at the Central FA, and the FA Inspectorates and Cantonments were trained as trainers as was planned under the project. Fifteen Chiefs of the FA Cantonments and the Project Coordinator had also gained experience in FLEG problem solving through their attendance of relevant international workshops.

10. A total of 1,500 copies of the technical guideline on forest patrolling and 775 copies of the pocket guide on monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices, both developed by the project, as well as the technical manual on the operation of the updated CTS were disseminated and used to train the FA staff in the four provinces. This had improved their capacity and enhanced their technical knowledge to conduct forest law enforcement more effectively.

11. An estimated 24,615 ha of forest land that were illegally occupied had been put back as permanent forests through proclamation by Provincial Governors and are now ready for rehabilitation and reforestation work. In this context, a total of 5,698 ha of such forest land in the Kampong Thom province was proclaimed by the Provincial Governor during the period 2009 to 2011.

12. The CTS was installed in 15 computers in the four provinces of the project sites. In this regard, 1,729 forest crime cases had been recorded in the system for the period January 2009 to December 2011 for the four provinces under the project as compared to a total of 4,148 cases recorded over the same period for the whole country. Although the number of forest crime cases recorded in the CTS for the provinces of Kratie and Kampong Thom for the period 2012-2014 had increased as compared to during project implementation, the volume of timber products seized in both the provinces had recorded a decrease.

13. The decreasing trend in the quantity of illegal forest products seized after project completion by the FA Cantonments reflects the enhanced capacity of FA in monitoring and enforcing forest laws and regulations.

14. A total of 3,000 copies of the 2010 forest cover map of Cambodia were produced using satellite imageries with field verification which had contributed significantly to the development of practical forest monitoring plans.

15. Through four coordination meetings between the FA Cantonments and the Royal Prosecutors and Judges of the four provinces involving 114 personnel, a total of 539 cases at the project sites was resolved and closed. In addition, a total of 1,001 forest crime cases that occurred during 2010-2011 were reviewed with recommendations made by the national legal consultant recruited by the project for the consideration of the FA Cantonments for follow-up actions.

16. Twelve extension workshops on forest laws and regulations were conducted in eight districts in the four provinces where 1,227 participants were involved. These workshops had greatly raised the awareness and increased the knowledge of the general public, and especially the local community on the need to curb illegal forest activities as a secured forest resource base would contribute to improving their livelihoods and welfare.

17. A project website at <http://www.twgfr.org/itto> was also developed to disseminate and provide public access to the publications produced under project. The website is linked with the website of the Technical Working Group on Forestry Reform (TWG-FR) for information sharing.

18. The implementation of the planned activities of the project was adequately monitored and external risk to project achievements had been mitigated through frequent consultative meetings which had also enhanced collaboration between the authorities involved in FLEG initiatives and reduced sectoral bias and prejudice.

19. All the planned activities were successfully implemented and there were no major deviations among them. As such, the two specific objectives had been achieved which had contributed to realizing the development objective of the project.

Sustainability

20. An exit strategy was developed by the FA where critical activities initiated and/or implemented by the project were identified for their continuation under the Program 3 - Forest Law Enforcement and Forest Governance (FLEG) of the Cambodian National Forest Program, 2010-2029.

21. A number of the purchases, such as the 4WD vehicle, desktop computers and printers, and digital voice recorder, are being used by the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled "Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia".

22. A total of 21 staff from the Central FA has been assigned to maintain and update the CTS, monitor forest cover and produce updated forest maps, and coordinate forestry extension work with the FA Cantonments.

Lessons Learnt

23. The early involvement of the primary stakeholders in problem identification and project development process had enabled the project to be implemented without any major adjustments or revision. Furthermore, regular and frequent monitoring and evaluation of progress in individual activities implementation had enabled timely intervention to be taken to overcome them.
24. The guidelines for forest patrolling and suppressing forest crime would need to be fully field-tested in different environments to enable them to be used effectively in the other provinces in Cambodia; while the pocket guide on monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices and the four training modules would also need to be reviewed periodically to reflect new legislation and regulations, and new tools and techniques for forest crimes suppression, respectively.
25. Notwithstanding the above, the four training modules would need to fully address good forest governance as it is fundamental for achieving positive and sustainable development outcomes of the forestry sector, such as efficiency in resource management, increase contribution to socio-economic development and environmental services, and the equitable distribution of benefits derived from forests.
26. As the coordination meetings between the FA Cantonments and the Royal Prosecutors and Judges had been effective in resolving forest crimes cases, it would be pertinent that these meetings be continued and the establishment of permanent joint coordination mechanisms should be considered.
27. Legal assistance should continue to be given to the FA Cantonments as it had been shown to be very useful and effective for the FA Cantonments to undertake follow-up action with the courts on forests crime cases.
28. To gain further support from the local communities to assist the FA to curb illegal forest activities and to contribute in enhancing sustainable forest management, appropriate incentive schemes should be developed for them.

Conclusions

29. The project identification process was adequate. The key problems to be addressed were identified and thoroughly analyzed with the active participation of the main stakeholders.
30. Design of the project was sound because it was developed in accordance with clearly defined cause-effect relationships. Consequently, project interventions were consistent with the direct and indirect causes of the key problems.
31. All the 17 planned activities had been executed successfully with the approved budget and without any need for revision during project implementation. The five envisaged outputs had been achieved as well as the two specific objectives which had contributed to the realization of the development objective of the project.
32. Results of the project had been disseminated through national workshops and meetings of the PSC, including distribution of technical reports to relevant stakeholders nationwide, as well as through the project website.
33. At project completion, the needed equipment and facilities for effective conduct of forest patrolling had, to a greater extent made available; capacity of the FA staff at different levels to conduct forest patrolling and to properly document forest crimes had been significantly improved; and awareness and understanding on the vital role of FLEG initiatives in sustainable forest management had been considerably raised in the four provinces of the country. Collaboration between the FA Cantonments and the provincial prosecutors and judges had also been strengthened, while forestry extension programs had significantly improved.
34. The sustainability of the project was assured as the FA had formulated a follow-up strategy to continuously implement critical activities on FLEG under the “Forest Law Enforcement and Governance” program of the National Forest Program, 2010-2029, including the assignment of personnel to undertake the tasks. In addition, ownership is high as the activities are embedded in existing institutional structures of the FA.

Recommendations

For the Executing Agency/ Forestry Administration

35. It is recommended that the Forestry Administration/Executing Agency may wish to consider the following:

- (i) Revise and update the four training modules periodically to reflect new tools and techniques in forest crimes investigation, intelligence and evidence gathering, etc.
- (ii) Initiate actions to install the CTS, including appropriate equipment and trained FA staff, in the other provinces of Cambodia, taking cognizance of the further work on the system by the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled "Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia".
- (iii) Provide additional training of trainers on the Criminal Code Procedure so as to enable the FA staff to have the knowledge and skills for processing forest crime cases; and in the short term, engage a national legal consultant to advise the FA on outstanding forest crime cases for follow-up actions.
- (iv) Establish permanent joint coordination mechanisms between the FA Cantonments and the Royal Prosecutors and Judges to resolve forest crimes cases that were submitted to the courts by the FA Cantonments.
- (v) Develop incentive schemes for local communities to further gain their support to assist the FA in curbing illegal forest activities and to contribute to enhancing sustainable forest management, taking cognizance of the further work on improving their livelihoods and welfare by the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled "Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia".
- (vi) Address more explicitly forest governance on the ways and manner by which officials and institutions acquire and exercise authority in the management of forest resources, which encompasses policies, institutions and processes.

For ITTO

36. In implementing similar FLEG projects, ITTO may wish to take cognizance of the following:

- (vii) It is pertinent that main stakeholders be involved in the identification and analysis of problems to be addressed, and in designing project intervention to ensure buy-in and ownership by the main stakeholders.
- (viii) Progress in implementation of individual activities, especially field activities, must be continuously monitored and evaluated to ensure that they yield the desired outputs to achieve the specific and development objectives of the project, as well as to enable timely remedial actions be taken to correct any deviations.
- (ix) A well dedicated project management team has to be established, while inputs in terms of funds and personnel must be made available when required. The established PSC has to be able to provide fruitful advices to the project management team.
- (x) To further strengthen the project management team, a Project Technical Committee should be established to meet at least quarterly to provide technical inputs to the project and advise the PSC.

37. ITTO should also consider supporting the Executing Agency to replicate the excellent results produced under the project to the other provinces, especially the forest-rich provinces that face serious threat to the security of their forest resources.

1.0 **Introduction**

(a) **Background**

1.1 The project was approved at the ITTC Ghana Meeting in June 2008, Accra, Ghana. The agreement regulating the implementation of the project was signed on 6 October 2008 with the first disbursement of funds made on 29 December 2008. Duration for project implementation was planned for 36 months and a 6-month no-cost extension was approved by ITTO to enhance the quality of technical reports resulting from the implementation of the project.

1.2 The primary purpose of the ex-post evaluation is to provide a concise diagnosis of the project related to forest law enforcement and governance in sustainable forest management in Cambodia, to ascertain the successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for successes and failures, and the contribution of the project towards the ITTO's Objective 2000 and the ITTO Action Plans, as well as to draw recommendations and lessons that could be used to improve current similar projects and future projects development.

1.3 The general information about the project that is being evaluated is as follows:

- (i) Project Title: Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia
- (ii) Project Number: PD 493/07 Rev.1 (F)
- (iii) Executive Agency: Forestry Administration of Cambodia
- (iv) Duration of Project: Planned 36 months with a 6 months no-cost extension, starting from January 2009 till June 2012
- (v) Project Costs: US\$ 684,362.00 of which ITTO grant amounting to US\$ 561,195.00 while that from the Government of Cambodia contribution was at US\$ 123,167.00
- (vi) Target Areas: Kratie, Kampong Thom, Pursat and Preah Sihanouk provinces

(b) **Project Context**

1.4 The project aimed to enable the Forestry Administration of Cambodia (FA) to conduct its law enforcement operations in the forestry sector to reduce unlawful forest land clearing and land encroachment, illegal logging and improper forest management practices. Towards this end, the project would acquire appropriate equipment, develop tools and procedures to effectively prevent, detect and suppress illegal activities in the forestry sector, and in conducting training on FLEG and legal procedures for forest crimes investigation and prosecution.

1.5 The objectives of project are consistent with the ITTA 1994, ITTO Action Plans and the ITTA 2006 as outline below.

(i) *ITTA 1994*

- Objective (c): to contribute to the process of sustainable development; and
- Objective (d): to enhance the capacity of members to implement a strategy for achieving exports of tropical timber and timber products from sustainably managed sources by the year 2000.

(ii) *ITTO Yokohama Action Plan, 2002-2006*

- under Goal 1: "Support activities to secure the tropical timber resource base" of the "Reforestation and Forest Management", Action 1 - "Support the effective enforcement of forest laws and regulations that ensure sustainable forest management and secure the production base"; and

- under Action 7 where it “encourage members and assist them” to “secure the forest resource base through the implementation of forest policy, legislation and associated strategies, revised and updated where appropriate”, “identify and prevent irregular forestry activities”, and “identify shortcomings in enforcement of forest laws and regulations, and overcome them”.

(iii) *ITTO Action Plan, 2008-2011*

- under expected outcome 4: Increased supplies of tropical timber from sustainably managed and legally harvested sources (by ITTO), Action A - “Support the effective enforcement of forest laws and regulations and the development and application of good forest-sector governance, and facilitate the exchange of experiences among members”, and for members to “Improve forest law enforcement and governance and address illegal activities in the forest sector”; and
- under expected outcome 5: Tropical forest resource better secured (by ITTO), Action A - “Support studies and the exchange of lessons learned on the impacts on and implications for the PFE of forest law enforcement and improved forest governance”, and for members to “Develop and implement effective mechanisms and relevant policy and legislative frameworks to secure and/or expand the PFE through, for example, land-use planning, tenure reform and market instruments”.

(iv) *ITTA 2006*

- Objective (c): contributing to sustainable development and to poverty alleviation;
- Objective (d): enhancing the capacity of members to implement strategies for achieving exports of tropical timber and timber products from sustainably managed sources; and
- Objective (n): strengthening the capacity of members to improve forest law enforcement and governance, and address illegal logging and related trade in tropical timber.

1.6 The project would enhance the capacities of members of ITTO to progress towards achieving sustainable management of tropical forests and ensure that trade in tropical timber are sourced from sustainably managed forests in accordance with the *ITTO Year 2000 Objective*.

2.0 Evaluation Scope, Focus and Approach

2.1 The focus of the ex-post evaluation was guided by the evaluation framework described in the *Manual for Project Monitoring, Review, Reporting and Evaluation* (ITTO 2009) which defines an *Ex-post Evaluation* to be a systematic and objective collection of information, on the spot assessment and analysis of the validity, design, appropriateness, performance and the impact of the project after its completion, with the intent to establish the extent to which it achieved its objective, its degree of effectiveness and efficiency, as well as its sustainability. The purpose is to learn lessons and to draw conclusions for future projects.

2.2 The terms of reference for this ex-post evaluation are as in **Annex 1**. Among the pertinent aspects to be assessed were:

- the overall role and contribution of the project in light of sectoral policies, development programs, priorities and requirements to Forest Law Enforcement and Governance (FLEG) in Cambodia;
- the current status of strengthening capacity of FLEG within the project's area of influence, the effectiveness of the project's implementation and its effectiveness in promoting forest conservation and sustainable management practices;
- the contributions of the specific studies in various forestry-related disciplines prepared by the project as regards the achievement of FLEG in the project's area of influence;

- (iv) the results and impacts of activities conducted by the project and its contribution to the overall capacity of target groups in Cambodia regarding FLEG;
- (v) the overall post-project situation in the project's area of influence, and follow-up actions in order to enhance uptake of project results; and
- (vi) the project's relative success or failure, including a summary of the key lessons learnt; and the identification of any issues or problems that should be taken into account in designing and implementing similar projects in the future.

2.3 The ex-post evaluation was carried out 36 months after the project was completed in June 2012. The approach adopted in undertaking the ex-post evaluation included desk review of project-related documents and materials provided by ITTO prior to the mission to Cambodia; a mission to Cambodia from 8-18 June 2015 as in **Annex 2** for a further desk review of project materials provided by the project management team, held meetings and discussion with officials of the FA, especially national consultants who were recruited by the project during its implementation as in **Annex 3**; and a field visit to the project's sites in the Kratie and Kampong Thom provinces, as well as holding discussions with project stakeholders and target beneficiaries in groups or individually in the Kratie and Kampong Thom provinces, as in **Annex 4**. A list of documents reviewed is as in **Annex 5**.

2.4 At the end of the mission a presentation was made on 17 June 2015 in Phnom Penh to the representatives of the FA on the key findings and proposed recommendations of the ex-post evaluation and to solicit their feedbacks. The meeting, chaired by the Deputy Director General of the FA, H.E. Dr. Chea Sam Ang, was attended by 22 officials from the Central FA and those from the FA Cantonments of the four provinces, as in **Annex 6**.

3.0 Project Facts

3.1 The project "Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia" was a follow-up project to the pre-project PPD 128/06 Rev.1 (F) with the same title which was implemented from July to November 2007.

3.2 Under the pre-project two surveys were conducted. In the first survey, 570 rural residents were asked on the state of the forest in their locality and to identify the most significant problems that should be addressed in any future project. In the second survey, 226 FA staff members were asked to advise on any capacity limitations which constraint or act as impediments for them to suppress forest crimes. Results of the survey disclosed that 96% of the respondents indicated the "lack of facilities for forest law enforcement", while 98% of them also expressed the need for improved capacity through comprehensive training.

3.3 Two one-day national workshops were also conducted under the pre-project to elaborate in details and finalize a proposed National Forest Law Enforcement and Governance (FLEG) Action Plan, as well as elements to develop a full project proposal for implementing the National FLEG Action Plan. The first national workshop, attended by 47 participants, including FA staff, representatives from the ITTO, DANIDA, World Bank, JICA, WWF, Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS) and Conservation International (CI), was held in Phnom Penh on 12 September 2007; while the second workshop, attended by 60 participants, including FA staff, representatives from ITTO, DANIDA, World Bank, JICA, USAID, WCS, RECOFT, WildAid and CI, was also held in Phnom Penh on 2 November 2007.

3.4 The pre-project, among others, identified that the main causes of loss of forest cover which was estimated at slightly more than 2.0 million ha between 1965 and 2006 in Cambodia were mainly due to forest land clearing and land encroachment for agriculture purposes; illegal logging; improper management of concession areas, protected areas and non-concession areas; limited reforestation activities; population pressure and poverty.

3.5 For the period between 2006 and 2010, forest cover loss in Cambodia had declined to 366,993 ha which occurred mainly in the north-western part of the country in the provinces of Battambong, Oddar Meanchey, Siem Reap and Banteay Meanchey, as well as in the north-eastern part of the country in the provinces of Ratanakiri, Seng Treng, Kratie, Kampong Thom and Preh Vihear.

3.6 Through further discussion and brain-storming with the stakeholders it was concluded that the key problems to be addressed by the project should be “weak capacity in forest law enforcement and governance, and lack of tools and facilities to suppress illegal forest activities”.

3.7 Hence, the development objective of the project was to contribute to implementation of the government policy platform in combating illegal logging, forest land clearing and land encroachment in order to manage and use the forest resources in a sustainable manner.

3.8 Two specific objectives of the project were also formulated. The first specific objective was to strengthen capacities for forest law enforcement and governance, while the second specific objective was to develop tools to enable effective suppression of illegal forest activities. In this regard, a total of 17 activities was carried out to achieve the five outputs planned under the two specific objectives.

3.9 The project was executed by the FA in collaboration with the FA Cantonments in the four provinces, namely, Kratie, Kampong Thom, Pursat and Preah Sihanouk. The total budget for the project was US\$ 684,362.00 with contributions from the Governments of Japan, U.S.A., Australia and the Republic of Korea of US\$ 391,195.00, US\$ 125,000.00, US\$ 35,000.00 and US\$ 10,000.00 respectively through ITTO amounting to a total of US\$ 561,195.00; and the Government of Cambodia (GoC) contribution amounting to US\$ US\$ 123,167.00. The duration for project implementation was initially planned for 36 months, and a six-month extension without additional funding was granted by ITTO in order to ensure complete execution of project activities and in achieving its planned objectives. Thus, the project was implemented from January 2009 to June 2012, a total of 42 months.

3.10 No mid-term evaluation was carried out during the duration of the project of 36 months, as well as during the 6 months extension. Progress reports were submitted to the ITTO secretariat on a regular basis.

4.0 **Findings and Lessons Learnt**

(a) **Findings**

Achievements of the Project

Outputs and Impacts

4.1 The main problem addressed by the project was weak capacity of the FA in FLEG implementation. Based on information collected from the two surveys and the two one-day national workshops organized by the pre-project, as well as a detailed analysis of the main causes of the problem which were lack of facilities, insufficient FLE trained staff, insufficient monitoring, ineffective judicial procedures and limited rural participation, five outputs were identified under the two specific objectives of the project. The five outputs would be achieved through the execution of 17 activities.

4.2 To realize the first specific objective, a total of seven activities was carried out to achieve the two outputs, namely:

- (i) Output 1.1- appropriate facilities in place (available) through two activities involving the purchase and installation of required equipment; and
- (ii) Output 1.2- forest law enforcement training implemented through five activities involving the development of training programs, and training of trainers and staff of the FA.

4.3 In the case of the second specific objective, a total of ten activities was implemented to achieve the three outputs, namely:

- (i) Output 2.1- effective monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices through five activities involving the development of patrolling procedures and pocket guides on monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices, and in updating and maintaining the Case Tracking System (CTS);
- (ii) Output 2.2- effective judicial processing through three activities involving coordination meetings with the Royal Prosecutor and training of the FA staff on legal procedures; and

- (iii) Output 2.3- effective extension function through two activities involving the provision of extension services to relevant stakeholders, and extension materials.
- 4.4 Under Output 1.1, equipment purchased included 4WD vehicle, motorcycles, desktop computers, notebooks, printers, photocopier, GPS, cameras and video camera, voice recorder, desks and chairs, cabinets, LCD and wall screen projectors, fax-phone machine, connector network, memories stick and flash drives, dry cell batteries, satellite imageries, and solar panels. A comparison of the planned purchase and the actual purchase which were endorsed by the Project Steering Committee (PSC) is as shown in Table 1.

Table 1: Comparison between Planned and Actual Purchased of Equipment

No.	Item	Planned Purchase	Actual Purchase
1.	Vehicle 4WD	1	1
2.	Motorcycle	2	4
3.	Desktop computer	16	21
4.	Notebook	2	2
5.	Printer	2	14
6.	Photocopy machine	1	1
7.	GPS	21	32
8.	Radio communication	21	21
9.	Video camera	1	1
10.	Camera	3	14
11.	Voice recorder	1	1
12.	Desk	7	7
13.	Meeting table	1	1
14.	Chair	17	17
15.	Cabinet	4	4
16.	LCD projector	1	1
17.	Fax-phone machine	1	1
18.	Wall screen projector	1	1
19.	Cable printer	-	1
20.	Connector network	-	1
21.	Memory stick	11	11
22.	Flash drive	-	13
23.	Dry cell battery	-	4
24.	Scene of satellite imagery	18	19
25.	Set of solar panels	-	7

Although higher quantities of desktop computers, printers, GPS, cameras, flash derives, dry cell batteries, and seven sets of solar panels were purchased, they did not affect the budget significantly or in financing the implementation of the planned activities.

- 4.5 The purchased equipment was well kept, maintained and was used by the FA offices in the four provinces. This had enabled the FA Cantonments to monitor illegal forest activities and document forest crimes in a more effective manner as compared to the pre-project situation. This was evident during the consultant visits to the offices of the Kratie and Kampong Thom FA Cantonments, the Kratie FA Division and the Snoul Forestry Administration Triage.
- 4.6 A number of the purchases such as the 4WD vehicle, desktop computers and printers, digital voice recorder, wall screen projector, cabinets, desks and chairs, including a meeting table have been transferred and are being used in the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled "Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia". This 36-month project, with a total budget of US\$ 555,527.00, started implementation in May 2013. Of the total budget, the contribution from ITTO and that from the GoC were US\$ 464,033.00 and US\$ 91,494.00 respectively.
- 4.7 For Output 1.2, a training program comprising four training modules was developed based on two training needs assessment conducted under the project involving 622 respondents from the staff of 11 FA Cantonments. They were on forestry issues related to harvesting, wildlife identification and

CITES; procedures dealing with forest offenses involving searches, intelligence, evidence gathering and filling of documents for the court and Central FA; law enforcement encompassing Forestry Law, Land Law, Code of Criminal Procedure, Protected Area Law, and other laws and regulations; and specialized skills covering communication, negotiation, conflict management and resolution, use of GPS, map reading, and document management.

- 4.8 The training modules were used successfully to train 545 FA staff at the Inspectorate, Cantonment, Division and Triage levels against a target of 773 local staff as proposed in the report prepared by the national consultant recruited by the project entitled "Report on Evaluation of Existing Human Resources of Local Forestry Administration for the Training Needs", March 2009, that was presented to the Second PSC Meeting which was held in January 2010 in Phnom Penh.
- 4.9 More specifically, it had trained 256 staff on various aspects of forest law enforcement, 270 staff on crime codes and procedures, and 19 staff on the use of the computerized forest crime data system. A total of 20 senior staff at the Central FA, and the FA Inspectorates and Cantonments was also trained as trainers as was planned under the project.
- 4.10 In addition and as part of training, 15 Chiefs of the FA Cantonments attended a two-day FLEG ASEM Conference on "Forests, Forest Governance and Timber Trade: Scenarios and Challenges for Europe and Asia" that was held in May 2010 in Phnom Penh, while the Project Coordinator attended a three-day workshop on technology that promotes transparent timber trade in Asia and the Pacific Region in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia in July 2011.
- 4.11 For Output 2.1, a technical guideline on forest patrolling was developed through internal meetings and brain-storming of FA officials. It comprises standard operating procedures (SOP) and has four main elements, namely, patrolling planning and operations; equipment and facilities requirements; investigation, interrogation and suppression; and case follow up. A total of 1,500 copies was published and distributed and was used to successfully train the FA staff in the four provinces.
- 4.12 A pocket guide on monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices was also developed under Output 2.1. It contains a compilation of existing forestry laws, land use laws, criminal codes and criminal code procedures, as well as government orders related to the forestry sector. Its aim is to enable the FA staff to conduct effective documentation and monitoring of illegal forestry activities in the field, as well as to ensure full compliance of field operations to existing laws and regulations. A total of 775 copies was published and distributed.
- 4.13 In this regard, the technical guideline on forest patrolling and the pocket guide on monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices had improved the capacity and enhanced the technical knowledge of FA staff to conduct forest law enforcement more effectively. The guideline will further be field-tested and updated under the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled "Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia".
- 4.14 The Case Tracking System (CTS) that was developed in 2000, based on the US Forest Service's experience, under the Project UNTS/CMB/001/DFI which allowed the FA management to identify and implement law enforcement activities through appropriately recording and analyzing incidents involving violations on forest lands and protected areas was updated. It included the publication and dissemination of a technical manual on the operation of the CTS developed by the project. It involved, among others, a refinement to the interface for data entry, and improvement to the data extraction system. The system was installed in 15 computers, one each in the four FA Cantonments and 11 FA Divisions in the four provinces (Kratie, Kampong Thom, Pursat and Preah Sihanouk) of the project sites. A total of 1,729 forest crime cases had been recorded in the system for the period January 2009 to December 2011 for the four provinces under the project, as in Table 2, compared to a total of 4,148 cases recorded over the same period for the whole country.
- 4.15 From Table 2, it is also evident that the total number of forest crime cases detected and recorded in the CTS for the provinces of Kratie and Kampong Thom for the period 2012-2014 had increased to 1,137 and 748 cases respectively after the project was completed as compared to 747 and 400 cases respectively which were recorded during the implementation of the project from 2009-2011. However, the volume of timber and timber products seized in both the provinces had recorded a decrease after project completion as compared to during project implementation.

- 4.16 In this context, the Kratie province had recorded a decrease of 2,025.8 m³ or 46.9 % of the volume of timber and timber products seized after project completion as compared to during project implementation. More specifically, a total of 4,319.3 m³ was recorded during project implementation as compared to a total of 2,293.5 m³ which was recorded after the project was completed.
- 4.17 In the case of Kampong Thom province, the total volume of timber and timber products seized had also recorded a decrease of 535.6 m³ or 42.5%, where a total of 1,261.6 m³ was recorded during project implementation as compared to a total of 726.0 m³ which was recorded after the project was completed.
- 4.18 Nevertheless, the Pursat and Preah Sihanouk provinces had shown a decline in both the number of crime cases recorded as well as the total volume of timber and timber seized after project completion as compared to during project implementation.
- 4.19 Furthermore, an estimated 24,615 ha of forest land that hitherto were illegally occupied by land hungry had been put back as permanent forests through proclamation by Provincial Governors and are now ready for undergoing rehabilitation and reforestation. In this context, a total of 5,698 ha of such forest land in Kampong Thom province was proclaimed by the Provincial Governor during the period 2009 to 2011.
- 4.20 As evident from the field visits conducted by the consultant, the CTS was not only being used at the Central FA office, but also at the FA Cantonments, Divisions and Triages offices. This system had proven invaluable for the FA to record and manage all cases of forest crimes committed in Cambodia, especially in the four provinces.
- 4.21 Under the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled “Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia”, further refinement of the software of the CTS, including the SOP and training of FA staff to operate the system will be undertaken, especially when the CTS is installed for use in the other provinces of Cambodia.
- 4.22 To facilitate the development of a feasible and practical forest monitoring plan under Output 2.1, 19 scenes of satellite images from Landsat TM 5 were interpreted with field verification to produce 3,000 copies of the 2010 forest cover map of Cambodia. The forest cover map was used effectively in implementing forest law enforcement activities in the project sites of the four provinces.

Table 2. Number of Forest Crime Cases and Volume of Timber Products recorded in the Case Tracking System (CTS), 2009-2014

Period	Year	Kratie Province		Kampong Thom Province		Purasat Province		Preah Sihanouk Province		Total	
		No. of Forest Crimes Cases	Volume of Timber Products Seized (m ³)	No. of Forest Crimes Cases	Volume of Timber Products Seized (m ³)	No. of Forest Crimes Cases	Volume of Timber Products Seized (m ³)	No. of Forest Crimes Cases	Volume of Timber Products Seized (m ³)	No. of Forest Crimes Cases	Volume of Timber Products Seized (m ³)
During Project Implementation	2009	88	673.6	77	56.4	91	86.4	26	97.0	282	913.4
	2010	340	2,093.1	75	946.6	210	154.9	24	40.9	649	3,235.5
	2011	319	1,552.6	248	258.6	210	178.7	21	5.0	798	1,994.9
Sub-total	-	747	4,319.3	400	1,261.6	511	420.0	71	142.9	1,729	6,143.8
After Project Completion	2012	254	653.4	222	214.1	9	48.5	9	8.0	494	924.0
	2013	454	772.8	168	295.6	54	112.9	10	1.0	686	1,182.3
	2014	429	867.3	358	216.3	146	81.9	17	1.1	950	1,166.6
Sub-total	-	1,137	2,293.5	748	726.0	209	243.3	36	10.1	2,130	3,272.9
Total	-	1,884	6,612.8	1,148	1,987.6	720	663.3	107	153.0	3,859	9,416.7

- 4.23 In this context, the FA is currently updating the forest cover map of Cambodia for the year 2014 using imagery from Landsat TM 8 which will have 22 land-use classes as compared to the five classes that were used under the project as in Table 3.

Table 3: Land-Use Classes used in the 2010 and 2014 Forest Cover Map of Cambodia

No.	Land-Use Classes	
	<i>2010 Forest Cover Map</i>	<i>2014 Forest Cover Map</i>
1.	Evergreen Forest	Evergreen Forest
2.	Semi-evergreen Forest	Semi-evergreen Forest
3.	Deciduous Forest	Deciduous Forest
4.	Other Forests	Pine Forest
5.	Non-Forest	Mangrove Forest
6.	-	Rear Mangrove
7.	-	Forest Regrowth
8.	-	Flooded Forest
9	-	Bamboo
10	-	Pine Plantation
11.	-	Tree Plantation
12.	-	Rubber Plantation
13.	-	Oil Palm Plantation
14.	-	Agriculture
15.	-	Paddy Field
16.	-	Grassland
17.	-	Woodshrub
18.	-	Water
19.	-	Built-up Area
20.	-	Village
21.	-	Rock
22.	-	Sand

- 4.24 This 2014 forest cover map is expected to be available at the end of 2015 and will be used as a benchmark map to support the approved 36-month ITTO Project PD 740/14 Rev.2 (F) entitled "Sustainable Forest Management through REDD+ Mechanisms in Kampong Thom Province", which is expected to commence implementation in early July 2015. The total budget of the project is US\$ 561,022.00, with contribution from ITTO amounting to US\$ 484,792.00 and that from the GoC

amounting to US\$ 76,230.00. It is planned that the forest cover map will be updated biennially as required under the REDD+ process.

- 4.25 Under Output 2.2, four coordination meetings were conducted between the FA Cantonments and the Royal Prosecutors and Judges of the Kratie, Kampong Thom, Pursat and Preach Sihanouk provinces, among others, to resolve problems related to the judicial processing of forest crimes cases that were submitted to the courts by the FA Cantonments. A total of 114 personnel was involved in the meetings. As a result, a total of 539 cases at the project sites was resolved and closed, namely, 218 cases in Kratie, 161 cases in Kampong Thom, 139 cases in Pursat and 21 cases in Preah Sihanouk. These meetings had improved collaboration between officers of the FA Cantonments and those of the provincial courts in the four provinces of the project sites, as well as provided better understanding of the judicial process required for processing the forest crime cases that had been submitted to the courts by the FA Cantonments.
- 4.26 A total of 270 FA staff at the central and local levels, including the Inspectorates, was also trained in the “Criminal Code” and “Criminal Procedure Code” under Output 2.2. The subjects covered by the trainings included the Cambodian judicial system; prosecution; investigating judge and investigation chamber; judicial police; and judgment and appeal of judgment.
- 4.27 In addition, a total of 1,001 forest crime cases that occurred during 2010-2011 was reviewed and recommendations were made by the national legal consultant recruited by the project for the consideration of the FA Cantonments for follow-up actions. This was found to be very useful and effective for the FA Cantonments to follow up the cases with the courts.
- 4.28 Under Output 2.3, twelve extension workshops on forest laws and regulations were conducted in eight districts in the four provinces. A total of 1,227 participants was involved representing the FA, relevant institutions and stakeholder groups such as local governments, local villages and communes, local private sector and non-governmental organizations (NGOs). These workshops had greatly raised the awareness and increased the knowledge of the general public, especially the local community on the need to curb illegal forest activities as a secured forest resource base would contribute to improving their livelihoods and welfare.
- 4.29 Under the Cambodian National Forest Program, 2010-2029 that was launched in October 2010, the GoC has targeted two million ha of forest land to be allocated for Community Forestry (CF) (approximately 1,000 CF) groups by the end of 2029. As of June 2013, of the 457 established CF sites covering 400,167 ha in 21 provinces, the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries has approved 345 CF sites covering 308,563 ha of forest land. Of these approved sites, 253 CF sites covering 207,299 ha located in 20 provinces have had agreements signed between the FA Cantonments and the Community Forestry Management Committee (CFMC).
- 4.30 In this context, the two forestry communities visited by the consultant, namely, the Kbal Bei Forestry Community in the Kampong Thom province and the Khan Tout Forestry Community in the Kratie province have forest areas of 741 ha and 715 ha respectively. They also have legally signed agreements for a period of 15 years each with the FA Cantonments. The agreement for the former was signed in March 2009, while that for the latter was in December 2011. Both the forestry communities are actively carrying out regular patrols of their areas and had reported a number of infractions, such as illegal harvesting of fuelwood, which had been resolved by the respective FA Cantonments. Currently, the draft Forest Management Plans prepared by the two forestry communities have been submitted to the respective FA Cantonments for their consideration and approval.
- 4.31 Extension materials were also produced and distributed. These included 1,000 T-shirts with logos of ITTO, FA and the International Year of Forests distributed to local people during the National Arbor Day on 9 July 2011; 20 signboards of Kbal Bei Forestry Community displayed in Kampong Thom province; 1,500 copies (size A1) and 9,000 copies (size A4) of four posters of different themes distributed to increase public awareness; eight forestry banners flagged at strategic points in the four provinces; and 5,000 copies of a comic book entitled “Forest and Our Future”.
- 4.32 A project website at <http://www.twgfr.org/itto> was also developed to disseminate and provide public access to the publications produced under project. This website is also linked with the website of the Technical Working Group on Forestry Reform (TWG-FR) for information sharing.

- 4.33 The duration of the project was extended for six months without additional funding to enable the completion of publications and dissemination of forestry extension materials, and to complete reporting.
- 4.34 Overall, the FA is now in a better position to control illegal logging, prevent forest clearing, and land encroachment. The trained personnel of the FA under the project are now able to carry out effective forest law enforcement, as well as monitoring and documentation of illegal practices, including forest harvesting. The much needed legal procedures and appropriate deterrent mechanisms have also been put in place to ensure that illegal forest activities are dealt with effectively by the courts.
- 4.35 Based on the above, the first specific objective had been realized to a great extent through the training of 245 FA staff on FLEG related activities and the procurement and installation of the much needed equipment and facilities for suppression of illegal forest activities.
- 4.36 The second specific objective had also been realized through the development, testing, and adoption of technical guidelines for monitoring of illegal forest activities, documentation of committed forest crimes and judicial processing of forest crime cases.
- 4.37 As such, the development objective of the project in contributing to combating illegal logging, forest land clearing and land encroachment in order to manage and use the forest resources in a sustainable manner had been realized in the project sites of the four provinces under the project.

Sustainability

- 4.38 An exit strategy was developed by the FA where critical activities initiated and/or implemented by the project were identified for their continuation under the Program 3 - Forest Law Enforcement and Forest Governance (FLEG) of the Cambodian National Forest Program, 2010-2029. The current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled "Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia", will also further improve the technical guideline on forest patrolling and the pocket guide on monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices, refine the CTS and train FA staff, produce updated forest cover maps, and provide training to community leaders on skills needed to implement selected forest law enforcement activities.
- 4.39 A number of the purchases such as the 4WD vehicle, desktop computers and printers, digital voice recorder, wall screen projector, cabinets, desks and chairs, including a meeting table, are being used by the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F).
- 4.40 The FA is mandated by GoC to implement forest laws and regulations for achieving sustainable management and use of forest resources. It is also mandated by the GoC to implement the National Forest Program, 2010-2029, where one of its six prioritized programs is on "Forest Law Enforcement and Governance".
- 4.41 Furthermore, the decreasing trend in the quantity of illegal forest products seized after project completion by the FA Cantons reflects the enhanced capacity of FA in enforcing forest laws and regulations. As such, the FA has committed itself to:
- (i) continue support the FLEG initiative which has also been included in the National Forest Program, 2010-2029;
 - (ii) continue implementing critical activities of the project where institutional arrangements have been made;
 - (iii) follow-up findings of the project pertaining to FLEG in order to reduce illegal forest operations; and
 - (iv) secure the necessary personnel and funds for implementing selected critical activities.

- 4.42 Towards this end, the following institutional arrangements have been made after project completion:
- (i) the Department of Legislation and Law Enforcement (DLLE) of the FA is tasked to implement critical activities relating to forest patrolling operations and the management of the forest crime database system in close cooperation with the four FA Cantonments in Kratie, Kampong Thom, Pursat and Preah Sihanouk provinces;
 - (ii) the DLLE in close collaboration with the Ministry of Justice is also tasked to handle the judicial process of forest crime cases; and
 - (iii) the Department of Forest and Community Forestry (DFCF) of the FA is tasked to monitor forest cover change, while the Department of Administration, Planning and Finance (DAPF) of the FA is tasked to implement activities on forestry extension.
- 4.43 To enable the DLLE, DFCF and DAPF to effectively fulfill the above tasks, a total of 18 staff of the DLLE, Cantonments and Divisions has been assigned to maintain and update the forest crime database system, while 2 staff of the DFCF will continuously monitor forest cover and produce updated forest maps, and 1 staff of the DAPF will coordinate forestry extension work with the FA Cantonments.
- 4.44 In addition, a number of FA Cantonments will continue to organize and hold quarterly coordination meetings with the Royal Prosecutors and Judges to resolve the judicial processing of outstanding forest crimes cases submitted by the FA Cantonments to the courts.
- 4.45 The local communities have now gained a better understanding of the positive impact of FLEG in enhancing sustainable forest management and the rule of law which will contribute positively to the environment they live in, as well as their livelihoods and welfare in the long term. Hence, they are more likely to continue to support FLEG activities in Cambodia.
- 4.46 Notwithstanding the above, external support and funding is still needed to address specific problems encountered during the implementation of selected activities that may require immediate and concrete follow-up action.

Project formulation and implementation

Identification and project design

- 4.47 For the period 1969 to 2006, the forest cover of Cambodia had decreased from 13.2 million ha or 73% to 10.8 million ha or 59.09 % of its land area, while as of 2007, more than 200,000 ha had been cleared and occupied by offenders. Furthermore, for the period 1999 up to September 2007, the FA had recorded 6,894 cases of illegal activities in its computer case tracking system.
- 4.48 Based on the Government policy and recommendation from development partners, an ITTO pre-project PPD 128/06 Rev.1 (F) entitled "Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia" was implemented from July to November 2007. It identified that the main causes of the deforestation and forest degradation were forest land clearing and land encroachment for agriculture purposes; illegal logging; improper management of concession areas, protected areas and non-concession areas; limited reforestation activities; population pressure and poverty. These illegal forest activities are a serious threat to the sustainability of the forest resources and unless they are controlled and suppressed, sustainability of the forest resources in Cambodia is truly under threat.
- 4.49 Two surveys were also conducted under the pre-project through interviews with 570 rural residents and 226 FA staff. A total of 96% of the respondents of the surveys indicated that the problem was the "lack of facilities for forest law enforcement", and 98% of the respondents expressed the need for improved capacity through comprehensive training.
- 4.50 Through further discussion and brain-storming the stakeholders identified that the driving forces of deforestation and forest degradation were the weak law enforcement by the government and the lack of needed tools and facilities for enforcing forest legislation and regulations.

- 4.51 Based on the outcomes of the pre-project and build on measures taken under Declaration No.01 BB dated 25 January 1999, Declaration No 01 BB dated 9 June 2004 and Order No.01 BB dated 10 May 2006 to monitor and suppress illegal logging, forest clearing and encroachment in Cambodia by the FA, this project was formulated.
- 4.52 The identified activities had a strong linkage with the specific project objectives and outputs as formulated in the Logical Framework Matrix as in **Annex 7**. Vertically, five outputs were identified to achieve the two specific objectives through the implementation of 17 activities to address weak forest law enforcement and governance, and the lack of means to enforce them by staff of the FA, especially those at the Cantonments, Divisions and Triages levels.
- 4.53 The primary beneficiaries of the project, namely, the FA, the forest concessionaires and local communities were also actively involved in the project development process which had resulted in a sound project design. As such, intervention during project implementation was well supported by stakeholders.
- 4.54 It was envisaged that capacity in forest law enforcement could only be strengthened by making available the needed facilities, training sufficient number of the FA staff on FLEG, enhancing the monitoring of forest operations, effective processing of forest crimes involving judicial courts, establishing and operating a rapid response task force, and enhancing the forestry extension programs.
- 4.55 It was also envisioned that with strengthened capacity in forest law enforcement and governance the incidence of illegal forest activities should be reduced which in turn would contribute to sustainable management and the use of the forest resources in Cambodia.
- 4.56 In terms of risk management of the project, the FA was fully committed to enhancing FLEG which is one of the six prioritized programs of the National Forest Program, 2010-2029, and that the GoC had consistently demonstrated its strong willingness to engage in forestry sector reform. The risk of the judicial authorities in not fully cooperating with the FA in resolving forest crime cases was effectively addressed through coordination meetings held between the FA Cantonments and the Provincial Royal Prosecutors and Judges. The other risk that local communities and the business sector might not fully support combating illegal logging activities was mitigated through increased understanding that improved law enforcement and in implementing best forest management practices would yield long-term benefits to the local communities and the business sector.

Efficiency and effectiveness of project implementation

- 4.57 The project was implemented by the FA in collaboration with the FA Cantonments, Divisions and Triages, and with partners including local governments and judicial courts, as well as national and international consultants, NGOs and other professionals, They had all contributed significantly to the successful completion of the project.
- 4.58 In this regard, the FA staff at different levels was the primary executors of forest patrolling, users of technical guidelines produced and as participants of the technical trainings and workshops organized under the project. In addition, the local communities had acted as key informants during forest patrolling operations and were important participants of the workshops on FLEG. Forest concessionaires also participated actively in the workshops and in the training programs of the project, primarily as trainees.
- 4.59 Of the ITTO contribution of US\$ 561,195.00, a total of US\$ 440,454.08 was disbursed timely to the Executing Agency at its request in six installments and with full adherence to the rules and procedures of ITTO. From the amount received, a total of US\$ 434,523.47 or 98.7% was spent. The contribution of GoC, amounting to US\$ 123,167.00, was also made timely. The timely disbursement of funds had contributed to the smooth implementation of the project.
- 4.60 The consultants and other professionals were all employed as planned and with the prior approval of ITTO, consisting of 41 man-months of national consultants, four man-months of international consultants and 32 man-months of professionals on information technologies. All had satisfactorily delivered their respective outputs in accordance with the agreements signed between them and the FA.

- 4.61 The role and responsibilities of the FA Cantonments and Provincial Judicial Courts, and of the partners, such as, national and international consultants, were made clear from the onset of project implementation in the forms of minutes of meetings or terms of references signed by the parties involved. This had averted any misunderstanding, overlaps and duplication of tasks.
- 4.62 The PSC, although met only yearly, had provided invaluable managerial and technical advices to the project management team which had contributed to the sound management of the project.
- 4.63 Risk of external influence to project achievement had been mitigated through frequent consultative meetings where mutual understanding on the vital role of forest law enforcement in achieving sustainable forest management was promoted. This had also enhanced the collaboration between the authorities involved in FLEG initiatives and reduced sectoral bias and prejudice.
- 4.64 The implementation of the planned activities of the project was adequately monitored by the PSC, the Project Coordinator and staff of the FA Cantonments assigned for the purpose. The progress in their implementation was also evaluated during the regular technical meetings of the project management team, at the PSC meetings and during the workshops organized by the project, as appropriate. Basically, the project was only involved in institutional capacity building through increased facilities and training.
- 4.65 Project documentation was also adequately performed. Minutes of the PSC meetings, bi-annual progress reports, yearly plans of operation, technical reports on implementation of individual activities, annual financial audit reports and other technical documents produced were available at the FA and the project website: <http://www.twgfr.org/itto>. Some of these documents had been disseminated to stakeholders when deemed beneficial, while others had been used as inputs to facilitate internal as well as inter-institutional discussions and policy discourse.
- 4.66 All the planned activities were successfully implemented and there were no major deviations among them, except in the procurement of equipment and installation of facilities as discussed earlier. A six-month no-cost extension was granted by ITTO to enable the completion of publications and dissemination of forestry extension materials.
- 4.67 Notwithstanding the above, the Logical Framework Matrix could have been better formulated with more quantitative indicators as it could not be used to quantitatively assess Output 1.1, although the planned purchase of equipment and the installation of facilities were quantitatively indicated in the yearly plans of operation in physical units.
- 4.68 In addition, the Logical Framework Matrix could only allow the achievement of Output 2.1 on effective monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices to be assessed qualitatively as the indicator did not provide measurable units. However, despite this weakness, it is reasonable to conclude that training of FA staff had been effective as smaller quantity of illegal forest products was seized after project completion, albeit that the number of forest crime cases had increased in the Kratie and Kampong Thom provinces.

(b) **Lessons Learnt**

- 4.69 The early involvement of the primary stakeholders in problem identification and project development process was critical to thoroughly analyze the key problems to be addressed through the formulation of a “problem tree” and a “project objectives tree”. This had enabled the project to be implemented without any major adjustments or revision.
- 4.70 Regular and frequent monitoring of progress in individual activities implementation and evaluation in terms of timing, quantity and quality had assisted in detecting any deviations to the operational plans. This had enabled timely intervention to be taken to overcome them.
- 4.71 The installation of solar panels in the remote offices of the FA had enabled these offices to operate the installed computer system under uncertain supply of electricity. This is an option to be considered in areas where electricity supply is uncertain, albeit their costs and maintenance are high.

- 4.72 The guidelines developed for forest patrolling and suppressing forest crime would need to be fully field-tested in different environments so that they could be refined, adapted and used effectively in the other provinces in Cambodia.
- 4.73 The pocket guide on monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices had prevented the FA staff from making deviation from existing laws and regulations during forest patrol, but it would need to be reviewed periodically to reflect new legislation and regulations.
- 4.74 The development of training modules and the training of trainers had enabled the FA to conduct further training for its staff, albeit that the training modules would need to be refined periodically to reflect new tools and techniques, such as forest crimes investigation, intelligence and evidence gathering.
- 4.75 Nevertheless, the training provided under the four modules had focused on specialized training related to forestry issues; fundamental procedures in dealing with forest offenses; fundamental laws involved in law enforcement; and specialized skills on communication, negotiation, conflict management and resolutions, GPS and map reading, and document management; and had not explicitly addressed good governance. This is enshrined in the National Forest Policy, 2002, as well as the Strategic Objective 4 of the Cambodian National Forest Program, 2010-2029, on forest governance.
- 4.76 In fact, it is important to fully address good forest governance as it is fundamental for achieving positive and sustainable development outcomes of the forestry sector, such as efficiency in resource management, increase contribution to socio-economic development and environmental services, and the equitable distribution of benefits derived from forests.
- 4.77 The CTS developed under the project and installed at the FA offices in the four provinces had been effective in documenting forest crime cases. However, it would need to further refine the software and develop appropriate SOP and train FA staff to operate the system, if the CTS were to be installed and use effectively in the other provinces of Cambodia. This will be carried out under the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled "Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia".
- 4.78 Although the forest cover map produced in 2010 under the project had proven to be very useful for planning and in undertaking forest monitoring and patrolling of illegal forest activities, it would need to be updated at least yearly due to widespread illegal forest activities and the rapid socio-economic development in Cambodia. In this regard, the FA envisaged that the forest cover map will be updated biennially as required under the REDD+ process and that the 2014 forest cover map is expected to be available at the end of 2015.
- 4.79 As the coordination meetings between the FA Cantonments and the Royal Prosecutors and Judges had been effective in resolving forest crimes cases that were submitted to the courts by the FA Cantonments, it would be pertinent that these meetings be continued and the establishment of permanent joint coordination mechanisms should be considered.
- 4.80 Legal assistance should continue to be given to the FA Cantonments as it had been shown to be very useful and effective for the FA Cantonments to undertake follow-up action with the courts on forests crime cases.
- 4.81 To gain further support from the local communities to assist the FA to curb illegal forest activities and to contribute in enhancing sustainable forest management, appropriate incentive schemes, both tangible and intangible, should be developed for them, taking cognizance that their needs will vary from communities to communities even within the same province.
- 4.82 Notwithstanding the above, on hindsight and as was also observed by the project management team, it was not necessary to develop two specific objectives for the project as the lack of tools and trained personnel was the main cause of the problem addressed in the project. In this regard, the specific objective of the project could have been defined as "to strengthen the capacity of the FA in FLEG". This specific objective could have then been achieved through the delivery of three outputs, namely, increased availability of needed resources; effective conduct of monitoring, documentation and judicial handling of forest crime cases; and increased support of stakeholders. About 10-12 well-

executed activities would then be needed to achieve the three outputs and the specific objective, as compared to a total of 17 activities required to achieve the five outputs under the two specific objectives of the project.

5.0 Conclusions and Recommendations

(a) Conclusions

- 5.1 The project identification process was adequate. The key problems to be addressed were identified and thoroughly analyzed with the active participation of the main stakeholders.
- 5.2 Design of the project was sound because it was developed in accordance with clearly defined cause-effect relationships. Consequently, project interventions were consistent with the direct and indirect causes of the key problems.
- 5.3 All the 17 planned activities had been executed successfully with the approved budget and without any need for revision during project implementation. The five envisaged outputs had been achieved as well as the two specific objectives which had contributed to the realization of the development objective of the project.
- 5.4 During the project implementation, three yearly plans of operation, five bi-annual progress reports and three yearly financial audit reports had been submitted to ITTO. Employment of project personnel and external professionals as well as procurement of the capital items were all made with the prior expressed approval of ITTO.
- 5.5 Results of the project had been disseminated through national workshops and meetings of the PSC, including distribution of technical reports to relevant stakeholders nationwide, as well as through the project website.
- 5.6 At project completion, the needed equipment and facilities for effective conduct of forest patrolling had, to a greater extent made available; capacity of the FA staff at different levels to conduct forest patrolling and to properly document forest crimes had been significantly improved; and awareness and understanding on the vital role of FLEG initiatives in sustainable forest management had been considerably raised in the four provinces of the country. In addition, collaboration with provincial prosecutors and judges had been strengthened in handling forest crime cases, and forestry extension programs had been significantly improved.
- 5.7 More specifically the following were achieved:
- (i) equipment and facilities to enforce forest laws had been procured and installed in the four provinces;
 - (ii) four training modules on FLEG were prepared; a technical guideline on forest patrolling and a pocket guide on monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices were developed and field tested; while the CTS was updated and installed in the four offices of the FA Cantonments and 11 offices the FA Divisions, totaling 15 computers in the four provinces, including the preparation of a technical manual for its operation;
 - (iii) the production of 3,000 copies of the 2010 forest cover map of Cambodia based on interpretation of updated satellite imageries and field verification;
 - (iv) a total of 256 FA staff at different levels was trained to conduct patrolling and document forest crimes, 16 FA staff had gained further experience and knowledge on resolving FLEG issues through their attendance of relevant international workshops, and 270 FA staff had been given training on criminal procedures and codes;
 - (v) a total of 1,001 forest crime cases that occurred between 2010 and 2011 had been reviewed by the FA with the assistance of the legal consultant, while a total of 4,148 cases of forest crime had been entered into the CTS for the period January 2009 to December 2011, of which 1,729 cases were from the four provinces;

- (vi) a total of 539 cases of forest crimes at the project sites was resolved and closed through meetings and consultations with provincial courts;
- (vii) 12 extension workshops, attended by 1,227 participants, were conducted to raise public awareness on the importance of FLEG initiatives in enhancing sustaining forest management; and
- (viii) four types of posters of different themes were produced and displayed at strategic places and a comic book entitled “Forest and our Future” was published and distributed, as well as the development of a website for the project which is now operational.

5.8 The sustainability of the project was assured as the GoC, and more specifically the FA, had formulated a follow-up strategy to identify critical activities on FLEG to be continuously implemented, including institutional arrangements and sources of funds to finance their implementation, and the assignment of personnel to undertake the tasks. Some of these critical activities are being addressed through the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled “Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia” which started implementation in May 2013. Ownership is high as the activities are embedded in existing institutional structures of the FA.

(b) Recommendations

For the Executing Agency/ Forestry Administration

5.9 It is recommended that the Forestry Administration/Executing Agency may wish to consider the following:

- (i) Revise and update the four training modules periodically to reflect new tools and techniques in forest crimes investigation, intelligence and evidence gathering, etc.
- (ii) Initiate actions to install the CTS, including appropriate equipment and trained FA staff, in the other provinces of Cambodia, taking cognizance of the further work on the system by the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled “Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia”.
- (iii) Provide additional training of trainers on the Criminal Code Procedure so as to enable the FA staff to have the knowledge and skills for processing forest crime cases; and in the short term, engage a national legal consultant to advise the FA on outstanding forest crime cases for follow-up actions.
- (iv) Establish permanent joint coordination mechanisms between the FA Cantonments and the Royal Prosecutors and Judges to resolve forest crimes cases that were submitted to the courts by the FA Cantonments.
- (v) Develop incentive schemes for local communities to further gain their support to assist the FA in curbing illegal forest activities and to contribute to enhancing sustainable forest management, taking cognizance of the further work on improving their livelihoods and welfare by the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled “Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia”.
- (vi) Address more explicitly forest governance on the ways and manner by which officials and institutions acquire and exercise authority in the management of forest resources, which encompasses policies, institutions and processes.

For ITTO

- 5.10 In implementing similar FLEG projects, ITTO may wish to take cognizance of the following:
- (i) It is pertinent that main stakeholders be involved in the identification and analysis of problems to be addressed, and in designing project intervention to ensure buy-in and ownership by the main stakeholders.
 - (ii) Progress in implementation of individual activities, especially field activities, must be continuously monitored and evaluated to ensure that they yield the desired outputs to achieve the specific and development objectives of the project, as well as to enable timely remedial actions be taken to correct any deviations.
 - (iii) A well dedicated project management team has to be established, while inputs in terms of funds and personnel must be made available when required. The established PSC has to be able to provide fruitful advices to the project management team.
 - (iv) To further strengthen the project management team, a Project Technical Committee should be established to meet at least quarterly to provide technical inputs to the project and advise the PSC.
- 5.11 ITTO should also consider supporting the Executing Agency to replicate the excellent results produced under the project to the other provinces, especially the forest-rich provinces that face serious threat to the security of their forest resources.
- 5.12 The recommendations were well received by the FA of Cambodia, the Executing Agency of the project, as reflected in **Annex 8**.

Annex 1

Terms of Reference **Ex-Post Evaluation of ITTO Project on Forest Governance**

I. Background

ITTO is an intergovernmental commodity organization established in 1986 to administer the provisions and operation of the International Tropical Timber Agreement (ITTA), particularly in the promotion of international trade in tropical timber, the sustainable management of tropical forests and the development of tropical forest industries through international cooperation, policy work and project activities.

The project that will be the subject of the Ex-post Evaluation is:

PD 493/07 Rev.1 (F) Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia

The background information of this project is provided in Annex to the Terms of Reference.

II. Purpose and Scope of Evaluation

A) Purpose

The primary purpose of the evaluation is to provide a concise diagnosis of the project related to forest law enforcement and governance in sustainable forest management in Cambodia so as to point out the successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for successes and failures, and the contribution of the projects towards ITTO's Objective 2000 and the ITTO Action Plan, and to draw recommendations and lessons that can be used to improve current similar projects and future projects development.

B) Scope of Work

a) Analyze and assess for the project:

1. The overall role and contribution of the project in light of sectoral policies, development programmes, priorities and requirements to Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia.
2. The current status of Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance within the project's area of influence, the effectiveness of the project's implementation and its effectiveness in promoting forest conservation and sustainable management practices.
3. The contributions of the specific studies in various forestry-related disciplines prepared by the project as regards the achievement of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in the project's area of influence.
4. The results and impacts of activities conducted by the project and its contribution to the overall capacity of target groups in Cambodia regarding Forest Law Enforcement and Governance.
5. The effectiveness of dissemination of project results.
6. The overall post-project situation in the project's area of influence.
7. The unexpected effects and impacts, either harmful or beneficial, and the reasons for their occurrences.
8. The cost efficiency in the implementation of the project, including the technical, financial and managerial aspects.
9. Follow-up actions in order to enhance uptake of project results.
10. The project's relative success or failure, including a summary of the key lessons learnt; and the identification of any issues or problems that should be taken into account in designing and implementing similar projects in the future.

b) Provide a synthesis to:

1. Assess the overall role and meaningful contribution of the project in achieving improved Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in ITTO Producer Member countries taking into account ITTO's objectives, Action Plan, and Objective 2000.

2. Assess the potential and actual contribution of the project to ITTO's Forest Law Enforcement and Governance work.
3. Evaluate the overall impact on and relevance of the project for the forestry and environmental authorities, Executing Agency, the forest industry and conservation sector and local communities being served.
4. Evaluate the overall attainment of the objectives and assess the overall effectiveness of the project.
5. Evaluate the overall appropriateness of the costs and cost structure and use of resources within the project.

And make recommendations on:

1. The needs for similar projects in the future.
2. The objectives of such future projects.
3. Innovative approaches/designs for projects aiming at Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in promoting SFM.
4. Appropriate target groups, e.g. countries, government, organizations, forestry sector, local communities, etc.
5. The organizational arrangements of similar projects.
6. Follow-up and evaluation practices.
7. Supplemental, alternative activities, processes, procedures, and/or follow-up programmes in the field of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance, if appropriate.

III. Approach

A) Composition of the evaluation team

The team will be composed of one consultant, who will be in charge of the final report and the presentation of the results at the Fifty-first Session of the International Tropical Timber Council (November 2015, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia).

B) Consultation during evaluation exercise

The consultant will maintain close liaison with ITTO and will carry out the work in close cooperation with the concerned Executing Agency in Cambodia. Although the consultant should feel free to discuss with the authorities concerned all matters relevant to its assignment, it is not authorized to make any commitments on behalf of ITTO.

C) Activities and report of the consultant

The work required in this evaluation will consist of:

1. Desk review of project-related documents and materials provided by ITTO.
2. Mission in Cambodia. The consultant will visit the project's Executing Agency headquarters for a further desk review of project materials and to carry out evaluation work in connection with the Executing Agency. The consultant shall also include a field visit to the project's area of influence to review field implementation and to evaluate the project results and impacts, and should include discussions with project stakeholders and target beneficiaries. A minimum of five working days is required for the field visit.
3. Preparation of an Ex-post Evaluation Report in English in accordance with the Scope of Work and the checklist contained in the ITTO Manual for Project Monitoring, Review and Evaluation.
4. Preparation of an Overall Executive Summary [see b) Scope of Work] of the ex-post evaluation report focusing on the overall assessment of the project's relative success in contributing to ITTO's Objective 2000 and Action Plan, summarizing the key recommendations and lessons learnt;
5. Presentation of the Overall Executive Summary at the Fifty-first Session of the International Tropical Timber Council (November 2015, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia).
6. Preparation of an article for possible publication in the ITTO Tropical Forest Update (TFU), in consultation with the editor, containing an overview of the projects and summarizing the lessons learned from the evaluation work. Appropriate high-resolution photographs should be provided.

In writing the Ex-post Evaluation report, the consultant will have the opportunity to discuss its preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations with the representatives of the Executing Agency, relevant stakeholders and ITTO before the final version of the report is made. Responsibility for the final content of the report, however, remains with the consultant.

1.1 Duration of the assignment

The duration of the assignment will be 1 month and will consist of approximately two weeks travelling in the countries concerned and remaining time for preparation of the evaluation and report writing, and its presentation at the Fifty-first Session of the International Tropical Timber Council (November 2015, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia).

ANNEX

Project Information
for the
Ex-post Evaluation under the Theme of Forest Governance

**PD 493/07 Rev.1 (F) Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance
in Cambodia (Cambodia)**

Budget and Funding Sources:

Total Budget:	US\$	684,362
ITTO Budget:	US\$	561,195
Government of Japan (FA):	US\$	391,195
Government of the U.S.A.:	US\$	125,000
Government of Australia :	US\$	35,000
Government of Republic of Korea	US\$	10,000
Government of Cambodia:	US\$	123,167
Implementing Agency:	Forest Administration of Cambodia	
Session of Approval:	ITTC Ghana Meeting, June 2008, Accra, Ghana,	
Starting Date and Duration:	January 2009 / Planned; 36 months, Actual; 43 months	

I. Introduction

The project was approved and financed in June 2008 in Accra, Ghana. The agreement regulating the implementation of the project was duly signed on 6 October 2008. The first disbursement of funds was made on 26 December 2008. A 7-month extension of the project's period was extended to enhance the quality of technical reports resulting from the implementation of the project.

II. Project Objective

The development objective of the project was to contribute to the implementation of the Government's policy platform in combating illegal logging, forest land clearing and land encroachment in order to manage and use forest resource in a sustainable manner. Its specific objectives were: i) to strengthen capacities for forest law enforcement and governance; and ii) to develop tools to enable effective suppression of illegal forest activities.

III. Project Achievements and Outputs

In order to address the key problem of weak law enforcement capacity of the Forestry Administration (FA)), the project has worked for the achievements of five outputs: i) appropriate facilities in place, ii) forest law enforcement training implemented, iii) effective monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices, iv) effective judicial processing, and v) effective extension function.

Output 1: Appropriate facilities in place

The project has purchased various equipment and facilities to facilitate the suppression of illegal forest activities. These include 1 Vehicle, 4 motorcycles, 21 desktop computers, 2 notebooks, 14 printers, 1 photocopy, 32 GPS, 21 Radio communication, 1 video camera, 14 cameras, 1 voice recorder, 7 desks, 1 meeting table, 17 chairs, 4 cabinets, 1 LCD projector, 1 fax-phone machine, 1 wall screen projector, 1 cable printer, 1 connector network, 11 memories stick, 13 flash drives, 4 dry cell batteries, 19 scenes of satellite imagery, and installed 7 sets of solar panels at the four project sites.

Output 2: Forest law enforcement training implemented

Based on the findings of the training need assessment, the project developed a sound training program that comprised four modules:

1. Specialized training related to forestry issues (harvesting, wildlife identification, CITES and other cross-border issues)
2. Fundamental procedures in dealing with forest offenses (searches, intelligence, evidence gathering, and filling in documents for the court and Central FA)
3. Fundamental laws involved in law enforcement (forestry law, land law, code of criminal procedure, protected area law and other laws and regulations)
4. Specialized skills (communication, negotiation, conflict management and resolution, GPS and map reading and document management)

The trainings were conducted at the Forest and Wildlife Training Center in Phnom Penh, Cambodia to all levels of FA staff including Central FA and Local FA (Inspectorates, Cantonments, Divisions and Triages), not only concerning theory but also practical field work. 20 trainers on forest law enforcement had been trained under the project; they were selected from the senior staff of Central FA, FA Inspectorates and FA Cantonments. In total, FA staff at different levels that had been trained was: 256 staff on forest law enforcement aspects, 270 staff on crime codes and 19 staff on use of computerized forest crime data base systems (CTS).

The project had provided support to 15 Chiefs of FA Cantonments to attend the ASEM Conference on “forest product trade and forest governance” in Phnom Penh and Project Coordinator to attend the workshop on technology that promotes transparent timber trade in Asia and the Pacific Region held in Kuala Lumpur on 27-29 July 2011.

Output 3: Effective monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices

Forest patrolling procedures have been developed through internal meetings and brainstorming of FA officials and staff. These include four main elements: i) patrolling operations, ii) equipment and facilities required for patrolling, iii) investigation, planning and suppression; and iv) case follow up.

A pocket field guide on monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices have been developed by compiling main articles from forestry laws, land laws, criminal codes, criminal code procedures and government orders related to forestry sector for purpose of strengthening and improving capacity of FA staff to conduct effective documentation and monitoring of illegal forestry practices in the field.

A Case Tracking System (CTS) developed under the Project (UNTS/CMB/001/DFI) in year 2000 based on the US Forest Service’s experience has been updated to provide the FA management with a means to identify and implement law enforcement activities by appropriately recording and analyzing incidents involving violations on forestlands and protected areas. The system was installed on 15 computers, one each, in the four FA Cantonments and eleven FA Divisions in the four provinces (Kratie, Kampong Thom, Pursat and Preah Sihanouk) of the project sites. In the period from 2009 to 2011, a total of 4,148 cases of forest crime had been detected and entered to the date base systems at four offices of FA Cantonments and eleven Division Offices.

A forest cover study (2010) classified land use into 10 classes by using the land use class definition of FAO through the satellite images of the Landsat 7 ETM and 5 TM. Results of the 2010 study show 10,363,789 hectares or 57.07 percent of Cambodia land area were forest land. Comparing the figures of forest cover in 2002 and 2010 indicates that the loss of forest cover in 2002-2010 period was 740,502 hectares in total, representing 4.08 % of total land area. It implies that the annual rate of deforestation during the 2002-2010 period was 0.5 %.

Output 4: Effective judicial processing

In order to improve collaboration with provincial courts at the four provinces of project sites, four coordination meetings were conducted between FA Cantonments and Royal Prosecutors and Judges of Pursat, Kratie, Kampong Thom and Preah Sihanouk provinces with a total of 115 FA staff taking part in the meetings. These meetings provided better understanding of judicial processing of the forest crime cases that had been sent to the courts by FA Cantonments.

As a result of the meetings with provincial courts, a total of 539 forest crime cases have been completed and closed in four provinces (Kampong Thom-161 cases, Pursat-139 cases, Kratie-218 cases and Preah Sihanouk-21 cases). A series of training course on "Criminal Code" and "Criminal Procedure Code" were organized. There were 270 participants from FA at the central and local levels including the Inspectorates. The subjects covered by the trainings included: Cambodian judicial system; prosecution; investigating judge and investigation chamber; judicial police; judicial police officers; judicial police agents; and judgment and appeal of judgment

Output 5: Effective extension function

Twelve extension workshops on forest laws and regulations have been conducted in eight districts in four provinces with 1,227 participants in total representing Forestry Administration, Community Forestry, private sector and NGOs

Extension materials have been developed and distributed. These include 1,000 T-shirts with logos of ITTO, Forestry Administration and the International Year of Forest distributed to local people during the National Arbor Day on 9 July 2011; 20 sign boards of Kbal Bei Community Forestry exposed in Kampong Thom province; 1,500 copies (Size A1) and 9,000 copies (Size A4) of 4 posters of different titles distributed to increase public awareness; 8 forestry banners flagged at strategic points in 4 provinces; and 5,000 copies of a comic book entitled "Forest and Our Future". The project developed a website by linking to the website of TWG-F&E (Technical Working Group on Forestry and Environment) for information sharing. The project website is <http://www.twge.org/itto>.

IV. Outcomes and Impacts

The main outcomes and impacts of the project attaining its specific and development objectives are summarized in the following points:

- Availability of the equipment and facilities purchased by the project has enabled the FA Cantonments in four provinces to monitor illegal forest activities and document forest crimes in a more effective manner compared to the pre-project situation
- Implementation of the training program has improved the capacity of 245 FA staff at different levels to conduct forest patrolling and document forest crimes. Moreover, 16 FA staff have gained experience in FLEG problem solving through their attendance of relevant international workshops
- FA staff at different levels and stakeholders alike have gained technical knowledge and understanding on forest law enforcement through the different technical guidelines on FLEG including the technical manual on CTS operation published and disseminated by the project. In addition, status of forest cover in four provinces in 2006-2010 period has been studied and properly mapped through interpretation of updated satellite imageries.
- At project completion 1,001 cases of forest crime that were occurred in 2010-2011 had been reviewed by the FA with the assistance of legal consultants. Moreover, collaboration with Provincial Prosecutors and Judges in four provinces has been substantially strengthened through coordinative meetings conducted under the project and 270 staff of FA at different levels have improved their capacity in suppressing forest illegal activities through the training sessions on criminal codes
- At completion of the project, public awareness on the importance of FLEG initiatives have been improved significantly compared to pre-project situation. The improvement was attributable to the extension workshops held in four provinces and attended by 1,227 participants representing various stakeholder groups, publication and dissemination of attractive extension materials as well as production and distribution of appropriate banners, posters, brochures and other materials.

At project completion, a total of 4,148 cases of forest crime had been detected and documented in four provinces; around 24,615 hectares of forest land that hitherto was illegally occupied by land hungry had been put back as permanent forests ready for undergoing rehabilitation and reforestation. These project outcomes are consistent with the RGC's policy on SFM as well as with RGC's Orders No. 01 BB of 2004 and No. 01 BB of 2006. Strengthened operational capacity to combat effectively illegal forest harvesting and clearing will now enable the RGC to implement sustainable production of tropical timber, leading to improved forest utilization through efficient forest management from destructive and wasteful illegal operations.

V. Lessons Learnt and sustainability

The project has been widely recognized in Cambodia and has achieved considerable outputs. A number of lessons have emerged from the project's implementation. These include:

- The adequate involvement of stakeholders in the project development process had resulted in a sound project design and relevant project intervention that planned project activities could be smoothly implemented with the full support of the stakeholders.
- Implementation of a collaborative approach was vital for stakeholders involving not only forestry institutions but also other agencies affecting forest resource management, e.g. local government units, land management offices, judicial courts, NGOs, etc.
- Achievements of the project were, to a greater extent, very much dependent on the capacity of the project management team (PMT) to perform operational management of the project and capability of the Project Steering Committee (PSC) in providing the PMT with useful policy and technical advices.
- The report by the Chiefs of FA Cantons in four provinces on the declining incidence of forest crimes towards the end of the project is a clear indication of the enhanced capacity of FA in forest law enforcement in those provinces and it was attributable to the project intervention; it is therefore reasonable to strongly suggest that similar project intervention be replicated to other provinces of the country and
- In replicating the intervention on forest law enforcement, priority should be given to those provinces with rich forest resources in order to first safeguard the remaining forest; in designing the intervention, due attention should be given to the lessons learned from the previous project that weaknesses are not carried over yet strengths are duly maintained.

The decreasing trend in the incidence of illegal forest activities reported recently by the FA Cantons reflects the enhanced capacity of FA in enforcing forest laws and regulations and surely attributable to the intervention of the project. Therefore, continuation of the critical activities initiated under the project is indispensable in order not to lose the already existing momentum for cracking down illegal forest activities.

VI. Concluding Remarks

With the strong commitment of the Forestry Administration of Cambodia to FLEG initiative which also includes in the National Forest Program, the project has been successful in achieving most of its planned outputs and its specific objectives and in contributing to its development objective. At the project completion, Forestry Administration is now better able to control illegal logging, prevent forest clearing, and land encroachment with improved capacity of effective reporting and appropriate facilities and equipment.

Since the ITTO Secretariat has received the Project Completion Report, several Technical Reports, and Financial Audit Report, the Committee may wish to consider this project as completed.

(Extracted from CRF(XLVI)/2)

Annex 2

Program

Ex-post Evaluation of ITTO Project PD 493/07 Rev.1 (F)

Phnom Penh, Cambodia, 8 - 18 June 2015

8 June 2015 (Monday)

Arrival in Phnom Penh, Cambodia (Morning)

Meeting with the Project Coordinator to review the proposed program and summary of project outcomes (Afternoon)

9 June 2015 (Tuesday)

Meeting with the Chief of the Forestry Administration, relevant departments and project staff (refer to Annex 3 for details)

10 June 2015 (Wednesday)

Review of project reports and documents

11-13 June 2015 (Thursday- Saturday)

Visits to the two project sites at the Kampong Thom and Kratie provinces (refer to Annex 4 for details)

14-15 June 2015 (Sunday & Monday)

Preparation of draft report covering, among others, the attainment of the objectives and contribution of the project to Forest Law Enforcement and Governance (FLEG) in Cambodia, as well as key findings, lessons learnt, and recommendations.

16 June 2015 (Tuesday)

Preparation of power-point presentation of the draft report and finalize it with the Project Coordinator

17 June 2015 (Wednesday)

Presentation of the draft report to the Deputy Director General of Forestry Administration, relevant departments and project staff (Morning)

Further discussion with the Project Coordinator on the draft report, especially the recommendations (Afternoon)

18 June 2015 (Thursday)

Departure for Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

Annex 3

List of Personnel Interviewed

Ex-post Evaluation of ITTO Project PD493/07 Rev.1 (F)
Phnom Penh, 9 June 2015

Time	Name	Position	Related to ITTO project	Place
08:30-09:30	Ms. Sar Sophyra	Deputy Chief of watershed management and forest cover assessment office	GIS National Expert	Phnom Penh Thmey
	Mr. Pak Chealy	Deputy Director, Forestry and Community Forestry Department	GIS National Expert	Phnom Penh Thmey
09:30-10:00	Mr. Leng Chivin	Deputy Director, Forestry and Community Forestry Department	-	Phnom Penh Thmey
10:00-10:30	Mr. Soun Sovann	Deputy Director, Legislation and Law Enforcement Department	FLE National Consultant	FA Headquarter
10:30-11:30	Mr. Pin Phany	Deputy Chief, Southern Tonle Sap Lake Forestry Administration Inspectorate	National Consultant for evaluation existing staff on the training need	Project Office in FA
11:30-14:00	Lunch			
14:00-14:30	Mr. Chorng Tol	Chief of monitoring and evaluation office	IT National Expert	Project Office in FA
14:30-15:00	Mr. Nup Sothea	Chief of extension and public affair office	-	Project Office in FA
15:00-15:30	Mr. Sron Sophal	Deputy Chief of Legislation and Litigation Office	Computer Information System Officer	Project Office in FA
15:30-16:00	Mr. Loung Chantanaroth	Staff of Mekong FA Inspectorate	Data Record Officer	Project Office in FA
16:00-17:00	H.E. Chheng Kimsun	Delegate of Government and Chief of Forestry Administration	-	FA Headquarter

Annex 4

Field Visit Program

11-13 June 2015

Kampong Thom Province

11 June 2015 (Thursday)

- 07:00-10:30 Travel to Kampong Thom province
10:30-12:00 Visit stock of impounded illegal timbers and equipment, Thnal Beak Trabeng Reousei Kampong Svay District, Kampong Thom province
12:00 -14:30 Lunch
14:30-17:00 Meeting with Kampong Thom FA Cantonment staff, Kampong Thom town
17:00 Overnight in Kampong Thom town

12 June 2015 (Friday)

- 07:00-12:00 Meeting with the local authority and Kbal Bei Forestry Community, Kbal Bei Village, Tipor Commune, Santuk District, Kampong Thom province
12:00-14:00 Lunch
14:00-18:00 Travel to Kratie province
18:00 Overnight in Kratie town

Kratie Province

13 June 2015 (Saturday)

- 08:00-11:00 Meeting with the Kratie FA Cantonment staff, Kratie town
11:00-11:30 Visit to the Kratie Division office, Kratie town
11:30-12:30 Lunch
12:30-13:30 Visit stock of impounded illegal timbers and equipment located in Phsar Veng Village, Kratie Commune, Kratie City, Kratie province
13:30-16:00 Meeting with the local authority and Khan Tout Forestry Community, Khan Tout Village, Khan Tout Commune, Chetr Borei District, Kratie province
16:00-17:00 Visit Snoul Forestry Administration Triage, Phsar Snoul Village, Snoul Commune, Snoul District, Kratie province
17:00-21:30 Travel to Phnom Penh

Annex 5

List of Documents Reviewed

1. Pre-project Document - Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia, ITTO Project PPD 128/06 Rev. 1 (F).
2. Detailed Work Plan - Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia, ITTO Project PPD 128/06 Rev. 1 (F).
3. Report of the Forest Law Enforcement and Governance (FLEG) Workshop held to Discuss Action Plan, Phnom Penh, Cambodia, 13 September 2007.
4. Proceedings of the Workshop on Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia, Phnom Penh, Cambodia, 2 November 2007.
5. Final Pre-Project Technical Report - Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia, ITTO Project PPD 128/06 Rev. 1 (F), Phnom Penh, Cambodia, December 2007.
6. Pre-Project Completion Report - Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia, ITTO Project PPD 128/06 Rev. 1 (F), Phnom Penh, Cambodia, December 2007.
7. Manual for Project Monitoring, Review, Reporting and Evaluation, GI Series 14, Third Edition, ITTO, 2009.
8. Project Document - Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia, ITTO Project PD 493/07 Rev. 1 (F).
9. Proceedings of the Launching Ceremony of the ITTO Project PD 493/07 Rev. 1 (F) - Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia, Phnom Penh, Cambodia, 4 March 2009.
10. Report on Evaluation of Existing Human Resources of Local Forestry Administration for the Training Needs, Phnom Penh, Cambodia, March 2009.
11. Forest Law Enforcement Training Program, 2010, ITTO Project PD 493/07 Rev. 1 (F).
12. National Forest Program, 2010-2029, Cambodia, 18 October 2010.
13. Quality Assurance and Product Verification of the 2010 Forest Cover Assessment in Cambodia, Geographic Resource Analysis Science (GRAS) A/S, December 2010.
14. Cambodia Forest Cover 2010, ITTO Project PD 493/07 Rev. 1 (F), October 2011.
15. Technical Report of the ITTO Project PD 493/07 Rev. 1 (F) - Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia, June 2012.
16. Completion Report of the ITTO Project PD 493/07 Rev. 1 (F) - Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia, June 2012.
17. Project Proposal - Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia, ITTO Project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F).
18. Project Proposal - Sustainable Forest Management through REDD+ Mechanisms In Kampong Thom Province, ITTO Project PD 740/14 Rev.2 (F).
19. Community Forestry Statistics in Cambodia 2013, Cambodia, June 2013.

Annex 6

List of Participants

Ex-post Evaluation of the ITTO Project PD493/07 Rev.1 (F) Phnom Penh, 17 June 2015

No.	Name	Position
1.	H.E. Dr. Chea Sam Ang	Deputy Director General of Forestry Administration (FA)
2.	Mr. Eang Savet	Project Coordinator, PD493/07 Rev.1 (F)
3.	Mr. Suon Sovann	Deputy Director of Legislation and Law Enforcement Department
4.	Mr. Bun Rada	Deputy Director of Forest Industry and International Cooperation Department
5.	Mr. Dy Sokhom	Chief of Preah Sihanouk FA Cantonment
6.	Mr. Chhay Saran	Chief of Pursat FA Cantonment
7.	Mr. Chorng Tol	Chief of Monitoring and Evaluation Office
8.	Mrs. Sar Sophyra	Deputy Chief of Watershed and Forest Cover Assessment Office
9.	Mr. Ea Vanna	Deputy Chief of States Property Office
10.	Mr. Sron Sophal	Deputy Chief of Legislation and Litigation Office
11.	Mr. Nup Sothea	Chief of Extension and Public Affair Office
12.	Mr. Prak Sambo	Chief of Chhlong FA Division
13.	Mr. Khin Vannak	Deputy Chief of Sandan FA Division
14.	Mr. Heng Kamech	Chief of Baray FA Triage
15.	Mr. Sok Srun	Coordinator of TWG-FR
16.	Mr. Hang Cham Reun	Staff of Legislation and Law Enforcement Department
17.	Mr. Heng Vilong	Staff of Legislation and Law Enforcement Department
18.	Mr. Vong San	Staff of Legislation and Law Enforcement Department
19.	Mr. Sokkheng Tarapong	Staff of Legislation and Law Enforcement Department
20.	Mr. Loung Chantanaroth	Staff of Mekong FA Inspectorate
21.	Mr. Oun Pognak Theary	ITTO project officer, PD673/12 Rev.1 (F)
22.	Ms. Hau Sovanmony	ITTO project officer, PD673/12 Rev.1 (F)

Annex 7

Logical Framework Matrix

Project Elements	Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions
Development Objective To contribute to implementation of the government's policy platform in combating illegal logging, forest land clearing and encroachment	Frequency of illegal activities are reduced Area illegal felled is reduced	Reports by the Forestry Administration and satellite imagery studies Monitoring visits	National forestry policy maintains emphasis on maintaining forest cover and government funding is adequate
Specific Objective 1 To strengthen capacities for forest law enforcement and governance	FA human resources and facilities are sufficient to operate to suppress illegal forest activities	Regular flow of reports	No interference with Forestry Administration activities by external agencies
Specific Objective 2 To develop tools to enable effective suppression of illegal forest activities	Forestry Administration adopts procedures developed	Documented reports of use of methodologies in Forestry Administration reports	Operational funding available
Output 1.1 Appropriate facilities in place (available)	Evidence of purchase and installation of equipment	List of equipment installed	Equipment available at price to meet budget
Output 1.2 Forest law enforcement training implemented	Courses conducted to train the local Forestry Administration staff	Forestry Administration reports on evidential materials handling	Assistance received from relevant authorities
Output 2.1 Effective monitoring and documentation of illegal forest practices	Forestry Administration reports showing increased level of activity and decreased level of offending	CTS reports and satellite imagery reports	Funding available for operations
Output 2.2 Effective judicial processing	Time for cases to proceed through courts decreased	Number of court verdicts issued Decrease in backlog of cases before courts	Judicial institutions cooperate with Forestry Administration and do not obstruct implementation
Output 2.3 Effective extension function	Increased public awareness of forest law	Monitoring visit	Positive stakeholder involvement

Country Management Response to ITTO Ex-Post Evaluation

Project Title: **Strengthening Capacity of Forest Law Enforcement and Governance in Cambodia** (Cambodia)
Project ID: **PD 493/07 Rev.1 (F)**

A) Overall Response to the Evaluation:

The ex-post evaluation report is a well-written document. It presents the findings in a clear, balanced and objectives manner; draws meaningful conclusions consistent with the findings and make realistic, useful and fruitful recommendations. The evaluator was good in communication and prepared the overview comprehensively.

**Evaluation Report
Recommendations***

B) Response to recommendations

(e.g. 'accept', 'partially accept' or 'reject' – please provide a brief explanation)

For the Forestry Administration/Executing Agency

Recommendation 1

Revise and update the four training modules periodically to reflect new tools and techniques in forest crimes investigation, intelligence and evidence gathering, etc.

Accept

It would be considered as input for improving the developed training modules..

Recommendation 2

Initiate actions to install the CTS, including appropriate equipment and trained FA staff, in the other provinces of Cambodia, taking cognizance of the further work on the system by the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled "Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia".

Accept

We would consider installing the CTS and try our best to conduct more training of FA staff in the other provinces by using existing resources and seeking support from donors.

Recommendation 3

Provide additional training of trainers on the Criminal Code Procedure so as to enable the FA staff to have the knowledge and skills for processing forest crime cases; and in the short term, engage a national legal consultant to advise the FA on outstanding forest crime cases for follow-up actions.

Accept

We would collaborate with the Ministry of Justice to conduct additional training of trainers on the Criminal Code procedure, and would also consider engaging a national legal consultant to assist the local FA for follow-up actions with the courts.

Recommendation 4

Establish permanent joint coordination mechanisms between the FA Cantonments and the Royal Prosecutors and Judges to resolve forest crimes cases that were

Accept

The need to strengthen coordination with them was recognized. It would be conveyed to the FA Cantonments to establish permanent joint coordination mechanisms with Provincial Prosecutors and Judges to solve forest crime cases in the courts.

submitted to the courts by the FA Cantonments.	
Recommendation 5 Develop incentive schemes for local communities to further gain their support to assist the FA in curbing illegal forest activities and to contribute to enhancing sustainable forest management, taking cognizance of the further work on improving their livelihoods and welfare by the current ITTO project PD 673/12 Rev.1 (F) entitled "Strengthening the Capacity in Forest Law Enforcement and Governance of the Permanent Forest Estates in Kratie and Mondulkiri Provinces of Cambodia".	<i>Accept</i> <i>The incentive schemes for local communities are being implemented by the current ITTO project PD673/12 Rev.1 (F) in the two target provinces (Mondulkiri and Kratie provinces). It would expand its lessons learnt to the other communities in Cambodia.</i>
Recommendation 6 Address more explicitly forest governance on the ways and manner by which officials and institutions acquire and exercise authority in the management of forest resources, which encompasses policies, institutions and processes.	<i>Accept</i> <i>It would be considered as input for developing the FA work plan in accordance with the National Forest Program (2010-2029) under Program 3: Forest Law Enforcement and Governance.</i>

(signed)

Eang Savet,
Project Coordinator of PD493/07 Rev.1 (F)
Forestry Administration of Cambodia

Date: 15 July 2015

* * *