



**INTERNATIONAL TROPICAL
TIMBER COUNCIL**

**COMMITTEE ON
REFORESTATION AND FOREST MANAGEMENT**

Distr.
GENERAL

CRF(XLIV)/13
17 December 2010

Original: ENGLISH

FORTY-FOURTH SESSION
13-18 December 2010
Yokohama, Japan

**REPORT TO THE INTERNATIONAL TROPICAL TIMBER COUNCIL FROM
THE FORTY- FOURTH SESSION OF THE COMMITTEE ON
REFORESTATION AND FOREST MANAGEMENT**

Table of Contents

	Page
Report	1
Annex 1 Terms of Reference for a Meta Evaluation of Previously Evaluated ITTO Projects	21
Annex 2 Terms of Reference for Assessing Resources Required to Implement Sustainable Forest Management (Activity 13 of ITTO BWP for the years 2010-2011)	24

REPORT

Item 1 - Opening of the Session

The Forty-fourth Session of the Committees was opened on 13 December 2010 at the Joint Session of the Committee on Reforestation and Forest Management (CRF), the Committee on Economic Information and Market Intelligence (CEM), and the Committee on Forest Industry (CFI); chaired by Mr. Tabi Agyarko (Ghana), Chairperson of CRF. This Joint Session considered Agenda items 1, 3, 4, and 8 (A) and (C). Joint Session of the Technical Committees was also convened under the chairmanship of Ms. Carla Boonstra (Netherlands), Chairperson of CEM, to consider item 6. The subsequent meetings of the CRF were chaired by Mr. Tabi Agyarko (Ghana), assisted by Mr. Patrick Hardcastle (United Kingdom), Vice-Chair of CRF. The list of participants is presented in document ITTC(XLVI)/Info.2.

Item 2 - Adoption of Agenda and Organization of Work

The Agenda for the Committees as contained in documents CEM-CFI(XLIV)/1, CFA(XXV)/1/Rev.1 and CRF(XLIV)/1/Rev.1 was duly adopted.

Item 3 - Admission of Observers

The Committees admitted the observers listed in document ITTC(XLVI)/Info.3/Rev.1 as approved by the Council.

Item 4 - Report of the Expert Panel for Technical Appraisal of Project Proposals

The Committees noted the presentation made by Dr. Luiz Carlos Estraviz Rodriguez (Brazil), Chairman of the Expert Panel for Technical Appraisal of Project Proposals at its Thirty-ninth and Fortieth meetings held on 1-5 February and on 2-6 August 2010 in Yokohama, Japan as contained in documents ITTC/EP-39 and ITTC/EP-40, respectively. In summary, the report of the Expert Panel indicated:

- (i) a total number of 19 and 20 proposals appraised at its Thirty-ninth and Fortieth meetings respectively;
- (ii) a total number of 5 proposals (26% of proposals evaluated) comprising 5 projects were accorded category 1 rating at the Thirty-ninth meeting and a total number of 6 proposals (30% of proposals evaluated) comprising 5 projects and 1 pre-project were accorded category 1 rating at the Fortieth meeting;
- (iii) two (2) out of the 5 proposals accorded category 1 rating during the Thirty-ninth meeting and 6 out of the 6 proposals accorded category 1 rating at the Fortieth meeting were new proposals;
- (iv) eight (8) proposals appraised during the Thirty-ninth meeting and 9 proposals during the Fortieth meeting were sent back to proponents for revision and six (6) proposals appraised during the Thirty-ninth meeting and 5 proposals during the Fortieth meeting were recommended not to be approved by the Committees.

Dr. Estraviz Rodriguez presented the general comments made by the Expert Panel at its Thirty-ninth and Fortieth meetings directed mainly to the ITTO focal point in each member country, as follows:

- Ensure that proposals are assessed at the national level with regard to the country's priorities and to the relevance to ITTO objectives and in conformity with guidelines provided by the third Edition of the ITTO Manual for Project Formulation (GI Series 13).
- Play an active role to ensure that high quality proposals are submitted and a clearinghouse mechanism and proper monitoring and evaluation mechanism are in place.
- Carefully screen the project proposals using the table of contents suggested in the manual as a checklist for this purpose.
- Receive a copy of the Panel reports on the Technical Appraisal of project proposals, and reply to the Secretariat on how the specific recommendations are being dealt with.
- Some proponents further seemingly applied a top-down approach, which would indicate that stakeholders have not been involved in the process and undermines the sustainability of the project.
- Stakeholder analyses in many proposals have not taken into account the gender dimension as addressed by the Manual.

- Although improvement of livelihoods has been mentioned by some project proposals, these issues were only mentioned as catchwords without further elaboration of methods and expected livelihood outcomes (*Sustainable Livelihoods Approach*).
- For projects that stipulate international or regional cooperation, some proposals have not included letters from participating Countries. In these cases, letters from cooperating countries are mandatory.
- Some proposals have been submitted without defining mechanisms to ensure that project benefits will continue to exist after project completion.

Furthermore, Dr. Estraviz Rodriguez mentioned that among the most important aspects, two main components have driven the evaluations made by the Panel: i) stakeholders involvement during the elaboration and the implementation phases, ii) the logic used to structure the proposal, which strongly depends on, iii) the precise definition of the problem targeted by the project, and iv) the main causes and sub-causes of the problem

Dr. Estraviz Rodriguez also informed the Committees that a comprehensive scoring system had been developed to support the technical appraisal of each project proposal. Thoroughly tested and improved, with the participation of several members of the Panel, the scoring system had allowed the Panel to produce objective and consistent first evaluations, and had improved the Panel practice used to evaluate each proposal.

Dr. Estraviz Rodriguez further mentioned that the Project Formulation Manual promotes clear guidance regarding specific proposal components, the elaboration of a strong logical justification, and the identification of essential points that proponents must bear in mind in the course of Project formulation. But, the number of new projects fully complying with the guidelines provided by the manual was still proportionally lower, leading to further revisions (doubling the work of Panel and proponents), and furthermore, many proposals among those put into category 2, have applied only the format and failed to follow the detailed guidance provided by the Manual. Therefore, special attention is required from ITTO to support training sessions in countries where Language and project development capacity might still be problematic.

Item 5 – New Projects and Pre-Projects

The Committees noted the projects and pre-projects that were approved under the time-bound electronic no objection procedures to accept Expert Panel ratings and circulated to member countries pursuant to Decision 6(XLIII), following the recommendations of the Expert Panel at its Thirty-ninth and Fortieth Meetings as follows:

For Thirty-ninth Expert Panel		
PD/PPD NUMBER	TITLE	SUBMITTING COUNTRY
*PD 560/09 Rev.3 (F)	Conservation and Sustainable Management of Mangrove Forests of the Kouilou Coastal Area, with the Participation of Local Communities Established in this Area of Southern Congo (Republic of Congo)	Republic of Congo
PD 564/09 Rev.1 (F)	Production of an Educational Book Series on Mangroves for Sustainable Management and Utilization of Mangrove System (Japan)	Japan
PD 568/09 Rev.1 (F)	Developing Community-Based Sustainable Mangrove Management System for the Amanzuri and Ama Emissa River Estuaries in Ghana	Ghana

* Proposal approved with some delay after being revised to address the objection from Japan.

For Fortieth Expert Panel		
PD/PPD NUMBER	TITLE	SUBMITTING COUNTRY
PD 577/10 Rev.1 (F)	Management of the Emerald Triangle Protected Forests Complex to Promote Cooperation for Trans-boundary Biodiversity Conservation Between Thailand, Cambodia and Laos – Phase III (Thailand and Cambodia)	Thailand & Cambodia

PD 583/10 Rev.1 (F)	Restoring Sub-Humid Ecosystems in Southern Peru through Reforestation with <i>Caesalpinea spinosa</i>	Peru
PD 586/10 Rev.1 (F)	Operational Strategies for the Conservation of Tengkwang Genetic Diversity and for Sustainable Livelihood of Indigenous People in Kalimantan	Indonesia
PD 590/10 Rev.1 (F)	Integrated Fire Management in Rural Communities of Guatemala: Establishment of Pilot Sites for the Implementation of Sustainable Integrated Fire Management Practices	Guatemala
PPD 147/10 Rev.1 (F)	Zoning and Sustainable Development of the Minkebe Protected Area towards the Protection of Transboundary Conservation Corridors between Gabon, Cameroon and the Congo	Gabon

Noting that the ITTO budget of PD 577/10 (F) has been substantially increased in the revised proposal, the delegation of USA emphasized the need to improve the communication procedure for any revised proposals having substantial changes, under Item 13 - Other Business.

Item 6 – ITTO Annual Market Discussion -2010

The Committees noted the summary of the ITTO Annual Market Discussion – 2010, held in the Joint Session of All Committees on 15 December 2010, as contained in Appendix A of document CEM-CFI(XLIV)/6. The theme of the Market Discussion was “Innovations and Technologies in Wood-based Industries”. Ms. Carla Boonstra (Chairperson of CEM) chaired the meeting and Mr. Barney Chan (TAG Coordinator) served as the moderator of the Market Discussion.

The following feature presentations were made during the Market Discussion:

Prof. Gary Waugh University of Melbourne (Australia)	Global Challenges for the Forest Products Industries, Threats or Opportunities for the Tropical Timber Sector
Dr. Callum Hill Edinburgh Napier University (U.K.)	Wood Modification
Dr. Antje Wahl FP Innovations (Canada)	Markets for Modified Wood Products, Threats or Opportunities for the Tropical Timber Sector
Prof. Ivan Tomaselli STCP Engenharia de Projetos Ltda. (Brazil)	Adoption of Technical Innovation – Experiences of the Latin American Timber Sector

Item 7 - Report on Completed Projects and Pre-projects

The Secretariat informed the Committee that the completed projects and pre-projects are described in document CRF(XLIV)/2, “Report on Completed Projects and Pre-projects in the Field of Reforestation and Forest Management”.

The Committee then proceeded to review the following completed projects:

7.1 Completed Projects

1) PD 27/99 Rev.2 (F) Pilot Project for the Sustained Management of the So'o Lala Forest - Phase II (Cameroon)

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Project Completion Report, several Technical Reports and acceptable Project Final Financial Audit Report. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

- 2) **PD 105/01 Rev.3 (F) Towards Sustainable Timber Production in Ghana: Stage I. Improving Shoot Borer Resistance and Developing Silvicultural Systems to Maximize Mahogany Plantation Success (Ghana)**

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Project Completion Report, several Technical Reports and acceptable Project Final Financial Audit Report. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

- 3) **PD 156/02 Rev.3 (F) Conservation and Reforestation of Threatened Mangrove Forest Areas along the Pacific Coast of Panama – Phases I and II (Panama)**

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the project Completion Report, several technical reports and the Final Financial Audit Report. In addition, a presentation on the project's achievements had been given by the Executing Agency at the CRF's previous session. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

- 4) **PD 217/03 Rev.2 (F) Establishing a Cooperative Framework Between ODEF and the Communities Living in the Eto-Lilicope Forest Complex for the Sustainable Participatory Management of this Complex (Togo)**

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Project Completion Report, several Technical Reports and acceptable Project Final Financial Audit Report. In view of the importance of the project results, the delegate from Togo briefly presented the main outcomes of the project. Members praised the important work made under the project and the Committee commended the presentation given on the project achievements. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

- 5) **PD 237/03 Rev. 4 (F) Binational Conservation and Peace in the Condor Range Region, Ecuador-Peru – Phase II (Peruvian Component) (Peru)**

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the project Completion Report, several technical reports and the Final Financial Audit Report. Moreover, a presentation on the project's achievements was given by the Executing Agency at the International Conference on Biodiversity in Transboundary Tropical Forests organized by ITTO at Quito in July of this year. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

- 6) **PD 238/03 Rev.4 (F) Binational Conservation and Peace in the Condor Range Region, Ecuador-Peru (Ecuadorian Component), Phase II (Ecuador)**

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the project Completion Report, several technical reports and the Final Financial Audit Report. Moreover, a presentation on the project's achievements was given by the Executing Agency at the International Conference on Biodiversity in Transboundary Tropical Forests organized by ITTO at Quito in July of this year. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

- 7) **PD 256/03 Rev.1 (F) Alternative Mixed Plantation Systems and Restoration Strategies for Conservation and Sustainable Production of Native Timber Species in Ghana (Ghana)**

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Project Completion Report, several Technical Reports and acceptable Project Final Financial Audit Report. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

- 8) **PD 272/04 Rev.2 (F) Development of National Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Management of Congo Forest Based on ITTO Criteria and Indicators for SFM (Congo)**

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Project Completion Report, several Technical Reports and acceptable Project Final Financial Audit Report. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

9) PD 289/04 Rev.1 (F) Management of the Emerald Triangle Protected Forests Complex to promote cooperation for Transboundary Biodiversity Conservation between Thailand, Cambodia and Laos – Phase II (Thailand and Cambodia)

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Project Completion Report, several Technical Reports and Final Financial Audit Report. The delegations of Thailand and Cambodia made a presentation on the main outcomes of the project. The delegation of USA asked for clarification regarding linkage of the project with other relevant initiatives such as the Asian Development Bank's Mekong Biodiversity Corridors Initiative. She also questioned about the cooperation of the Executing Agency of Cambodia with relevant environmental societies in the country. The delegation of Malaysia underlined the potential risk of transboundary biodiversity conservation projects involving two or three countries. He also asked what could be done to improve corridors for migrating big animals in the Emerald Triangle Protected Forests Complex. The Committee was informed by the Secretariat and the delegations of Thailand and Cambodia that the project has tried to link with relevant biodiversity initiatives in the region in cooperation with environmental NGOs and that the third phase project would be implemented more closely with relevant initiatives and stakeholders to ensure the conservation objectives. The Committee noted the importance of enhancing the active engagement of stakeholders for biodiversity conservation to implement collaborative conservation efforts. The Committee decided to consider the project as completed.

10) PD 297/04 Rev.3 (F) Implementation of the Sustainable Forest Management Programme of the Iwokrama International Centre (Guyana)

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the project Completion Report, several technical reports and the Final Financial Audit Report. In addition, a presentation on the project's achievements was given by the Executing Agency at the World Forestry Congress in October 2009. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

11) PD 319/04 Rev.2 (F) Modular System of Forest Management in the Brazilian Amazon (Brazil)

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the project Completion Report, several technical reports and the Final Financial Audit Report. The Committee also noted and further commended the presentation given on the project achievements. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

12) PD 392/06 Rev.2 (F) Phase I: Regional Project to Promote Reduced Impact Logging in the Congo Basin (Gabon)

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Project Completion Report, several Technical Reports and acceptable Project Final Financial Audit Report. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

The Committee was informed about a special request from the Government of Gabon to exceptionally authorize the ex-post evaluation of the completed project PD 392/06 Rev.2 (F) in order to comply with the requirement of the Fortieth Expert Panel for technical appraisal of project proposals. It was recommended to carry out an ex-post evaluation of this project prior to the reformulation of the project proposal PD 579/10 (F), submitted as its second phase, in order to take advantage of lessons learnt to be based on the findings of the evaluation of that Phase I project [PD 392/06 Rev.2 (F)]. The Committee had no objection to the special request from the Government of Gabon and authorized the ex-post evaluation of the completed project PD 392/06 Rev.2 (F) by an independent consultant.

13) PD 394/06 Rev.1 (F) Restoring the Ecosystem Functions of the Lake Toba Catchment Area through Community Development and Local Capacity Building for Forest and Land Rehabilitation (Indonesia)

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Project Completion Report, several Technical Reports and Final Financial Audit Report. The delegation of Indonesia made a presentation on the main outcomes of the project, highlighting the importance of Lake Toba Catchment Area in generating various environmental services. The Committee decided to consider the project as completed.

14) PD 423/06 Rev.2 (F) Training on Demonstration, Application and Extension of ITTO Manual on Restoring Forest Landscapes In Tropics of China (China)

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Project Completion Report, several Technical Reports and Final Financial Audit Report. The Secretariat briefly introduced the main outcomes of the project. The Committee decided to consider the project as completed.

15) PD 432/06 Rev.2 (F) Promoting Adoption of Sustainable Forest Management in The Brazilian Amazon (Brazil)

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the project Completion Report, several technical reports and the Final Financial Audit Report. The Committee also noted and further commended the presentation given on the project achievements. The Committee therefore decided to consider the project as completed.

7.2 Completed Pre-projects

None

Item 8 - Ex-post Evaluation

(A) Reports on Ex-post Evaluation of Projects

The Committees were informed that the ex-post evaluation of the three projects grouped under the theme of **Criteria and Indicators of Sustainable Forest Management**, selected by the Committee at its Forty-third Session, had been completed:

Thematic Group Evaluation: Criteria and Indicators of Sustainable Forest Management

- | | |
|---------------------|--|
| PD 195/03 Rev.2 (F) | To Establish a National Monitoring Information System for the Effective Conservation and Sustainable Management of Thailand's Forest Resources |
| PD 225/03 Rev.1 (F) | Adoption and Implementation of an Appropriate System of Criteria and Indicators for the Philippines |
| PD 389/05 Rev.2 (F) | Application of the Internal Monitoring of SFM Performance at Forest Management Unit Level (Indonesia) |

The Committees took note of the presentation of the synthesis of the ex-post evaluation as contained in document CRF(XLV)/4 by the Team Leader of the evaluation team, Dr. Don Wijewardana during the Joint Session of the Committees. He highlighted the recommendations for similar projects in the future and the improvements of project management. These included: C&I are at the heart of all ITTO work since it is the key internationally recognized tool for achieving SFM; experiences in the implementation of the three projects are enormously useful to members; more similar projects are absolutely necessary; and at least primary stakeholders need to be involved in all stages of a project. The Committees discussed a need to develop new indicators for mangrove and noted the importance of timing for conducting ex-post evaluation since staff moved on after completion. The Committees commended the consultants for their report and presentation.

The Committees were further informed that the ex-post evaluation of the four projects grouped under the theme of **Biodiversity Conservation**, selected by the Committee at its Forty-third Session, had been completed:

Thematic Group Evaluation: Biodiversity Conservation

- | | |
|--------------------|---|
| PD 14/00 Rev.5 (F) | Integrated Plan for the Consolidation of the Bagre Highlands Biological Corridor, Province of Darien (Panama) |
| PD 17/00 Rev.3 (F) | Conservation and Development in the Natural Protected Areas System of Tambopata (Peru) – Madidi (Bolivia) |

- PD 44/00 Rev.3 (F) The Implementation of a Community-based Transboundary Management Plan for the Betung Kerihun National Park, West Kalimantan, Indonesia, Phase II
- PD 224/03 Rev.1 (F) Transboundary Biodiversity Conservation: The Pulong Tau National Park, Sarawak State, Malaysia, Phase I

The Committees took note of the presentation of the synthesis of the ex-post evaluation as contained in document CRF(XLIV)/5 by the Team Leader of the evaluation team, Dr. Jeffrey Sayer, during the Joint Session of the Committees.

The Committees requested the Secretariat to ensure that the ex-post evaluation findings be taken into account in the formulation and implementation of new projects in the area of **Biodiversity Conservation**. The Committee commended the report presented by the consultant and also requested the Secretariat to ensure its dissemination.

The Committees were further informed that the ex-post evaluation of the four projects grouped under the theme of **Forest Plantations/Growth and Yield**, selected by the Committee at its Forty-third Session, had been completed:

Thematic Group Evaluation: Forest Plantations/Growth and Yield

- PD 22/98 Rev.1 (F) Development of Teak Cloning and Establishment of Industrial Plantations (Côte d'Ivoire)
- PD 41/00 Rev.3 (F,M) Model Development to Establish Commercial Plantation of Dipterocarps (Indonesia)
- PD 53/00 Rev.3 (F) Implementation of a Permanent Network of Stands Dynamics Monitoring Plots for the Gazetted Forests of Côte d'Ivoire
- PD 386/05 Rev.1 (F) Technological Development for the Production of Planting Materials to Support Sustainable Plantation of Bali Indigenous Species through Community Participation (Indonesia)

The Committees took note of the presentation of the synthesis of the ex-post evaluation as contained in document CRF(XLIV)/6 by the Team Leader of the evaluation team, Dr. Hosny El Lakany, during the Joint Session of the Committees. In his presentation, he mainly highlighted the following:

- The development and specific objectives of the four projects were substantially achieved; and
- The project sustainability was ensured for the two projects implemented in Indonesia through the use of appropriate mechanisms while being doubtful for those implemented by in Côte d'Ivoire.

The Committees requested the Secretariat to ensure that the ex-post evaluation findings be taken into account in the formulation and implementation of new projects in the area of Forest Plantations/Growth and Yield. The Committee commended the report presented by the consultant and also requested the Secretariat to ensure its wide dissemination.

The Committees were further informed that the evaluation of Individual Project Evaluation PD 289/04 Rev.1 (F) had also been completed:

Individual Project Evaluation

- PD 289/04 Rev. 1 (F) Management of the Emerald Triangle Protected Forests Complex to promote cooperation for Transboundary Biodiversity Conservation between Thailand, Cambodia and Laos – Phase II (Thailand and Cambodia)

The Committees took note of the presentation of the synthesis of the evaluation as contained in document CRF(XLIV)/7 by Dr. James Gasana during the Joint Session of the Committees.

The Committee requested the Secretariat to ensure that the evaluation findings be taken into account in the formulation and implementation of the third phase project. The Committees commended the report presented by the consultant and also requested the Secretariat to ensure its dissemination.

The Committees were further informed that the ex-post evaluation of the two projects grouped under the theme of **Geographic Information System/Demonstrations Areas**, selected by the Committee at its Forty-third Session, will be carried out in 2011 and reported at the next CRF Session:

Thematic Group Evaluation: Geographic Information System/Demonstrations Areas

PD 57/99 Rev.2 (F) Sustainable Management of Production Forests at the Commercial Scale in the Brazilian Amazon – Phase I

PD 176/02 Rev.1 (F) Use of Remote Sensing Technology and Information Systems to Support Forestry Legislation Monitoring in the Republic of Congo

(B) Selection of Projects for Ex-post Evaluation

The Committees recalled that at its previous session it requested the Secretariat to make the necessary arrangements for the conduct of the ex-post evaluations before the 45th Committee Session, and also prepare an updated “Shortlist of Completed Projects Relevant for Ex-post Evaluation in the Field of Reforestation and Forest Management” for the 45th Session, which should include all completed projects since 2008 not previously selected for ex-post evaluation.

(C) Meta-Evaluation of ITTO Ex-Post Evaluations

As requested by the CRF at its Forty-third Session, the Secretariat drafted a set of Terms of Reference (TOR) for a Meta-Evaluation of ITTO ex-post evaluations and submitted it to the Joint Session of the Committees. As the delegations of Switzerland, USA, Peru and others intervened and suggested enhancement of the Draft TOR, the Chairperson decided to establish a small informal working group to further compile all comments and suggestions made and incorporate these into a final draft TOR for the consideration and approval of the Joint Session of the Committees. The small informal working group, composed of delegates of Brazil, Cameroon, Ghana, Guatemala, Indonesia, Malaysia, Peru and USA, and chaired by the delegate of the UK, met to discuss the draft TOR which were subsequently enhanced. The draft TOR was resubmitted it to the CRF, and some delegates provided additional comments and suggestions. The final outcome and definitive text of the TOR is attached in Appendix 1 to this report. The CRF further decided that the budget for the evaluation should not exceed US\$300,000.00 and that funds should be drawn from the Pooled Sub-Accounts for Ex-Post Evaluation.

Item 9 - Review of Implementation of Approved Projects and Pre-projects

9.1 Project Work in Progress

The Committee took note of a status report [document CRF(XLIV)/3] by the Secretariat on the 81 projects, in the field of Reforestation and Forest Management, that have been approved by the Council, and which are either: A) in the process of implementation (57), B) awaiting the signing of an Agreement (2), C) projects awaiting financing (19), or D) falling under the sunset provision since the last Session (3).

The Committee noted the reports on the progress of these projects in the above document. In view of the desire of the Committee to further streamline its work in accordance with Council Decision 4(XXV) Annex A, Section VI.1, the Committee requested the Secretariat and Members to limit the reporting and discussion during the Session to those projects that are:

- having implementation problems;
- requiring additional funds;
- requesting extension in time of more than 6 months beyond the original duration of the project; or
- requesting essential major modifications of the work plan and budget.

The Secretariat informed that projects that have been declared completed in previous Committee Sessions but are still pending final financial audits were re-inserted in this session as projects under implementation. The Secretariat also informed that, as per ITTO regulations, Executing Agencies pending submission of financial audits do not qualify for further disbursements in any other ITTO projects they may be

implementing. The Committee urged all Executing Agencies in this situation to submit financial audits as soon as possible in order to comply with the regulations.

The Committee then proceeded to discuss the issues associated with a number of projects. Details of these discussions are as follows:

(A) Projects under implementation

*** Completion report received, pending financial audit**

**** Reported as completed at previous CRF sessions, but still pending final financial audit**

1) **PD 2/93 Rev.1 (F) Integrated Pilot Management of the Ngoua II Forest-North - Phase I: Preparation of the Management Plan (Congo)

The Committee was informed that this project was reported as completed at a previous CRF session and documented as such in the document CRF(XXXVIII)/3, but it is still pending the final financial audit, since February 2006. The Committee was also informed by the Delegation of the Republic of Congo that all key financial documents were destroyed during the civil war in that country, from 1997 to 2000. Therefore, it is impossible to carry out the final financial audit report for this completed report. The Committee took note of the information and asked the Secretariat and the Executing Agency to find the appropriate way to address this issue and report to the Committee at its next session in 2011.

2) *PD 55/98 Rev.3 (F) Evaluation of Mangrove Forests in the North-east of the Orinoco Delta Region in Venezuela with a View to Sustainable Forest Utilization (Venezuela)

The Committee took note that the project completion report, together with a few technical reports as well as other products and means of verification had been submitted and were currently being assessed by ITTO's Regional Officer for Latin America in Brasilia. The Committee further observed that the Executing Agency MARN manifested that the third and last tranche of ITTO funds for the project in the amount of US\$ 80,000 was no longer needed to complete the project as the required costs had already been covered by counterpart funds, and that the project's Final Audit was initiated in October 2010 and is to be submitted to ITTO shortly. As such, the Committee looks forward to seeing this project to be reported as completed, including its final financial audit, at the next Session of the Committee.

3) PD 20/99 Rev.2 (F) Establishment and Management of Production-Protection Community Forests in Lower and Middle Atrato, Department of Choco, Colombia (Colombia)

The Committee took note that some of the project's activities had been delayed and that the Executing Agency may need to request an extension in time without additional budget, as the project was slated to have been completed in December 2010. In this light, the Committee recommended ITTO to continue providing the Executing Agency with guidance so as to regularize the project's administrative situation before the Secretariat and also closely monitor the project with a view to seeing it get back on track. Moreover, it also urged the Executing Agency to immediately apply for an extension, without additional funds, in order to successfully complete the project and further submit a formal request with a justification to the Secretariat for the aforementioned extension in time, together with any required budget amendments and an updated detailed Work Plan and Yearly Plan of operations in order to successfully complete the project's activities.

4) PD 32/99 Rev.2 (F) Productive Forest Management for the Rural Reserve Area of Guaviare (Colombia)

Following a presentation made by the director of the Executing Agency to the Committee, it was noted that the project will complete all its field activities by year-end and further submit the completion report and other relevant technical documents to the Secretariat soon thereafter. The Committee hereby approved the project request for a budget neutral extension until December 2010.

5) PD 62/99 Rev.3 (F) Reforestation Pilot Project for the Recovery of Degraded Areas in the Medium Doce River Region, State of Minas Gerais, Brazil (Brazil)

The Committee recalled that this project after some difficulties in the past, had come to normal execution although some delay still persists. The Committee recommended special attention be paid during the next meeting of the Project Steering Committee, slated for the first quarter of 2011, so as to carefully assess the project's current situation, and its current compliance with ITTO rules for project implementation. It also recommended a review and update of the YPO in order to successfully achieve its objectives. The Executing Agency may also consider applying for an extension, without additional funds, in order to successfully complete the project.

6) PD 28/00 Rev.2 (F) Integrated Management of Community Forests in the Valley of Mefou and Afamba (Central Province of Cameroon) (Cameroon)

The Committee was informed that the project activities were completed and the project completion report and final financial audit report were due since September 2009 and October 2009 respectively. The Secretariat urged the Executing Agency to submit these two reports at its earliest convenience. The Committee took note of the information and urged the Executing Agency to submit the project completion report and final financial audit report by end of March 2011.

7) PD 37/00 Rev.1 (F) Operational Strategy for Sustainable Forestry Development with Community Participation in India (India)

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Project Completion Report and several Technical Reports. The delegation of India made a presentation on the main outcomes of the project, highlighting the development of site specific indicators and their implementation at the project sites. The Committee decided to consider the project as completed, upon the reception of a satisfactory Final Financial Audit Report by the Secretariat and requested that the Executing Agency should submit it to the Secretariat in due course.

8) **PD 53/00 Rev.3 (F) Implementation of a Permanent Network of Stands Dynamics Monitoring Plots for the Gazetted Forests of Côte d'Ivoire (Côte d'Ivoire)

The Committee was informed that this project was reported as completed at a previous CRF session and documented as such in the document CRF(XLIII)/2, but it is still pending the final financial audit, since October 2009. The Secretariat urged the Executing Agency to submit this report at its earliest convenience. The Committee took note of the information and urged the Executing Agency to submit the project final financial audit report by end of March 2011.

9) **PD 63/01 Rev.2 (F) Assessment and Management of Mangrove Forests in Egypt for Sustainable Utilization and Development (Egypt)

The Committee was informed that this project was reported as completed at a previous CRF session and documented as such in the document CRF(XLIII)/2, but it is still pending the project final financial audit, since August 2009. The Secretariat urged the Executing Agency to submit this report at its earliest convenience. The Committee took note of the information and urged the Executing Agency to submit the project final financial audit report by end of March 2011.

10) PD 66/01 Rev.1 (F) Establishment of the Mengamé-Minkébé Transboundary Gorilla Sanctuary (MMGS) at the Cameroon-Gabon Border (Cameroon)

The Committee was informed that the project activities were completed and the project completion report and final financial audit report were due since September 2008 and October 2008 respectively. The Secretariat urged the Executing Agency to submit these two reports at its earliest convenience. The Committee took note of the information and urged the Executing Agency to submit the project completion report and final financial audit report by end of March 2011.

11) PD 142/02 Rev.2 (F) Sustainable Production of National Forests under the “Regime of Forest Concessions” (Brazil)

The Committee was informed on the results of the 6th Project Steering Committee Meeting that was held in Brasília in November 2010. The project has been slowly progressing but satisfactorily concluded various activities in support to the formulation of the management plans of three national forests (FLONA) in Brazil (Altamira, Caxiuanã and Itaituba), which constitute the main result of the project. The Committee decided to approve a request of the Executing Agency for a budget neutral extension of the project until March 2012, upon submission of relevant documentation including updated Yearly Plan of Operations.

12) *PD 197/03 Rev.2 (F) Support for the Implementation of a Sustainable Forest Development Master Plan in Eco-Floristic Area IV, Togo (Togo)

The Committee was informed that the project completion report was submitted in January 2010, but the project final financial audit report is pending since February 2010. The Secretariat asked the Executing Agency to submit this report at its earliest convenience. The Committee took note of the information and asked the Executing Agency to submit the project final financial audit report by end of March 2011.

13) *PD 200/03 Rev.4 (F) The Establishment of Seed Orchards for Selected Indigenous Tree Species in Sabah, Malaysia (Malaysia)

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Project Completion Report and several Technical Reports. The Secretariat briefly introduced the main outcomes of the project, highlighting the establishment of seed orchards for 13 indigenous tree species. The Committee decided to consider the project as completed, upon the reception of a satisfactory Final Financial Audit Report by the Secretariat and requested that the Executing Agency should submit it to the Secretariat in due course.

14) PD 248/03 Rev.4 (F) Antimary Forest Management Regional Training Centre (Brazil)

The Committee was informed on the results of the 4th Project Steering Committee Meeting that was held in Antimary Forest Reserve in November 2010. The project is advancing satisfactorily and to consolidate its achievements the Committee decided to approve a request of the Executing Agency for a budget neutral extension of the project until December 2011, upon submission of relevant documentation including updated Yearly Plan of Operations and revised budget.

15) PD 276/04 Rev.2 (F) Revised World Atlas of Mangrove for Conservation and Restoration of Mangrove Ecosystems (Global-Japan)

The Secretariat made a presentation on the English version of the Mangrove Atlas, which had been published in mid-2010. The implementing agency (ISME) informed the Committee following this presentation of efforts made to fund publication of the Atlas in French and Spanish. A request had been made to ITTO through the no-objection process for additional funding of \$50,000 for the project to allow printing and distribution of the French and Spanish versions. The Committee endorsed this request and asked donors to consider it positively.

16) *PD 324/04 Rev.3 (F) Sustainable Management of Tropical Forest Resources through Stakeholder Agreements in Traditional Owned Areas of Papua New Guinea (PNG)

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Project Completion Report and several Technical Reports. The delegation of PNG made a presentation on the main outcomes of the project, highlighting the development of land use management plans and conservation agreements with six Almami clans in the Adelbert Range. The Committee decided to consider the project as completed, upon the reception of a satisfactory Final Financial Audit Report by the Secretariat and requested that the Executing Agency should submit it to the Secretariat in due course.

17) PD 346/05 Rev.2 (F) Conservation and Recovery of Degraded Land in Family Agriculture Units in the Eastern Brazilian Amazon (Brazil)

The Committee took note of the Executing Agency's request for an extension in order to successfully complete the project's activities. In this light, the Committee endorsed an extension of the project until the end of December 2011, without additional funds, as per the written request and justification, including budgetary modifications, submitted by the Executing Agency.

18) PD 349/05 Rev.2 (F) Criteria for the Management of Mangrove and Flood Forests in the Central Coastal Plains of Veracruz, Mexico: A Community Management Tool (Mexico)

The Committee noted that the project will complete all its field activities and achieve its outputs during the first half of 2011 and further submit the completion report and other relevant technical documents to the Secretariat soon thereafter.

19) PD 350/05 Rev.3 (F) Production Systems and Integrated Management of Shoot-borers for the Successful Establishment of Meliaceae Plantations in the Yucatan Peninsula and Veracruz, Mexico (Mexico)

The Committee noted that the project will complete all its field activities and achieve its outputs during the first half of 2011 and further submit the completion report and other relevant technical documents to the Secretariat soon thereafter.

20) PD 351/05 Rev.1 (F) Criteria and Indicators for the Evaluation of Tropical Forest Management Sustainability in Mexico (Southeastern Coastal Plains: Gulf of Mexico and Yucatan Peninsula) (Mexico)

The Committee took note that some of the project's activities appear to have been delayed due to the participatory process of the C&I application at the "Ejido" level, and that the Executing Agency needed to regularize the project's situation with the Secretariat, particularly as regards the need for a written justification for an extension in time without additional funds, among others. In this light, the Committee urged the Executing Agency immediately apply for an extension, without additional funds, in order to successfully complete the project and further submit a formal request with a justification to the Secretariat for the aforementioned extension in time, together with any required budget amendments and an updated detailed Work Plan and Yearly Plan of operations in order to successfully complete the project's activities.

The Committee further recommended special attention be paid during the next meeting of the Project Steering Committee, slated for the first quarter of 2011, so as to carefully assess the project's current situation, its current compliance with ITTO rules for project implementation, and also review the updated YPO in order to successfully achieve its objectives.

21) PD 359/05 Rev.1 (F) Building Capacity to Develop and Implement Afforestation and Reforestation Projects under Clean Development Mechanism (AR-CDM) of the Kyoto Protocol in Tropical Forestry Sector (Global-Japan)

The Committee took note of the slow progress of developing AR-CDM Project Design Documents due to the complexity of the modalities of AR-CDM. In light of this, the Committee endorsed the extension of the project until August 2011 without additional funds.

22) PD 367/05 Rev.2 (F) Promotion of the Sustainable Management of Tropical Planted Forest in Congo's Tropical Forest Plantations (Republic of Congo)

The Committee was informed that the project activities were completed and the project completion report and final financial audit report were due since October 2010 and November 2010 respectively. The Secretariat asked the Executing Agency to submit these two reports at its earliest convenience. The Committee took note of the information and asked the Executing Agency to submit the project completion report and final financial audit report by end of March 2011.

23) PD 421/06 Rev.2 (F) Strengthening of the Production Chain for Timber from Forest Concessions and Other Forests under Management (Peru)

The Committee noted that the project will complete all its field activities shortly and carry out its last project steering committee meeting in January 2011 to discuss the products, outcomes and impacts of the project and the dissemination of these, and further submit the completion report and other relevant technical documents and means of verification to the Secretariat soon thereafter. The Committee noted and further commended the formal presentation given on the project outcomes and achievements at this Session of the CRF.

24) PD 451/07 Rev.1 (F) Transboundary Biodiversity Conservation Area: The Pulong Tau National Park, Sarawak State, Malaysia - Phase II (Malaysia)

The Committee noted that the Executing Agency has submitted an extension proposal until the end of January 2012 with additional funds [CRF(XLIV)/12]. The delegation of Malaysia made a short presentation on the extensional proposal. The Committee endorsed the extension of the project until the end of 2011 with the request for additional funds as specified in document CRF(XLIV)/12.

25) PD 507/08 Rev.1 (F) Development of the National Reforestation Policy and Afforestation Strategy Consistent with Liberia 3C-Approach (Liberia)

The project suffered a set back with the passing away of the ITTO National Focal Point in Liberia in mid 2010, but regained momentum and is gradually getting back to track on the planned activities. A second PSC meeting is scheduled for January 2011 in Monrovia to take stock and provide further guidance for project implementation.

(B) Projects awaiting implementation agreement

1) PD 450/07 Rev.2 (F,I) Capacity Building for CDM Forestry in the Framework of SFM Emphasizing Community Forests and Poverty Alleviation in Ghana (Ghana)

The Committee took note that the agreement was finalized and forwarded to the Government of Ghana, for the signature process, on 25 November 2010.

2) PD 470/07 Rev.1 (F) Development and Implementation of Criteria and Indicators for Sustainable Management of Planted Forests and Community Forests (Thailand)

The delegation of Thailand informed the Committee that signing the project agreement would be finalized by January 2011.

(C) Projects awaiting financing

The Committee noted that nineteen (19) projects approved at earlier Sessions are still awaiting funding, out of which four (4) will be sunset if funding is not secured before the next Session.

1) PD 452/07 Rev.3 (F) Sustainable Management of Production Forests at the Commercial Scale in the Brazilian Amazon – Phase II (Brazil)

The Committee noted that this project would have become Sunset during this Session, had the Government of Brazil not invoked the provision in Decision 2 (X) Annex 2 point 2 and resubmit a revised proposal to the Council for decision prior to the end of the validity period for review of the originally approved proposal. Moreover, for clarity, it is understood that the validity period of the third revision of this proposal begins at this session.

- 2) PD 454/07 Rev.3 (F) Community Forest Management: A Sustainable Alternative for the Maues State Forest, Amazonas State (Brazil)

The Committee noted that this project would have become Sunset during this Session, had the Government of Brazil not invoked the provision in Decision 2 (X) Annex 2 point 2 and resubmit a revised proposal to the Council for decision prior to the end of the validity period for review of the originally approved proposal. Moreover, for clarity, it is understood that the validity period of the third revision of this proposal begins at this session.

- 3) **PD 456/07 Rev.3 (F) Building the Capacities of Forestry Training Institutions Members of the Network of Central African Forestry and Environmental Training Institutions (RIFFEAC) for Providing SFM Training for Forest Concessions (ITTO)
- 4) PD 460/07 Rev.2 (F) Achieving Sustainable Management of Mangrove Forests in China through Local Capacity Building and Community Development – Phase II (China)
- 5) PD 467/07 Rev.4 (F) Generating an Ongoing Information System on the Status of Mahogany (*Swietenia Macrophylla*) and Cedar (*Cedrela Odorata*) Populations in Support of Cites Scientific Authority in Peru (Peru)

The Committee noted that this project would have become Sunset during this Session, had the Government of Peru not invoked the provision in Decision 2 (X) Annex 2 point 2 and resubmit a revised proposal to the Council for decision prior to the end of the validity period for review of the originally approved proposal. Moreover, for clarity, it is understood that the validity period of the fourth revision of this proposal begins at this session.

- 6) PD 475/07 Rev.2 (F) Restoring the Ecosystem Functions of the Jambi Grand Forest Park Through Promotion of Multiple-Use Function of Forest Resources in Collaboration with Local Stakeholders (Indonesia)

The Committee noted that this project would have become Sunset during this Session, had the Government of Indonesia not invoked the provision in Decision 2 (X) Annex 2 point 2 and resubmit a revised proposal to the Council for decision prior to the end of the validity period for review of the originally approved proposal. Moreover, for clarity, it is understood that the validity period of the second revision of this proposal begins at this session.

- 7) PD 476/07 Rev.3 (F) Clonal Test of Superior Progeny of *Shorea Leprosula* for Enrichment Planting Program (Indonesia)

The Committee noted that this project would have become Sunset during this Session, had the Government of Indonesia not invoked the provision in Decision 2 (X) Annex 2 point 2 and resubmit a revised proposal to the Council for decision prior to the end of the validity period for review of the originally approved proposal. Moreover, for clarity, it is understood that the validity period of the third revision of this proposal begins at this session.

- 8) PD 477/07 Rev.3 (F) Improving Forest Functions in Bengkulu Province through Community Participation in Rehabilitation of Degraded Forest by Using Local Prospective Commodities (Indonesia)
- 9) PD 495/08 Rev.3 (F) Guatemalan Forest Productivity Information System
- 10) PD 527/08 Rev.1 (F) Enhancing Capacity Building on Assessing Tropical Forest Carbon Stock and its Changes in China (China)
- 11) PD 530/08 Rev.2 (F) Phase II of ITTO Project [PD 30/97 Rev.6 (F)] Management of Forests Established through Rehabilitation of Degraded Forests by Local Communities in Ghana (Ghana)

- 12) PD 534/08 Rev.1 (F) Small-Scale Private Mixed Plantations Development PLUS Nutrition Promotion: The Case of Six Rural Community Women's Groups in the Eastern and Ashanti Regions of Ghana: Phase II (Ghana)
- 13) PD 541/09 Rev.1 (F) Forest Promotion and Development by Native Communities in Peru
- 14) PD 542/09 Rev.1 (F) Support to Convene the V Latin American Forestry Congress (Peru)
- 15) PD 544/09 Rev.1 (F) Increased Economic Returns from Forest Management in Permanent Production Forests of Peru
- 16) PD 554/09 Rev.1 (F) Pilot Sustainable Management Systems for Secondary Forests in the Collective Territory of the Bajo Calima Community Council, Buenaventura, Colombia
- 17) PD 560/09 Rev.3 (F) Conservation and Sustainable Management of Mangrove Forests of the Kouilou Coastal Area, with the Participation of Local Communities Established in this Area of Southern Congo (Republic of Congo)
- 18) PD 564/09 Rev.1 (F) Production of an Educational Book Series on Mangroves for Sustainable Management and Utilization of Mangrove Ecosystems (Japan)
- 19) PD 568/09 Rev.1 (F) Developing Community-Based Sustainable Mangrove Management System for the Amanzuri and Ama Emissa River Estuaries in Ghana

*Those projects with asterisk (approved but not funded within 20 months) will be sunset at the next Session.

**This project is partially financed.

(D) Projects coming under the sunset provisions since the last Session

The Committee noted that three (3) projects have become sunset since its last Session.

- 1) PD 471/07 Rev.2 (F) The Potential Impact of Environmental Fluctuations and Climate Change on Forest Plantation Pests in Ghana: Improving Pest Management Strategies through Research, Training and Extension (Ghana)
- 2) PD 474/07 Rev.1 (F) Strengthening Collaborative Forest Management among indigenous Cultural Communities (ICC's) and other Stakeholders in the East Diwata Sustainable Development Unit (SDU) in Mindanao, Philippines (The Philippines)
- 3) PD 490/07 Rev.2 (F) Project to Build the Institutional Capacities of the CITES Scientific Authority for Plants in Cameroon to ensure the Conservation and Sustainable Management of *Prunus Africana* (Cameroon)

9.2 Pre-project Work in Progress

The Committee took note of a status report of approved pre-projects in document CRF(XLIV)/3. The Committee discussed the issues associated with a number of pre-projects. Details of these discussions are as follows:

(A) Pre-projects under implementation

* Completion report received, pending financial audit

** Reported as completed at previous CRF sessions, but still pending final financial audit

- 1) PPD 94/04 Rev.1 (F) **Evaluation of the Status of Forest Resources in Côte d'Ivoire (Côte d'Ivoire)**

The Committee was informed that the pre-project activities were completed, and its completion report and final financial audit report were due since May 2008 and June 2008 respectively. The Secretariat urged the Executing Agency to submit these two reports at its earliest convenience. The Committee took note of

the information and urged the Executing Agency to submit the pre-project completion report and final financial audit report by end of March 2011.

2) **PPD 108/04 Rev.1 (F) Sustainable Community Management, Utilisation and Conservation of Mangrove Ecosystems in Ghana (Ghana)

The Committee was informed that this pre-project was reported as completed at a previous CRF session and documented as such in the document CRF(XLIII)/2, but it is still pending the pre-project final financial audit, since April 2009. The Secretariat urged the Executing Agency to submit this report at its earliest convenience. The Committee took note of the information and urged the Executing Agency to submit the pre-project final financial audit report by end of March 2011.

3) **PPD 123/06 Rev.1 (F) Controlling the Dieback and Decay Phenomenon in Plantation Species (Côte d'Ivoire)

The Committee was informed that this pre-project was reported as completed at a previous CRF session and documented as such in the document CRF(XLIII)/2, but it is still pending the project final financial audit, since September 2009. The Secretariat urged the Executing Agency to submit this report at its earliest convenience. The Committee took note of the information and urged the Executing Agency to submit the pre-project final financial audit report by end of March 2011.

4) **PPD 124/06 Rev.2 (F) Reforestation of Tropical Savannah Grassland with High Valued Teak in Papua New Guinea (PNG)

The Committee urged that the Executing Agency should submit the Final Financial Audit Report to the Secretariat at the earliest opportunity.

5) *PPD 135/07 Rev.1 (F) Community-based Forest Management of Sungai Medihit Watershed (Malaysia)

The Committee took note that the Executing Agency has submitted the Pre-project Completion Report and several Technical Reports. The delegation of Malaysia introduced the main outcomes of the pre-project, highlighting the development of strategies to address problems faced by indigenous communities in the Sungai Medihit Watershed areas. The Committee decided to consider the pre-project as completed, upon the reception of a satisfactory Final Financial Audit Report by the Secretariat and requested the Executing Agency to submit it to the Secretariat in due course.

(B) Pre-projects awaiting implementation agreement

The Committee noted that there was no pre-projects awaiting implementation agreement.

(C) Pre-projects awaiting financing

The Committee noted that there was no pre-projects awaiting financing.

(D) Pre-projects coming under the sunset provisions since the last Session

The Committee noted that there was no pre-project has become sunset since its last Session.

Item 10 - Policy Work

The Committee considered the following policy-related matters which are included in the 2010-2011 ITTO Biennial Work Programmes:

(i) Review and update the *ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests* to take into account recent developments in tropical forestry

The Committee took note of Document CRF(XLIV)/9 "Progress Report - Review and Update of the ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests to take into Account Recent Developments in Tropical Forestry (Activity 48 – BWP 2010 – 2011), prepared by consultants Cesar Sabogal and Carmenza Robledo. The document was presented by the Secretariat and includes the results of the

expert meeting held in Switzerland in June 2010. The Committee commend the actions taken and approved the proposed follow up for the completion of this Activity and the presentation of its results to the 45th Session of the CRF.

(ii) Facilitate the application of ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Tropical Timber Production Forests

The consultant Dr. Jeffrey Sayer presented the results achieved so far under this activity, as described in Document CRF(XLIV)/10 – “Implementation of the ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Tropical Timber Production Forests: A Report on Measures Taken to Facilitate Implementation of the Guidelines”, which included description of an event organized by ITTO, IUCN and JICA in June 2010 in Yokohama, in the framework of the International Year of Biodiversity, as well as the results of the application of the ITTO/IUCN Biodiversity Guidelines in forest concessions in Malaysia. These results have been discussed in an ITTO Side Event at the CBD CoP 10 in Nagoya, Japan, in October 2010.

The representative of Nigeria highlighted the importance of the Guidelines and recommended ITTO to develop regional events for its dissemination.

The Committee took note that the Activity has well advanced but is not completed because only partial funding has been provided to date. The Committee urged donors to consider completing the funding still required (in the range of US\$99,000) for the successful completion of the Activity and achievement of its expected results.

(iii) Contribute appropriately to national and international efforts in the area of prevention and management of fire in relation to tropical timber-producing forests

The Secretariat reported on the implementation of this activity, in particular on the developments in Togo and as related to Wildfire 2011, as follows:

- a. The Committee recalled that the Government of Togo had requested ITTO's assistance as regards the activities required for the development of a comprehensive strategy for Togo for the development of a policy, a strategy and building capacities in local, and national forest fire management for Togo. The Secretariat further reported that his strategy was currently being developed through the joint collaboration of an international expert, Hubert d'Avezac of France, and Mr. Richard Gbadoe, Director General of ODEF and his team there, and was expected to be completed during the first quarter of 2011.
- b. Moreover, in view of ITTO's commitment as a Core Member of the United Nations International Strategy for Disaster Reduction (UNISDR) Global Wildland Advisory Group, and the related Global Wildland Fire Network (GWFN) and the Global Fire Monitoring Center (GFMC), the Secretariat reported it had taken a more proactive role in the aforementioned forest fire-related networks and in its preparation for the 5th International Wildland Fire Conference (WILDFIRE 2011).
- c. The Committee further recalled that at its previous session it had endorsed the use of the remaining funds allocated to Council Decision 6(XXXIII) to cover the participation of the Secretariat, together with at least 6 participants from ITTO member countries – particularly those with ongoing fire projects - in the organization of an exchange of experiences and possibly a joint presentation of achievements as regards the prevention and management of tropical forest fires at the 5th International Wildland Fire Conference and Summit to be held in South Africa in 2011.
- d. The Secretariat further reported that is had currently pre-selected 12 candidates from the 3 tropical regions for their participation at WildFire 2011 and was currently coordinating with the organizing committee of Wildfire 2011 and GFMC as regards the event and its required logistics.

(iv) Monitoring the progress in the application of criteria and indicators for sustainable forest management

The Secretariat informed the Committee of the series of national C&I training workshops carried out over the past decade, with most ITTO producer countries now covered. The most recent workshop had taken place in Democratic Republic of Congo in August 2010 with a broad attendance. New members of the ITTA 2006 who are not currently ITTO members had expressed interest in benefiting from C&I workshops. Negotiations were also underway to convene a joint workshop for Suriname and Trinidad & Tobago, most likely in the latter country, in the first half of 2011.

The representative of Nigeria requested information on ITTO's efforts to assess the level of implementation of C&I by countries. The Secretariat noted in response that the C&I reporting format had been used by 32 of 33 producer members to provide information for ITTO's Status of Tropical Forest Management report and that an on-going study of the implementation of the C&I at the field level would be reported to the session of the Joint Committees during this session.

(v) Strengthening cooperation and collaboration between ITTO and ACTO countries on C&I and related topics, including organizing a regional workshop to consolidate ITTO C&I and the Tarapoto Process

The Committee took note that the MOU between ACTO and ITTO for the implementation of this activity had been signed, the selection of the international consultant had already been short-listed and that implementation was to commence shortly. The complete activity shall be reported in the next Committee Session, with the presentation of the harmonized system.

(vi) International Conference on Forest Tenure, Governance and Small and Medium Forest Enterprises with focus in the Asia-Pacific

Ms. Augusta Molnar, co-chair of the CSAG (consumer countries), briefed the Committee on the advances in the organization of this International Conference which corresponds to the Activity 47 of the ITTO Biennial Work Programme 2010-2011. The Committee was informed that partial funds were secured through the Thematic Programme on Community Forest Management and Enterprises (CFME), but further fund raising actions are still required. The Conference is planned to be held in Lombok, Indonesia, on 11-15 July 2011, hosted by the Government of Indonesia and co-organized by ITTO, the Rights and Resources Initiative (RRI) and other CSAG members, the European Forest Institute, and other partners.

(vii) Assess resources required to implement sustainable forest management

As requested by the 43rd CRF Session, the Secretariat prepared and presented draft terms of reference for the implementation of Activity 13 of the ITTO Biennial Work Programme "Assessing Resources Required to Implement Sustainable Forest Management" [Document CRF(XLIV)/11]. It recalled the ITTO previous work carried out in 1996 through ITTC Decision 8 (XX) which invited Producer Member Countries to submit estimates of resources needed and costs incurred in achieving the Year 2000 Objective. The delegation of Nigeria noted the importance of implementing the activity by qualified international consultants and experts. The delegation of USA questioned defining the achievement of sustainable forest management and discussed the difficulty in estimating costs required to achieve sustainable forest management. She also noted that developing a clear approach for the estimation of resources requirements to achieve sustainable forest management would be an important step to move this study forward. The Committee recommended to the Council the approval of the terms of reference, as contained in Annex 2 of this report, which incorporates a minor amendment to the draft terms of reference initially submitted by the Secretariat.

Item 11 - Election of Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson for 2011

Mr. Patrick Hardcastle of United Kingdom was elected as Chairperson for 2011. Dato' Dr. Abdul Rahman Abdul Rahim (Malaysia) was elected as Vice-Chairperson for 2011.

Item 12 - Dates and Venues of the Forty-fifth and Forty-sixth Sessions of the Committee

The Forty-fifth Session of the Committee would be held in conjunction with the Forty-seventh Session of the International Tropical Timber Council.

The Forty-sixth Session of the Committee would be held in conjunction with the Forty-eighth Session of the International Tropical Timber Council.

Item 13 - Other Business

The delegation of USA asked for clarification on the approval and financing procedure of the revised project proposal PD 577/10 Rev.1 (F) "Management of the Emerald Triangle Protected Forests Complex to Promote Cooperation for Transboundary Biodiversity Conservation between Thailand, Cambodia and Laos (Phase III)", recalling that its second phase has been jointly financed by USA, Switzerland and others. She noted that neither the revised proposal nor the original proposal had been posted on the ITTO homepage. The revised proposal had not been included in the list of Projects, Pre-projects and Activities pending financing which was prepared for donors' consideration prior to the present session of the ITTC. She also noted that the ITTO budget of the revised proposal has been substantially increased from US\$806,760 to US\$2,005,039 after the Fortieth Expert Panel for Technical Appraisal of Project Proposals in Yokohama on 2-6 August 2010. Furthermore, she underlined the need for the Secretariat to improve information sharing in future work and recommended that in case of any revised project proposals having substantial changes, they should be informed to Members accordingly in the process of the electronic no objection procedure and any changes or any actions taken on projects should be clearly presented to the Committee at its review of new projects and pre-projects.

The Committee was briefed by the Secretariat on the ITTO Project Cycle Calendar for Autumn 2010 and the time-bound electronic no objection procedure. The Secretariat informed the Committee that it was regrettable that the revised proposal has not been posted on ITTO website and highlighted that final decision for approval and financing of any revised proposals would be made at the present Session of the Council and Associated Sessions of Committees. The Secretariat also informed the Committee that under an initiative of the government of Japan to contribute to the conservation of biodiversity in tropical forests in line with the International Year of Biodiversity 2010, the ITTO budget of the revised proposal had been increased substantially to facilitate the implementation of the project.

The Committee urged the Secretariat to take due account of the comments and recommendations made in improving the time-bound electronic no objection process as well as the review process at the Committee for any substantially revised proposals. The Committee recommended that the revised proposal [PD 577/10 Rev.1 (F)] be approved for implementation, taking into account the abovementioned remarks.

Item 14 - Recommendations to the International Tropical Timber Council

- (A) The Committee recommended that funding be made immediately available for the following projects and pre-project approved under the Project Cycle Spring 2010 and Project Cycle Autumn 2010:

Projects

PD 560/09 Rev.3 (F)	Conservation and Sustainable Management of Mangrove Forests of the Kouilou Coastal Area, with the Participation of Local Communities Established in this Area of Southern Congo (Republic of Congo) [US\$438,674.00]
PD 564/09 Rev.1 (F)	Production of an Educational Book Series on Mangroves for Sustainable Management and Utilization of Mangrove System (Japan) [US\$149,904.00]
PD 568/09 Rev.1 (F)	Developing Community-Based Sustainable Mangrove Management System for the Amanzuri and Ama Emissa River Estuaries in Ghana [US\$558,756.00]
PD 577/10 Rev.1 (F)	Management of the Emerald Triangle Protected Forests Complex to Promote Cooperation for Trans-boundary Biodiversity Conservation Between Thailand, Cambodia and Laos – Phase III (Thailand and Cambodia) [US\$2,051,039.00]
PD 583/10 Rev.1 (F)	Restoring Sub-Humid Ecosystems in Southern Peru through Reforestation with <i>Caesalpinia spinosa</i> [US\$149,796.00]

- PD 586/10 Rev.1 (F) Operational Strategies for the Conservation of Tengkwang Genetic Diversity and for Sustainable Livelihood of Indigenous People in Kalimantan (Indonesia) [US\$414,104.00]
- PD 590/10 Rev.1 (F) Integrated Fire Management in Rural Communities of Guatemala: Establishment of Pilot Sites for the Implementation of Sustainable Integrated Fire Management Practices [US\$517,563.00]

Pre-Projects

- PPD 147/10 Rev.1 (F) Zoning and Sustainable Development of the Minkebe Protected Area towards the Protection of Transboundary Conservation Corridors between Gabon, Cameroon and the Congo [US\$99,279.00]

B) The Committee recommended that additional funds be made immediately available for the following project:

Projects

- PD 276/04 Rev.2 (F) Revised World Atlas Of Mangrove For Conservation And Restoration Of Mangrove Ecosystems [US\$50,000.00]
- PD 451/07 Rev.1 (F) Transboundary Biodiversity Conservation Area : The Pulong Tau National Park, Sarawak State, Malaysia Phase II [US\$218,160.00]

Item 15 - Report of the Session

The Committee accepted this Report for submission to the Council.

Annex 1

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR A META-EVALUATION OF PREVIOUSLY EVALUATED ITTO PROJECTS

I. Background

Recalling Decision 3(XXVIII) on the Ex-Post Evaluation of Projects, which specifically requests the Executive Director to synthesize and disseminate the results of the ex-post evaluations, for example through posting on the ITTO website, articles in the Tropical Forest Update and otherwise take active steps to make the lessons learned from the projects broadly available to stakeholders and the interested public; and further requests the Executive Director to convene at appropriate intervals an Expert Panel comprised of ITTO stakeholders to synthesize the lessons learned from the outcome of these evaluations and to provide recommendations to the Council and other stakeholders accordingly.

The CRF considered at its 43rd Session that ITTO has been carrying out ex-post evaluations for many years, but the results and recommendations have to date not sufficiently influenced the design and execution of new projects, nor have the recommendations and lessons learnt been sufficiently disseminated to support the development and implementation of similar projects. In addition, it considered important to assess the consistency of the methodology and results of ex-post evaluations so that useful conclusions can be drawn and the process can be improved. In this light the Committee requested the Secretariat to draft the current Terms of Reference (TOR) to assess the ex-post evaluation process of all ITTO projects.

II. Overall Objective/Purpose of the Meta-Evaluation

By means of the analysis, synthesis and careful evaluation of the findings, lessons learned and recommendations from a series of ITTO ex-post evaluations, the overall goal of the Meta-Evaluation is to assess the impact of the projects implemented on the field during the 25 years of existence of ITTO on the achievement of the ITTO's 2000 objective, as well as to improve the efficiency, effectiveness and relevance of the future ITTO project evaluation process, by reviewing and analysing the current methodology and results achieved to date, taking into account:

- the Objectives of ITTA including the Organisation's "Objective 2000";
- the ITTO Action Plans;
- the Reports of the Expert Panel on Project Appraisals;
- the Terms of Reference for Ex-post Evaluations;
- the need to have a compilation of the findings of the ex-post evaluations undertaken to date;
- the need to have a project evaluation practice that feeds a learning process to guide new projects development building from existing knowledge and avoiding duplication of efforts; and
- the need to enhance countries' efforts in sustaining and taking follow-up actions on the completed projects.

An independent Meta-Evaluation of ex-post project evaluation process will enable:

- an assessment of the consistency of the methodology used and the results obtained, so that useful conclusions and recommendations can be drawn to improve the process and make the best possible use of existing evaluation resource; and
- an aggregation of lessons learned, good practice and recommendations from completed ex-post evaluations so they can be more effectively used to influence future project design, as well as to improve information dissemination for the benefit of ITTO member countries and to promote SFM.

In this context, the Meta-Evaluation shall: (a) identify and propose findings, conclusions and recommendations to improve the evaluation and assessment of ITTO projects and (b) generate a document that compiles lessons learned, good practices and recommendations of completed ex-post evaluations of ITTO projects, for dissemination and enhancement of projects results and impacts.

III. Overall Scope and Methodology

The Meta-Evaluation will review the reports of completed ex-post evaluations and project completion reports products with the view to:

- Determining the contribution of projects to the objectives of the ITTO and its Members;
- aggregating the findings including recommendations of completed ex-post evaluations and project compilation reports/products;
- assessing the applicability and use of the recommendations including lessons learned;
- recommending on how ITTO project evaluation process can be improved to ensure consistency and quality in reporting and recommendations; and
- drawing lessons learned and disseminating and promoting these together with the findings as widely as possible.

The Meta-Evaluation shall also analyse and aggregate the findings of earlier ex-post evaluations, presenting a basis for better understanding of the relevance and impacts of ITTO's project interventions and how to improve them.

IV. Approach

The Meta-Evaluation should consider international best practices (i.e. relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability) and involve the following approach:

- review and analyse completed ex-post evaluation reports and projects' related documents (including projects' progress/monitoring reports) to extract and categorise the key findings in terms of conclusions, recommendations and lessons learned;
- aggregate the findings and identify the Lessons Learned across geographic and sectoral areas and specific subjects or topics; and
- aggregate the recommendations by category and by entity (i.e. to whom they are addressed, the ITTO, Submitting Country, Executing Agency, and themes).

The Meta-Evaluation shall also provide an overall assessment and synthesis of:

1. the potential and actual contribution of ex-post evaluations to ITTO's project and policy work;
2. the overall role, contribution and potential contribution of ex-post evaluations and project progress monitoring in improving project design and delivery so as to contribute to ITTO's objectives, Yokohama Action Plan, and Objective 2000;
3. the overall attainment of the objectives and the overall effectiveness of ex-post evaluations;
4. the overall cost-effectiveness of ex-post evaluations and assessment;
5. lessons learned and recommendation for member countries to sustain the projects' impacts;
6. make recommendations on how to continually improve the ITTO's project evaluation, monitoring and assessment; and
7. the role of adaptive management and the value of project steering committees.

V. Reporting

- Preparation of a Meta-Evaluation Report covering contribution and impact of ITTO projects from all committees and geographic regions;
- preparation of a publication summarizing *inter alia* findings, lessons learnt and impact at national, regional and global levels including cross-cutting issues and covering the full range of ITTO projects in Reforestation and Forest Management, Forest Industry and Economic Information and Market Intelligence;
- preparation of an Overall Executive Summary focusing on the overall assessment of the Meta-Evaluation in particular:
 1. consistency and quality of ex-post evaluation reports projects' relative success in contributing to ITTO's Objective 2000 and Yokohama Action Plan, summarizing the key lessons learned;
 2. summary of recommendations aggregated by category and by entity (i.e. to whom they are addressed, the ITTO, Submitting Country, Executing Agency, and themes);

3. overall findings of the Meta-Evaluation;
- presentation of the Overall Executive Summary at a Council Session of the International Tropical Timber Council; and
 - preparation of an article or a set of articles within a special edition for possible publication in the ITTO *Tropical Forest Update* (TFU), in consultation with the editor, containing an overview of the projects and summarizing the overall results of the Meta-Evaluation.

VI. Composition of the Team

The team shall be composed of 4 independent consultants, one being team leader and three regional experts (Africa, Asia and Latin America). Each expert must have at least 10 years of experience in the formulation, implementation, monitoring, evaluation and assessment of forest development projects. Previous experience with ITTO project work, and fluency in English and at least one more of the ITTO languages are assets. Provision for editing and translation will also be needed.

VII. Duration of the Assignment

The task will be undertaken as an extended Expert Panel and should be completed over a 3 months period [two weeks in Yokohama followed by virtual communications to complete the report]. The Team shall produce the draft products 6 months from the date of signing a contract and the final products not later than 2 months after receiving comments to the draft products.

VIII. Tentative Budget

- Not to exceed US\$300,000 to be drawn from the Pooled Sub-Accounts for Ex-post Evaluation

Annex 2

Terms of Reference Assessing Resources Required to Implement Sustainable Forest Management (Activity 13 of ITTO BWP for the years 2010-2011)

I. Background

At its Forty-Fifth Session in November 2009, the ITTC adopted the ITTO Biennial Work Programme (BWP) for the years 2010-2011 which included Activity 13 entitled "Assess resources required to implement sustainable forest management". These terms of reference are prepared to facilitate the implementation of this Activity.

Financing sustainable forest management has been a consistent theme in the deliberations of ITTC, particularly with regard to the achievement of the ITTO 2000 Objective. At its Twentieth Session in 1996, the ITTC through its Decision 8 (XX) invited producer member countries to submit estimates of resources needed and costs incurred in achieving the Year 2000 Objective. Pursuant to this Decision, Producer member countries submitted their estimates and a panel of experts was convened in 1997 to assess the accuracy and completeness of the estimates submitted and make recommendations for the mobilization of resources to assist member countries in accelerating progress towards the achievement of the Year 2000 Objective. The findings of the panel indicated that 18 out of the 26 country reports submitted by Producer member countries were of variable quality and many countries did not provide information at the level of the forest management unit. The panel did not consider that the aggregate of the estimate submitted by countries could be regarded as a definitive statement on the resources needed to achieve the Year 2000 Objective. However, the panel considered that the ITTC may find it useful to identify the specific costs and resources needed to carry out the highest priority actions for the purpose of mobilising resources or allocating project funds.

Since ITTO has been at the forefront in the development and implementation of criteria and indicators for sustainable forest management encompassing 7 thematic areas (1) enabling conditions for SFM; (2) forest resource security; (3) forest ecosystem health and condition; (4) flow of forest produce; (5) biological diversity; (6) soil and water and (7) economic, social and cultural aspects, a specific study to identify priorities across the 7 thematic areas will be conducted. After developing a comparative methodology to estimate the resources required for generating multiple forest-based benefits under sustainable forest management, a review will be carried out through case studies at the national and forest management unit levels in selected countries.

In addition, since the five ITTO Thematic Programmes (Forest Law Enforcement, Governance and Trade, Community Forest Management and Enterprises, Trade and Market Transparency, Industry Development and Efficiency and Reducing Deforestation and Forest Degradation and Enhancing Environmental Services in Tropical Forests) have been approved by Council for implementation on a pilot basis, a specific study on the assessment of the resources needed to implement these Programmes beyond 2011 will also be conducted.

II. Terms of reference

1. To review existing analyses for assessing resources required for the achievement of sustainable forest management and the report of the Expert Panel on Resources Needs and Costs incurred in Achieving the year 2000 Objective;
2. To develop an approach to assist Members in estimating the resources required to achieve sustainable forest management within the context of the seven thematic areas of the ITTO *Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Management of Tropical Forests (C&I)* and the five ITTO Thematic Programmes, with the identification of some key factors (i.e. planning, implementation, monitoring) for which the resources may be allocated into a few components ;
3. To conduct case studies for selected countries (i.e. two countries in each tropical region) in estimating the resources required to achieve sustainable forest management using the approach developed under item 2 above;

4. To convene a panel of experts to review the outcomes of the case studies and refine the approach for estimating the resources required to promote the sustainable management of each Member's forest resources; and
5. To report the results of the case studies and the expert panel with recommendations for follow-up actions to the Forty-Seventh Session of the ITTC.

III. Budget

Item	Approximate cost (US\$)
A. International consultants (2 consultants x 2 months x US\$10,000)	40,000
B. Panel of Experts (6 experts x US\$5,000 & 2 consultants x US\$5,000)	40,000
C. Travel costs for 2 international consultants (2 consultants x US\$10,000)	20,000
D. Country case studies assistance (6 countries x US\$10,000)	60,000
Sub-total	160,000
ITTO program support (13%)	20,800
Total:	180,800

* * *