



TFL-SPD 028/12 Rev.1 (M)

Empowering civil society organization and other non-state actors to effectively contribute to forest law compliance in Ghana

COMPLETION REPORT



COMPLETION REPORT

TFL-SPD 028/12 Rev.1 (M)

**Empowering civil society organization and other non-state actors to
effectively contribute to forest law compliance in Ghana**

Prepared for the Project by:

The Project Management Team

Executed by:

West Africa Forest Programme

With Assistant of:

Nature and Development Foundation

Accra, March 2015

Project Number : TFL-SPD 028/12 Rev.1 (M)

Project Title : Empowering civil society organization and other non-state actors to effectively contribute to forest law compliance in Ghana

Host Government : GHANA

Executing Agency : WWF West Africa Forest Programme Office,
Centre for African Wetlands Building, University of Ghana, PMB
L45, Legon, Accra, GHANA telephone: +233(0)302518710 Fax:
+233(0)302518709 mseidu@wwfghana.org

Starting date of the project: May 2013

Duration : 18 months

Project costs (US \$)

: ITTO	147,701.00
: Disbursed Amount	129,260.00
: WWF/GoG	40,355.00
: Total	188,456.00

Collaborating Agency (ies) : The Government of Ghana through the Forestry
Commission Forestry Commission

Project Management Team

1 Mustapha Seidu : Project Coordinator

2 Abednego Danso/
Kwasi Nasangma : Project Finance Manager

3 Emmanuel Agbodza : Project Driver

Consultants : Dr Richard Gyimah
: Edward Nyarko
: Marian Hermosura Tadeffa-Kubabom

Published by : WWF/NDF and ITTO

Date and place : **Accra March 2015**

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, scanning, or otherwise, without either the prior written permission of the publisher.

Contents

Executive Summary.....	5
Project Identification	8
Project Rationale.....	10
Project Objectives	10
Strategic partnerships	11
Capacity building.....	11
Field Study and Learning.....	12
Production and Publication of a documentary.....	12
Specific objective	12
Output 1	12
Output 2	15
Output 3	17
Schedule.....	18
Project outcome, target beneficiaries involvement	18
Sustainability of project	21
Assessment and Analysis	22
Lessons Learned	25
Conclusions and recommendation	26
ANNEX 1: Project Cash flow Statement	28
ANNEX 2: Project Financial Statement.....	32

Executive Summary

It is recognized that for civil society organizations (CSOs) and other non-state actors (NSAs) to contribute to forest law enforcement and compliance, there will be the need to build capacity of such groups. It is particularly the case in Ghana where the forest resources are subject to multiple threats of being degraded by cocoa farmers, illegal logging, and mining (both legal and illegal). Acknowledging the critical role of civil society and other non-state actors in the fight against illegalities in the forest sector, this project was designed to build the capacity of civil society and other non-state actors in legality and sustainability requirements along the timber supply chain and also to provide modern toolkits for engaging with forest authorities and managers. The project also had an element that targeted the general public with the aim of raising awareness and interest in forest issues.

The project achieved the objective of building capacity of civil society and other non-state actors to contribute effectively to forest law compliance in Ghana by:

- 1) **strengthening the knowledge of 30 CSOs & other NSAs on established models of legal & sustainable requirements as well as on practical forest operations.** To increase the knowledge base of CSOs in Ghana on legality and sustainability along the timber supply chain in Ghana, a four-day training and field study learning was organized for 30 participants at the Royal Lamerta Hotel, Kumasi from 29th of October 2013 to 1st November 2013. This training allowed an introduction and practical first-hand field learning by participant on the statutory definition of legality; the statutory and sustainability requirements from the forest floor to the shipyard; the FLEGT VPA; and sustainability requirements in the context of Ghana. For practical learning, the process of concession allocation stock survey, yield selection, log measurements and conveyance were followed during the training.

Dialogue between industry and civil society organizations was enhanced when the project facilitated the participation of industry, for the first time, in the national forest forum (see forum report for details and media coverage during the forum <mailto:https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=q9nGKQSU0aY&index=2&list=PLjXJItrICPEzRynormMoHzW6aGahz6bxO>).

- 2) **building the capacity of 50 personnel of CSOs on modern toolkits for engaging forest authorities and managers in Ghana.**

This was premised on the fact that CSOs, CBOs and other non-state actors are only as effective in their watchdog role as their knowledge of tools to use to engage different stakeholders. Indeed, there are merits in having multiple approaches in engaging different actors to improve governance. In recognition of this, a two day training on the use of modern tools to engage forest authorities and managers was organized on the 14-15 March 2014. Considering the importance of building capacity of non-state actors on tools

of engagement with forest authorities and stakeholders, refresher training on various toolkits was organized for participants on 15-16 October 2014. Find details of the training, participants evaluation of the project on YouTube <mailto:https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TYQSd82Y1bo&list=PLjXJltriCPEzRynormMoHzW6aGahz6bxO&index=1>

The project has also created a social media page on yammer where all the participants to the training workshop and other social activists have been invited. Interesting topics on forest management and other related issues are posted and discussed frequently. See details

<mailto:https://www.yammer.com/forumforforestgovernanceghana/#/Threads/index?type=following>

3) **Raising public awareness and interest in forest law enforcement**

The project created visibility for the project and project partners, producing a roll-up banner with the logos of the project partners and project name. This was displayed during all functions sponsored by the project. In addition, 3000 pieces of stickers have been designed, produced and distributed. The stickers bear this message: "Ghana loses about 65,000 hectare of forest cover annually. About 80% of timber sold in Ghana is illegal and of low quality. Why don't you buy legal wood to save your house and Ghana's remaining forest?". One assumption of this project was that raising the awareness of the general public on illegal forestry activities and their consequential effect will correspondingly raise the interest of the general public in forest law enforcement. As such a fifteen (15) minutes video documentary on forest law compliance as was produced, broadcasted on national televisions and uploaded on social media such as Youtube, yammer and facebook. It is currently accessible on YouTube (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jfqeDWexObM>).

Differences between pre-project post-project situation

The main differences between pre-project and post-project situation can be summed up as 1) the strengthened capacity of civil society organizations and other non-state actors on legality and sustainability issues along the timber supply chain and the increase confidence of grassroot civil society to contribute to forest law compliance; 2) the confidence with which civil society can choose the appropriate engagement tools to engage forest authorities 3) the increased awareness of a section of the general public on forest illegality and the impact on individual and national economies 4) the increased collaboration between civil society and industry in deliberating on pressing issues in the forest sector.

Sustainability beyond project period

The project dovetails into the FLEGT VPA objectives and so capacity built under the project will be utilized in the implementation of the FLEGT VPA in Ghana. It is also submitted that the

approach of working with the National Forest Forum Ghana has the potential of sustaining the action beyond the project lifespan as the Forestry Commission has indicated its willingness to continue to fund the process.

Lesson Learnt

The project has been criticized for focusing only on NGOs and CBOs to the neglect of local communities. The lesson learnt was that , the target area was too large for the size of the project. In addition, the potential beneficiaries were thought to be a little larger for the size of this project because of the inclusion of the rather generic description of non-state actors.

Aspects of the project got delayed because some Consultants felt some sense of entitlement once he/she has been selected, made to fill the ITTO E-Hform and informed that a No Objection Letter has been granted. On a number of occasions, the Project Team had to change consultants to avoid unnecessary delays to project implementation.

The training components of the project including the field study learning along the timber supply chain and toolkits for engagement were innovative, field-oriented and tailored to the needs of participants. However, the time allocated for the training was thought to be short for adequate interaction and elaboration on the subject matter of the training. It is suggested that at least a full 2-3 days will be required to cover the subject of toolkit for engagement strategies. Same was made of the field study learning.

In many occasions, it is challenging to get the comments of the government representative on information that needs their approval. This led to a number of delays of some activities.

Within the period of the project implementation, the project team had to request for budget modification because it was realized that the cost of car rental, hotel accommodation and other budget items were higher than budgeted. The rearrangements within the approved budget ensure that the challenge with the budget was solved.

Recommendation

It is recommended that small-sized projects should focus on limited geographic area, preferably as pilot, using focused group (ie civil society or CBOs or Communities) to demonstrate the feasibility of such projects. The temptation is to spread the funds thinly and with little or no follow up activities. Follow up activities are essential to ensure continuity and confidence enhancement of CSOs, CBOs and communities.

It is suggested that attempt be made to adopt more field based training with enough days and appropriate budget to allow for adequate coverage of the subject matter.

This project is relevant for addressing forest law enforcement and compliance issues and can be modified to include technology for gathering evidence, a feedback process for accepting and storing such evidence and incentive system for volunteers.

Project Identification

1.1 Context

Ghana has a land area of 238,500 sq km, made up of two broad ecological zones - a high forest zone covering much of the southern (30%) of the country, and a savannah zone over the considerably drier north (70%). Ghana's forestry sector contributes about 4% to the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and it is the fourth largest foreign exchange earner to the Ghanaian economy. Socially, forest is central to the fabric of forest fringed communities in Ghana. It is estimated that about 120,000 people are directly employed in the forestry sector and contributing to the livelihoods of about 2 million people. Forests play a crucial role in defining the identity and culture of most local communities in Ghana. It is, therefore, not surprising that in most forest fringe communities, cultural identities, traditional beliefs and norms are all associated with the existence of the forests. This reverence to certain areas of the forests has led to the protection of thickets or patches of remnant forest even in areas completely denuded of forest cover, a concept referred to in literature as 'sacred groves'.

Ironically, the production of the major raw materials representing the core exporting earnings for Ghana's economy including timber exploitation are also partly responsible for the demise of the once beautiful forest cover. Forest exploitation (both legal & illegal), agricultural expansion (mainly to plant cocoa) and mining have been identified as the principal causes of deforestation in Ghana (Ghana Forest Investment Program 2012). The level of illegal activities in forest including those by farmers, illegal miners and illegal loggers is a recipe for a breakdown of forest law enforcement.

According to some analysts, Ghana will become a net importer of wood and timber within the next ten years, a situation that will worsen access to affordable timber products and in turn push poor forest fringed communities to illegally harvest the remnant forest. It is for these reasons that this intervention is critical to ensure the meaningful involvement of civil society and other non-state actors in forest law enforcement and forest governance. The proposed action when sustained has the potential to significantly reduce forest revenue loss. For instance, it is estimated that Ghana loses 1.2 billion or 10 % of GDP annually as a result of environmental degradation emanating from the country's inability to enforce its environmental laws including forestry laws. The action is designed to empower civil society and other non-state actors to rise up to the challenge, support and constructively criticize forest authorities and law enforcement agencies so as to improve on the framework for accountable and transparent forest governance.

Despite the realization of the heavy loss to GDP from environmental degradation, Ghana continues to lose its natural forest cover at an alarming rate. It is estimated that between 1990 and 2005, forest cover in Ghana diminished at a rate of about 130, 000 hectares per annum (<http://www.fao.org/forestry/country/32185/en/gha/>) attributable to over-exploitation (both legal & illegal), agricultural expansion (mainly to plant cocoa) and mining. Underlying factor is poor forest governance. Addressing poor forest governance and forest law non-compliance are

prerequisites for achieving sustainable forest management and poverty reduction in the country. In addition, participatory natural resources governance and civil society empowerment are still at their infancy. The proposed action will be crucial in raising citizen awareness and interest in forest law enforcement leading to increased public demand for forest law enforcement. The action is also important for civil society and other non-state actors to challenge government to take appropriate action in addressing conflicting government postures in dealing with illegal cocoa farms, illegal miners and illegal chainsaw operators that seem to suggest a tacit endorsement of the actions of the perpetrators. This could help ensure maintenance of remnant forests providing climate amelioration and other service functions.

The coverage for this project is the High Forest Zone and some parts of the Transition Zone of Ghana. The High Forest and Transition Zones of Ghana cover six administrative regions of the country, and includes Western, Central, Eastern, Ashanti, Brong Ahafo and Volta regions where the remaining forest of the country is found. These remnant forests are in serious competition with other land uses including cocoa cultivation, mining, and other forest conversion activities. Consequently, only the South-Western part of Ghana still contains patches of intact forest.

The six regions mentioned above enjoy the highest rainfall in the country with annual output ranging from 1,150 to over 2,000 mm. The soils outside the forest reserves, as in most tropical regions, are inherently infertile and this is exacerbated by the high amount of rainfall leading to soil nutrient leaching. Indeed, one of the driving forces for illegal farming in forest-reserves is the low soil fertility outside of forests.

1.2 **Origin and problem description**

This project emanates from the World Wide Fund for Nature's (WWF)/Nature and Development Foundation's (NDF) long standing engagement with civil society, industry and government of Ghana at different platforms on legal and sustainable logging and associated trade including lessons and experiences from a decade of responsible forest management campaign in Ghana and an FAO ACP Support Project entitled "facilitating compliance with FLEGT and EU Timber Regulation in Cote d'Ivoire, Ghana and Liberia" It also represents WWF/NDF commitment to drive improvements in forest management practices and contribute to the reduction of illegal logging through the enforcement of forest laws and voluntary compliance standards by industry and individuals. These commitments and aspirations are also in line with the policies and commitments of the government of Ghana to enforce the legal and regulatory regimes governing the forest sector and to achieve sustainable forest management whilst improving forestry's contribution to the national economy.

Civil society organizations and other non-state actors providing checks-and-balances in forest management and regulation in Ghana have been ineffective in contributing to forest law enforcement due principally to their low capacity. This is mostly caused by civil society and other non-state actors' insufficient knowledge and understanding of the established models of

best practices in legality and sustainability requirements that are the basis of forest management and regulation in the country. Over the years, there have been little training opportunities for civil society organizations to update their knowledge of the constantly changing legality and sustainability requirements that the regulator must enforce and for which forest operators and individuals must comply with. In addition, most civil society organizations in the forest sector have literally become static in the capital city and hardly have actual field operation experience leading to the current situation of low cooperation between CSOs and industry. Furthermore, civil society organizations in the forest sector of Ghana are not up-to-date with modern tools, approaches and methods of engaging with forest authorities and managers due mainly to lack of training opportunities and insufficient experience sharing opportunities. It is also important to note that the general public's apathy to forest law enforcement issues due to lack of appropriate information and awareness is partly responsible for the low contribution of non-state actors to forest law enforcement in Ghana

2. Project objective and implementation strategy

Project Rationale

Ghana is recognized as having one of the most well-crafted forest laws and legislation in Africa. However, non-enforcement of and non-compliance with these forest legislations and requirements undermine the rule of law, reinforce corruption and represents major threats to the forest ecosystems and their biodiversity in Ghana. Non-compliance with forest laws and the illegal activities carried out also threaten the livelihoods of local communities and undermine the efforts of both private- and public sector organizations to develop sustainable approaches to forest management.

Civil society is acknowledged as a very critical stakeholder to provide checks-and-balances in the enforcement of, and compliance with forest laws. A stronger, collective civil society front equipped with better tools for engagement, advocacy and activism can demand for transparency and better services from the government, natural resource managers and industries. The development and implementation of this intervention will emphasize a paradigm shift to a proactive civil society that is ready to defend the rights of the poor and to ensure that responsible forest management is not unduly sacrificed. This intervention is to build capacity of non-state actors and other stakeholders in the forest industry on established best practices of legality and sustainability requirements, and widen compliance with and adoption of such best practices by a range of players in the civil society sector of Ghana.

Project Objectives

The overall objective of the project is to contribute to sustainable development and improved governance in the forest sector of Ghana. Improved governance in the forestry sector has a replica effect on general governance environment in the country.

Specifically, the project has the objective to build capacity of civil society organizations (CSOs) & other non-state actors (NSAs) to contribute to forest law compliance in Ghana through better understanding of the statutory and sustainability requirements along the timber supply chain as well as training on approaches and methods of engaging forest authorities and forest managers.

To achieve the project specific objective, a number of approaches and strategies were employed: These included:

Strategic partnerships: The project brought together WWF, NDF, the Forestry Commission of Ghana (as illustrative by the Agreement between ITTO, Government of Ghana and WWF and the sub-contract agreement between WWF and NDF), Fabi& Co Ltd, Logs & Lumber Limited, National Forest Forum, Civil Society Organizations and media houses in a strategic collaboration. This partnership brought together capacity, expertise and networks that delivered on the project objective and reached relevant stakeholders in the forest sector of Ghana. The project built upon WWF/NDF's long standing relationship with civil society, timber industry, forest authorities of Ghana and

will benefit and complement allied projects such as:

- i. WWF GFTN publication entitled "Exporting in a shifting legal landscape" (<http://gftn.panda.org/resources/tools/?193890/Exporting-in-a-Shifting-Legal-Landscape>);
- ii. the FLEGT VPA in general
- iii. Client Earth project on building capacity of CSOs on legal issues (<http://www.clientearth.org/external-resources/ghana/other-ressources/plenary-report-of-legal-working-group-4-june-2014.pdf>)
- iv. WWF GFTN experience in developing guidance for responsible forest management (GFTN guide for Responsible Purchasing of Forest Products <http://gftn.panda.org/resources/tools/?193889/interactiveguide>) and legal compliance (GFTN Keep It Legal guide <http://gftn.panda.org/newsroom/?82060/keep-it-legal-best-practices-for-keeping-illegally-harvested-timber-out-of-your-supply-chain-english-chinese>).

Capacity building: development of technical material and capacity building of civil society and other non-state actors improved general awareness and knowledge of legal and sustainability requirements that forest managers and operators are required to adhere to along the timber supply chain. This training on established models of legality and sustainability made use of Ghana's Voluntary Partnership Agreement legality verification manual as well as the Ghana Forest Management Certification Standard (<https://ic.fsc.org/download.psu-assesment-report-for-ghana.673.pdf>). Other critical capacity building approaches that were adopted in the implementation of the project included training of civil society organizations to be equipped with relevant tools of engaging forest authorities and concession holders as well as other relevant forest stakeholders in a bid to contribute to effective forest law enforcement.

Field Study and Learning: In order for civil society organizations and other non-state actors to appreciate and internalize legal and sustainability requirements and to be able to contribute law enforcement through adherence to such requirements, the project has adopted a field study approach where participants visited operational sites in the forest and factory of Logs & Lumber Ltd to acquire first-hand information on the processes involved from the forest floor to the ship yard. Staff from the Forest Services Division and the Timber Industry Development Division took participants through all the requirements that must be met in order for timber to be declared legal and sustainable.

Production and Publication of a documentary: As part of effort to raise public interest and active participation in forest law enforcement, a short video documentary was produced and broadcasted 8 times on a national TV to give information on the level of forest illegal activities, the socio-economic and environmental impacts on the general public as well as actions that individuals and businesses can take to contribute to forest law compliance in Ghana. In addition, banners and stickers were produced and distributed to the general public to create the needed awareness and generate the demand for legally produced forest products in the long term.

3. Project Performance

Specific objective

The specific objective pursued by the project was to build capacity of civil society organizations (CSOs) & other non-state actors (NSAs) to contribute to forest law compliance in Ghana through the implementation of the outputs and activities specified below.

3.1 Outputs

Output 1: Knowledge of 30 CSOs & other NSAs on established models of legal & sustainable requirements as well as on practical forest operations strengthened. The essence of this output is to cure the problem of inadequate knowledge of CSOs of statutory and best practice requirements from the forest floor to the shipyard and the control points that are likely to be abused or circumvented. It is with this premise that the following activities were designed and carried out.

1. Organize an inception workshop for stakeholders

As part of the effort to announce the commencement and to communication the project objective and expected outcome to participant, a one day inception workshop was organized for participants from Civil Society Organization, Government and Industry. This inception workshop which was organized on **3rd of July 2013** at Miklin Hotel, East Legon, Accra, was aimed at introducing to relevant stakeholders, the project objective, expected outputs and workplan and to seek their inputs to and synergies with other on-going projects as well as on how effectively to implement the project. There were over 20 participants from civil society, industry and government mostly from Accra, Kumasi and Takoradi. Participants to the inception

suggested a number of ways to ensure successful implementation of the project including the need to be critical in the identification of participants and avoid the situation where same familiar faces are brought to training workshops. Thus, it was advised that the project started looking for participants outside the core civil society organizations that have been regular beneficiaries to many training. For example, inviting students and community-based organizations will be more impactful. It was also advised that the project could utilize existing structures in the communities such as communication avenues example being local radio stations and community information centers as well as festivals which are all effective tools of information dissemination.

2. Develop training materials

This project was unique and therefore unique training materials were developed to meet the expectation of the participants and the objective of the training. As such the Consultant engaged to provide the training was also tasked to develop the training material considering the project objective, the output and the expected outcome of the training. These materials, generally, covered the VPA and legality definition in Ghana, the timber supply chain and critical control points and sustainability requirements under the laws and regulations of Ghana. These materials formed the basis of the training workshops as elaborated in the following session.

3. Organize two day training for 30 identified participants

To enable civil society play a critical role of check-and-balances effectively, there is a need to enhance /build the capacity of civil society groups on legality and sustainability requirements along the timber supply chain of Ghana. The project is to build capacity of non-state actors and other stakeholders in the forestry sector on statutory and sustainability requirements, and to widen compliance with and adoption of such requirements by a range of players in the forest sector of Ghana. As part of that effort, a two-day training was organized for 30 participants at the Royal Lamerta Hotel, Kumasi on **29th of October 2013 and 1st November 2014** using training materials described above. This training introduced participant to the statutory definition of legality; the statutory requirements from the forest floor to the shipyard; the FLEGT VPA; and sustainability requirements in the context of Ghana. To enable the team gauge the level of knowledge gained during the training, a questionnaire developed and administered to participants before the commencement of the training. Another questionnaire was administered to also roughly measure the impact of the training and to seek views for improving future events. A comparative analysis of these questionnaires indicated that participants learnt tremendously and wished the training was organized frequently.

4. Organize a two day field study tour for 30 participants to learn about practical operations along the timber supply chain

In order for civil society organizations and other non-state actors to appreciate and internalize legal and sustainability requirements and to be able to contribute to law enforcement through

adherence to such requirements, the project has adopted a field study approach where participants visited operational sites in the forest and processing factory to acquire first-hand information on the processes involved from the forest floor to the shipyard. This training organized on the **30th-31st October** and was led by the Production Manager of the Resource Management Support Center (RMSC) of the Forestry Commission to a logging area in the Asenanyo Forest Reserve, operated by Fabi& Co Ltd, to observe various field operations in the forestry business process chain. The field operations included felling, hauling, loading and transportation of loads. To support the training process, the Range Supervisor of the Asenanyo Forest Reserve and other Forest workers were present. On the second day of the tour, participants tour the processing and factory premises of Logs and Lumber Ltd in Kumasi. Participants tour the factory premises and observed operations at the security gate where logs typically enter the mill; log yard where the logs are scaled and separated for various processing; the veneer mill where veneer sheets are produced and moulding mill where off-cuts are joined to produce various wood products. The participants were informed that currently the company recovers about 60% of raw material input. Below are some of the recommendations and suggestions of participants after the class-room and field learning activities

1. Individuals in a community cannot practically follow every timber operator in the forest and so the adoption of community-based forest monitoring strategies to support the efforts of Forestry Commission could help check forest illegalities.
2. There is the need to embark on massive education and introduce interventions that will change people's mindset on forest law compliance.
3. Agricultural practice such as shifting cultivation is driving encroachment on forest lands which is contributing to deforestation. Better farming methods that make use of agroforestry needs to be adopted to avoid indiscriminate felling of trees.
4. Continuous capacity enhancements of communities should be encouraged for them to know what to monitor and how to monitor.
5. There is the need to develop simple tools at the community levels to measure forestry compliance successes and document evidence for public consumption.
6. The issue of small-scale illegal mining which communities engage in for livelihoods should be looked at critically from the view point of sustainable development.
7. Awareness creation on stakeholder benefits from the forest should be intensified to enable buy-in for forest protection.
8. How do we ensure that trust provided to community NGOs such as Community Forest Committees (CFCs) are not abused in their effort to assist forest regulators in protecting the resource.
9. Regulating the supply of legal timber on the domestic market is an issues that needs to be tackled comprehensively because it is contributing towards forest illegalities in the sector

5. Joint experience sharing platform provided for CSOs & industry

To ensure effectiveness and wider participation of members of industry, civil society organizations, communities and government, resources were pooled together from NFF, Forestry Commission, Friends of the Earth Ghana and Nature & Development Foundation (through support of ITTO and EU) to organize the National Forest Forum for over 150 participant in August 2014. This provided an opportunity for, not only for the wider participation of industry members, but also allows communities to participate and voice their concerns over the management of forest resources in the country. A report of the forum and a statement made by NDF during the forum was captured in the final forum report. A communiqué produced by stakeholders during the forum was also presented to the Minister of Lands and Natural Resources. A press coverage of the event is uploaded on Youtube and is accessible via <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=q9nGKQSU0aY&index=2&list=PLjXJltrICPEzRynormMoHzW6aGahz6bxO>

Output 2: Capacity of at least 50 personnel of CSOs built on modern tools to engage forest authorities and managers in Ghana. This output has been achieved as evidenced from participants responses to questionnaires administered before and after each of the training programmes.

1. Develop training materials

The basis for designing the training on toolkit for engagement with forest authorities and forest manager was that, there is little opportunity for such a training in-country. This meant that any meaningful training for Ghanaian participants ought to design its training materials to meet the expectation of the potential participants. As a result, the Training Consultant was tasked to develop tailor-made materials that were based on capacity need assessment of participants in an earlier exercise conducted to ascertain the relevant tools appropriate for CBOs and NGOs in the forestry sector of Ghana.

2. Organize a two-day training for at least 25 personnel of CSOs on the use of modern tools of engagement

This activity was premised on the fact that CSOs, CBOs and other non-state actors are only as effective in their watchdog as their knowledge of tools to use to engage different stakeholders. Indeed, there are merits in having multiple approaches in engaging different actors to improve governance. In recognition of this, a two day training on the use of modern tools to engage forest authorities and managers was organized on the **14-15 March 2014** at Miklin Hotel, East Legon, using materials designed for such purpose. Again, Knowledge levels of participating CSOs & NSAs (Non state agencies) on tools of engagement were established through the administration

of questionnaires on the first day of the training. The training was very interactive and attracted



WAFPO Civil Society
Engagement Training

29 participants from mostly CBOs and other non-state actors.

The objective of the training was to:

a) Equip civil society organizations with relevant tools for engaging forest authorities and concession holders as well as other relevant forest stakeholders in a bid to contribute to effective forest law enforcement.

b) Assess the levels of advocacy knowledge and skills before and after the training.

The training used both theory and practical methods to effectively impart knowledge and skill in advocacy on forest laws and compliance, a field that have significant implications politically, socially and economically.

The course has been well accepted by the participants based on their high level of participation during the training and the results of their evaluation. Participants on the average have increased by 138% points in their self-assessment ratings suggesting a higher satisfaction in their knowledge and skills level, which has moved from generally Fair-Average to a confident High-Very High. This is a positive indicator for CSOs' capacity moving forward in their advocacy for more effective enforcement of forestry laws. The training was also able to assess the expectations of the participants for further training and this will be a good basis for the Refresher Training planned within the WAFPO timetable.

3. Organize a two day refresher training & lesson sharing for at least 25 personnel of CSOs

Learning is a process, not an event. For forest advocates, it's important to review key concepts; such as tools of engagement on forest law compliance on a regular basis so that, engagement skills and styles stay sharp. Considering the importance of building capacity of non-state actors on tools of engagement with forest authorities and stakeholders, a refresher training on various styles and tools was organized for participants. This allowed a review of the key concepts and skills that participants learned in the previous training workshop. About 25 participants from civil society and community based organization participated in the refresher training organized on the 15 and 16 of October 2014, which allowed sharing of lessons after implementation of training modules in the first training session organized in March 2014. All effort was made to ensure that only participants who participated in the earlier session participated in the refresher training. This was to ensure that, skills among governance advocates remain sharp and that previous learning experience and lessons are retained and kept current.

Before the training started participants rate their existing knowledge and skills on each of the Modules using 1, 2, 3, 4 & 5 noting that 1 is the lowest and 5, the highest. After the training, they were asked to conduct the same assessment. Participants on the average have increased by 35% in their self-assessment ratings suggesting a higher satisfaction in their knowledge and skills

level, which has moved from generally Average to a confident High. The course has been impactful evidenced by their high level of participation during the training and the results of their evaluation. This is a positive indicator for CSOs' capacity moving forward in their advocacy for more effective enforcement of forestry laws. The participants appreciated the fact that the refresher training was designed to respond to the current and practical needs of their advocacy projects. There was a consensus, however, that 1.5 days was not adequate for in-depth learning and interaction. The general recommendation was for three (3) to five (5) days duration for this type of advocacy training.

4. Create an online community of practice to share lessons and experiences

An online community of practice, 'Forum for Forest Governance Ghana' (FFGG) has been created on yammer, a social network, to facilitate information flow and continuous learning on the project and other related issues. The platform allows members to share ideas and discuss issues on the forestry sector. There are currently over 30 participants to the group. The platform is membership based and may be accessed via: <https://www.yammer.com/forumforforestgovernanceghana/#/Threads/index?type=following>

Output 3: Public awareness and interest in forest law enforcement is raised

1. Produce and distribute banners and stickers on forest law compliance

For the purposes of the training and to create visibility for the project and project partners, a roll-up banner with the logos of the project partners and project name was produced and displayed during all functions sponsored by the project. In addition, 3000 pieces of "10 × 4.5" size sticker with impression; Full ColuorSav has been designed, produced and distributed. The sticker received consultations from various stakeholders before printing. This was necessary because the information on the sticker contained some data which is very pertinent and yet very fundamental in raising public awareness of the illegalities in the system. The stickers have been used as a means to create consumer awareness campaign on the impact of illegal wood trade on the economy of Ghana. The Forestry Commission representing the Government of Ghana gave its approval for the production of the stickers. It contains the follow message: "Ghana loses about 65,000 hectare of forest cover annually. About 80% of timber sold in Ghana is illegal and of low quality. Why don't you buy legal wood to save your house and Ghana's remaining forest?" This message has been applauded as being appropriate for the Ghana situation. The stickers also display the logos of the project partners.

2. Gather information for production of documentary

The project team and the media consultant travel to different forest districts, visited the Atewa Forest Reserve, timber contractors and wood sellers to collect relevant information for the production of the video documentary. As pertains to the production of documentary, the team

and the consultant had to revisit the field to get additional details where such information was required.

3. Produce a video documentary with practical information for the general public

One assumption of this project was that raising the awareness of the general public on illegal forestry activities and their consequential effect will correspondingly raise the interest of the general public in forest law enforcement. To create this public awareness, a fifteen (15) minutes video documentary on forest law compliance was produced. The documentary contains interviews with key players in the forestry sector of Ghana and first hand information on illegal activities in the forests of Ghana. The documentary focuses on key issues of illegal timber trade in Ghana and consequences of illegal logging and associated trade for national and individual economy. The content dwelt on individuals and contractors using illegally logged and inferior timber for construction works. The documentary is aimed at increasing public interest in forest law compliance issues. The documentary was produced with kind collaboration with the Forestry Commission, Independent Timber Contractors and Small Scale Wood processing companies in Ghana.

4. Broadcast documentary in collaboration with media houses & also through online sharing platforms.

In fulfillment of the objective of reaching out and encouraging individuals, businesses and communities to take action to demand legally produced timber, the documentary has been played a number of times in GTV24, 8 times on Metro TV, and currently accessible on YouTube (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jfgeDWexObM>). It has also been shared on facebook and Yammer. CD copies of video documentary are available

Schedule

The project lasted for 18 months, starting on 29th May 2013 and officially ended in November 2014.

Project outcome, target beneficiaries involvement

The project specific objective was to build the capacity of civil society organizations and other non-state actors to contribute to forest law enforcement in Ghana. The project has supported government effort to improve forest governance and reduce illegal logging through inclusive and consultative processes that increase the confidence and capacity of civil society organizations and other non-state actors to contribute to effective forest law enforcement. The specific objective, as stated above, has been achieved through the organization of two day training of 30

personnel of CSOs and other non-state actors on statutory and sustainability requirements for dealing in timber right from the forest floor to the shipyard. This training was tailored designed and exposed many CBOs and other non-state actors to first-hand information on the check-and-balances that needs to be complied with. It was acknowledge that statutory and administrative requirements are almost always different from practice and so it was pointed out to the training participants, areas along the timber supply chain where infringements are likely to occur. This training enhanced the knowledge and confidence of participants and has thus contributed to meaningful involvement and constructive criticism of forest management and law compliance in the country by a section of civil society and communities.

Participants are also more confident to choose the right approach, depending on the issue at stake, when engaging forest stakeholders. This is so because a unique training, designed through a consultative process, on toolkits for engagement was conducted for 25 participants of civil society personnel and other non-state actors. A follow up refresher training for another 25 participants ensured that participants actually put the training modules in practice. In all, over 50 personnel of civil society and other non-state actors benefited from the main and refresher training which treated strategic topics of relevance to the operations of NGOs, CBOs, social activists and community members.

The project has also raised public awareness on and interest in forest law compliance and illegal timber in the domestic market through the production and distribution of 3000 stickers (with relevant information) and a 15 minute video documentary which has been played on national TV, uploaded on YouTube, Facebook and Yammer. There were a number of comments on our Facebook wall in reaction to the posting of the video. The YouTube upload has also obtained over 35 views since being uploaded less than a month ago specifically 28th of February 2015.

Before the commencement of the project, many CSOs, CBOs, and other non-state actors had insufficient knowledge and understanding of statutory and sustainability requirements that are the basis of forest management and regulation in the country. Indeed, many beneficiaries of the project had not witnessed practical logging and timber manufacturing processes and therefore, were less aware of the control points along the timber supply chain where illegality could easily happen. Some were not aware of the benefit sharing structure of the forest sector revenue as well as the ownership status of forest in Ghana. The project changed this situation with respect to participants to the training organized under the project. In cognizance of the above situation, the project organized for 30 personnel of CSOs, CBOs and Community members a back-to-back training on legality and sustainability and a field study tour along the timber supply chain. The classroom-type training introduced participants to legality and sustainable forest management in the context of forestry business process; legality as defined by Ghana's VPA; and the timber supply chain in Ghana. Participants were also introduced to governing forest laws in Ghana including the constitutional provision in Article 267(6) on benefit sharing from stool/skin lands and property. It was also stated that forest in Ghana is owned by the landowning community represented by the Chief and held in trust by the President for the people. In other words all

forest on lands not declared as public lands belong to the owners of the land but only held in trust for them by the President. See details in the training report attached. The study tour followed immediately after the classroom introduction and involved observation of practical forest operations and a tracing of the supply chain including understanding and questioning documented requirements from the forest floor to the shipyard. The training also took participants to one of the largest timber processing facilities in Ghana to understand and witness the checks-and-balances; the legal requirements involved in the processing of logs and sustainability requirement as part of voluntary certification requirement. A post-training evaluation indicated that it was the first time most participants have witnessed both forest operation and timber processing. Participants were amazed of the number of checks-and-balances along the supply chain aimed at reducing illegality. It is however understood that many of those requirements are not complied with sometimes because of the negligence and connivance of forest official; incapacity of authorities and most importantly the incapacity of civil society organizations to detect and demand accountability and transparency. With the training, participants are better equipped to contribute to law compliance.

It is also the case that civil society organizations and communities do not have a package of engagement toolkit from which to select the most appropriate approach depending on the exigencies of the situation. As a result inappropriate approaches and methods were adapted with on regard to the uniqueness of the issue and stakeholder in question. Recognizing this, the project facilitated the training of personnel of CSOs and CBOs on tools for engagement. It is a component that has raised interest and elicited the most interactive processes in engaging authorities and forest managers. The training models have been well accepted by the participants based on their high level of participation during the training and the results of their evaluation. Based on these evaluations alone, the project team is confident to submit that the training has had a beneficial impact on participants.

There was high public apathy to forest law enforcement and compliance issues in Ghana. Despite this, there is little dedicated public awareness effort aim at raising public interest. In recognition of this, the project has also produced awareness raising toolkit intended to raise public interest and confidence in the forest sector. The stickers and video documentary as well as the roll-up banner has raised awareness of the general public on illegal logging and forest sector illegality and increase visibility of the project partners.

This project is in consonance with and contributed to CSOs, CBOs and community involvement in the monitoring of the implementation of the Voluntary Partnership Agreement. It is increasingly recognized by forest authorities that CSOs and CBOs are partners in the fight against forest illegality and thus, state and non-state actors are currently collaborating in the

forest sector. This was specifically mentioned by the Chief Executive Office of the Forest Commission, in a speech read on his behalf, during the national forest forum organized in August 2014 and supported by this project. The project has also contributed and in consonance with the government of Ghana effort to pass a public procurement policy on timber and timber products.

The project has a number of stakeholders. Such stakeholders were involved in various stages of the project development and implementation. Below is an indication of how the various stakeholders were involved in the project development to implementation.

a) CSOs and CBOs: Primary project beneficiaries and thus involved in project training and field study tours. The training have enhanced their capacity in terms of issues to look for along the timber supply chain and also how to engage forest authorities

b) Industry: Primary project beneficiary and were involved in project activities through participation in the National Forest Forum. Industry involvement in the forum has improved corporation and relationship with CBOs and CSOs.

c) Traditional Authorities have participated in the forum annually and such participation has strengthened their voices

d) Forestry Commission: The capacity gained by CSOs and CBOs will support the commission in ensuring forest law enforcement and compliance.

Sustainability of project

1) Forest law compliance in Ghana is a major objective of the sustainable forest management agenda of the Government of Ghana and a core aspiration for which the government has entered into a Voluntary Partnership Agreement with the European Union. While the main objective of the Agreement is to ensure that only timber and wood products from Ghana licensed as legal will be allowed to enter the EU market, the government and its partners in-country are taking advantage of the process to streamline the domestic timber market, which is currently responsible for an estimated 50% of total timber harvested in Ghana. For that reason, this project and its activities are geared towards building capacity of organizations and individuals that are already working in the forest sector, specifically at the community level in fighting forest level illegality. This project is a build-on to the VPA FLEGT process and every outcome of the project is essential to, and will be sustained by the VPA FLEGT process in the country.

2) Participants to the training were specifically selected to ensure that the project contribute to their on-going and plan organizational work in the forest sector. Thus, the project beneficiaries are to utilize the capacity building they received in advancing their fight against forest level

illegality and to engage forest authorities and managers, using the appropriate tools of engagement provided by the project, as part of advocacy works.

3) As a sustainability measure, this project was designed in-line with the aspiration of the people and the government of Ghana to eliminate illegal logging and advancing trade in legal timber from Ghana. Strengthening capacity of civil society and other non-state actors on established models of sustainability and legality requirements as well as on modern tools of engagement and advocacy will contribute to improve forest law enforcement and compliance, regulatory system and sustainable forest management as well as enhance revenue collection at the national level. This provision is in-line with article 16 of the VPA between Ghana and the EU, which states “Ghana, in line with its principle of participatory management and protection of forest and wildlife resources, will promote appropriate strategies, modalities and programmes in consultation with relevant stakeholders in the implementation of this Agreement. Again, according to Annex VI of the VPA, the Independent Monitor shall include provision for utilizing information received from stakeholders that are not necessarily directly involved in implementing the Legality Assurance System of Ghana.

4) As a result, the government of Ghana has planned further training and capacity building of civil society and communities to support government on monitoring on the VPA and to bring some confidence and transparency in the implementation of the VPA. This planned capacity building by government of communities and civil society organizations will further ensure the sustainability of the project outcomes.

5) On the public awareness of forest law compliance, the project outcome fits well with the current drive by the government to put into law the procurement of timber and timber products for public works and funded by the tax-payers’ money. The project component on public awareness has prepared the grounds and will be sustained by the initiation of the public procurement policy on timber and timber products.

6) The project has been associated with the National Forest Forum, a platform established to advocate good governance issues in the forest sector. The project adopted an approach of supporting the participation of industry, for the first time, in the forum. Being an on-going annual conference of relevant stakeholders, the participation of industry and other stakeholders has the impact of enhancing transparency and build dialogue in the sector, which dialogue the Forestry Commission is willing to fund beyond the project period.

Assessment and Analysis

The project is based on the rationale that CSOs, CBOs and other non-state actors are very critical stakeholders to provide checks-and-balances in the enforcement of and compliance with forest laws. This checks-and-balances or watchdog is accomplished through engaging and pressurizing governments and other resource manager to comply with laws, regulations and guidelines in the

management, exploitation and distribution of benefits to relevant shareholders of the forest resources. It is also based on the premise that the government of Ghana, for some reasons, is unable to effectively implement the laws it sets for itself as necessary for legal and sustainable management of forest resources. As a result, and considering the relative efficiency of CSOs and other non-state actors, it is envisaged that a stronger, collective civil society front equipped with better tools for engagement, can demand for transparency and better services from the government, natural resource managers and industries.

The project was therefore based on solid premises considering the practical challenges of forest law enforcement and compliance in Ghana. It was identified as critical in filling a gap of capacity of civil society and other non-state actors to engage and expose forest law enforcement issues. It has been critical in dovetailing into the FLEGT VPA process as well as other civil society initiatives such as the ClientEarth Legal Working Groups and Proforest training modules on FLEGT verifications. It emanates from the Executing Agency's long standing engagement with stakeholders and experiences working on legality and sustainability of forest management. The idea was discussed on a number of platforms including during community trainings and fora.

The various discussions with stakeholders on CSOs and other non-state actors' contribution to forest law enforcement and compliance led to the identification of the problem which this project is designed to address, that is, inadequate capacity of CSOs and other non-state actors to contribute effectively to forest law enforcement, and the subsequent formulation of the problem tree. Although the ineffective contribution of CSOs and other non-state actors to forest law enforcement may not solely be due to technical incapacity issue (as other issues of funding, technology, job security, security threat etc), it is acknowledged as the foundation block of effective civil society front. Therefore the project correctly identified one of the critical issues militating against the effective watchdog role of CSOs and other non-state actors. Subsequently, the project objective and implementation approaches as shown in section 2 of this report were developed as a means of achieving the specific objective and thereby contributing to the bigger the development objective of sustainable development and improved governance in the forest sector of Ghana. For the avoidance of doubt, the specific objective of the project was to build capacity of civil society organizations (CSOs) & other non-state actors (NSAs) to contribute to forest law compliance in Ghana.

The project adopted multiple implementation approaches including strategic partnership; training and workshop, field study and learning and innovative visibility and awareness raising campaign. Evaluation reports indicated that some of the approaches including training and workshops should have enough training days so as to allow enough time for interaction and exhaustion of the subject matter of the training. According to participants and consultants, the two days training were not adequate to allow for enough time to cover the subject matter of the training. It

was also suggested to adopt more field study and learning as such approaches provide practical application of learning outcomes.

It is also suggested that public awareness and behavioral change campaigns are expensive processes that require innovative, attention-catching extensive multiple approaches including promos, campaigns and engagement. Therefore adequate budget ought to be provided for such approaches to allow for innovative and extensive engagement of the general public.

The project has experienced challenges with the amount budgeted for some items. The project team realized, within six months into project implementation, that some activities were under-budgeted while others were slightly over-budgeted. To correct such anomalies, a request was made to ITTO for an adjustment of the budget, which requested was granted. This allowed smooth implementation of activities.

Despite the challenges with some approaches as stated above, all the project planned activities were, except in respect to scheduled dates, implemented without modification. All activities remained relevant in the context of the project objective within the period of implementation and so were carried out as planned. Some activities were implemented late because of challenges of consultants meeting deadlines. Some of these included the video documentary and the broadcasting of the documentary which were completed behind scheduled.

The project was implemented within a period of 18 month, specifically, from May 2013 to November 2014. The 18 month was adequate for the implementation of the project activities. It ought to be mentioned that consideration should be made of the time of project team in complying with project reporting requirements after project activities have been completed and budget exhausted. The quality of input demanded and the time requirement during completion reporting and auditing are enormous. However, the time spent by project team during this period is not paid for by the project.

This project was designed principally with CSOs, CBOs and other non-state actors, such as traditional authorities, local communities and individual social activists as primary beneficiaries. As indicated in section 4 above, CSOs and CBOs were closely involved in project training and field study tours. The training has enhanced their capacity and confidence in terms of issues to look for along the timber supply chain and also on how to engage forest authorities. It is however acknowledged that the participation of communities or community members, recognized as essential for building grassroot vigilantes against illegal appropriation of timber and other forest resources, was not as conspicuous as the executants had hoped. It was suggested by local stakeholders during project field monitoring and evaluation visit to replicate the project for local communities using selected forest reserves as pilot.

It is desired that CSOs and industry work consultatively and collaboratively to improve governance and advance the course of sustainable forest management. This is so because the lack of enforcement and non-compliance with forest laws is detrimental to the long-term

sustainability of the resource. The degradation of the forest resources has a negative impact on sustainability of industry as well as on revenue sources of the government. Such a phenomenon also discounts the value of the forest resources for posterity and represents avenue for potential rent-seeking behavior by actors. This project valued the importance of industry participation in the multi-stakeholder platform. As primary beneficiary, industry players were involved in project activities through participation in the National Forest Forum. Industry involvement in the forum has improved corporation and relationship with CSOs and CBOs. Traditional Authorities have participated in the forum annually and such participation has strengthened their voices. The resulting communiqué from participants of the forum was presented to the Minister of Lands and Natural Resources for study and implementation.

The project is directly in-line with Ghana's FLEGT VPA aspirations and so dovetails into capacity demands for non-state actors' FLEGT involvement and monitoring of implementation of the FLEGT VPA as stated in section 4 above. As a result, the capacity gained by CSOs, CBOs and other non-state actors will be relevant to subsequent engagement in FLEGT VPA. For details of other sustainability approaches after project completion, refer to section 4.

Lessons Learned

The project set ambitious targets for training CSOs, CBOs and other non-state actors in Ghana to support and provide check-and-balances in law enforcement and compliance in the forestry sector. The project idea fit perfectly well within the context of forest management in the country. However, the target area was too large for the size of the project. It is also important to note that non-state actors include any groupings that are not government or quasi-government, thus making the potential beneficiaries a little larger for the size of this project. An 18 month duration with a total budget, including counterpart funding, of \$188,456.00, the project became focused on civil society organizations or community activists instead of the broader amorphous description of non-state actors.

Aspects of the project got delayed because some Consultants felt some sense of entitlement once he/she has been selected, made to fill the ITTO E-Hform and informed that a No Objection Letter has been granted. On a number of occasions, the Project Team had to change consultants to avoid unnecessary delays to project implementation.

The training components of the project including the field study learning along the timber supply chain and toolkits for engagement were innovative, field-oriented and tailored to the needs of participants. The content of the training materials were designed based on earlier suggestions of potential participants during the application process. However, the time allocated for the training was thought to be short for adequate interaction and elaboration on the subject matter of the training. It is suggested that at least a full 2-3 days will be required to cover the subject of toolkit for engagement strategies. Same was made of the field study learning.

In terms of project design, it was thought that more concentration should be paid to community members since they are likely to remain at the community than would an NGO worker remain as an employee of his/her current organization, such that once the focus of his/her employer changes, the individual employee cannot do much but to gear towards that organizational goal.

The project was based on assumption that participants will utilize the knowledge gained from the training to engage other stakeholders through the FLEGT VPA processes and community fora being organized by National Forest Forum –Ghana (supported by NDF) and Forest Watch Ghana. However, there are other factors of logistics, beyond the scope of this project, which are necessary to ensure that participants put their knowledge into effective use to contribute to law enforcement and compliance. They include technological gadgets to collect evidence, vehicles to visit the field, and system of feedback of information among others. Inadequate funding of CSOs and CBOs is of particular importance in militating against the effectively utilization of training outcomes.

b) Operational matters such as:

Project organization and management was perfectly done and there were almost no challenges with management. The project almost experienced some challenges of financial reporting when the substantive Finance Manager Executing Agency passed on within the first quarter of the project. However, timely internal arrangement and recruitment of a new Finance Manager resolved the issue. Mentioned should be made that there was a negative balance at the end of project, which deficit was borne by the Executing Agency. This is reflected in the attached financial statement in Annex II. It is important to note that the disbursement of funds to project account was timely. Within the 18 months of the project, there were no challenges with flow of funds. Therefore, hardly any challenges encountered can be attributed to cash flow problems.

This project was implemented on behalf of the government of Ghana. As such, almost all activities, especially those that involve general public awareness such as stickers and video documentary, have to be done with the expressed approval of the content by the government of Ghana. In many occasions, it was challenging to get the comments of the government representative. This led to a number of delays of some activities.

Within the period of the project implementation, the project team had to request for budget modification because it was realized that the cost of car rental, hotel accommodation and other budget items were higher than budgeted. The rearrangements within the approved budget ensure that the challenge with the budget was solved.

Conclusions and recommendation

The project identification involved consultation with relevant primary beneficiaries that expressed the need for such capacity building. The project idea also emanates from the Executing Agency's longstanding involvement in the building capacity of industry and

communities on responsible forest management. Therefore the consultative process involved in the project identification process was adequate for and contributed to the achievement of the project objective.

The project was designed to benefit specifically civil society and other non-state actors. However, the scope is so broad for the size of the project. Consequently, the implementation became lopsided and focused on civil society. Therefore not all non-state actors in the forest sector were covered adequately despite the title and objective of the project. It is recommended that small-sized projects should focus on limited geographic area, preferably as pilot, using focused group (ie civil society or CBOs or Communities) to demonstrate the feasibility of such projects. The temptation is to spread the funds thinly and with little or no follow up activities. Follow up activities are essential to ensure continuity and confidence enhancement of CSOs, CBOs and communities.

The project gave insights and inspired many participants to understand and engage stakeholders in the forest sector to contribute to effective law enforcement and compliance. It is suggested that attempt be made to adopt more field based training with enough days and appropriate budget to allow for adequate interaction. In addition, small size projects, such as this, are efficient. However, such projects hardly allows for organizational development that will ensure capacity of Executing Agencies to continue to engage and train others for effective law compliance.

This project was relevant for addressing forest law enforcement and compliance issues and can be modified to include technology for gathering evidence, a feedback process for accepting and storing such evidence and incentive system for volunteers. It is important to note that, it can be designed to benefit selected communities around production reserves with the assumption that such communities are the custodians of the forest resources and if benefit sharing arrangement allows, the communities stand to benefit significantly from protecting the forest resources than allowing chainsaw logging and other illegal farming activities.

Responsible for the Report

Name: **Mustapha Seidu**

Project Coordinator

Date: March 2015

		12.1 Logging Operations Consultant				
		12.2 Timber Processing Supervisors				
		12.30				
	19.	Component Total:			\$57,010.00	GHC 127,543.09
20.	Sub-contracts				\$13,083.55	GHC 33,016.00
	21.	Materials development & Facilitation fee				
	21.1.1	Materials on tools of engagement			\$800.00	GHC 2,152.00
	21.1.2	Materials on Legality and Sustainability			\$800.00	GHC 1,520.00
		Materials on tools of engagement-refresher				
		Facilitation on CSOs and Industry Forum				
	22.0	Third Party Engagement				
	22.1	Training on Legality & Sustainability			\$1,800.00	GHC 3,420.00
	22.2	Training on Tools of Engagement			\$1,600.00	GHC 4,304.00
	22.3	Training on Tools of Engagement-Refresher			\$1,600.00	GHC 4,304.00
	22.4	Forum for CSOs and Industry			\$5,522.68	GHC 14,856.00
		Communications & Visibility				
		Design & Publishing of Reports				
		Production of Banners & stickers			\$960.87	GHC 2,460.00
		Video Documentry				
		Dev't of documentry				
		Broadcasting of Documentry				
	29.	Component Total:			\$13,083.55	GHC 33,016.00
30.	Travel meetings & Workshop				\$41,564.07	GHC 88,834.38

	31.	Daily Subsistence Allowance				
		31.1 National Expert(s)/Consultant(s)			\$2,571.99	GHC 6,224.70
		31.2 International Consultant(s)				
		31.3 Vehicle Rental			\$3,857.61	GHC 8,182.93
	32.	Travel			\$0.00	
		32.1 Air Ticket				
		32.2 Workshop Meals & refreshment			\$9,536.01	GHC 20,070.92
		32.3 Transportation for participants			\$9,598.67	GHC 20,513.50
		33.1 Accomodation for participants			\$15,205.90	GHC 32,106.81
		33.2 Venue for workshops & Training			\$793.89	GHC 1,735.52
		33.3 Workshop Logistics				
	39.	Component Total:			\$41,564.07	GHC 88,834.38
40.	Capital Items					
	44.	Capital Equipment			\$746.87	GHC 1,419.05
		44.1 Laptop			\$746.87	GHC 1,419.05
	49.	Component Total:			\$746.87	GHC 1,419.05
50.	General Office Expenses				\$7,200.00	GHC 17,172.00
	51.	Telephone & Internet				
	52.	Office Rent			\$7,200.00	GHC 17,172.00
	53.	Office Supplies				
	54.	Distribution of Published Reports				
	59.	Component Total:			\$7,200.00	GHC 17,172.00
60.	Miscellaneous				\$0.00	
	61.	Sundry				
	62.	Audit costs				
	63.	Contingencies				

	69.	Component Total:			\$0.00	
70.		National Management Costs			\$0.00	
	71.	Executing Agency Management Costs				
	72.	Focal Point Monitoring				
	79.	Component Total:			\$0.00	
		Total Expenditures To-date:			\$119,604.48	GHC 267,984.52
		Remaining Balance of Funds (A-B):			\$9,630.52	GHC 17,454.13
Notes:		(1) Amounts in U.S. dollars are converted using the average rate of exchange when funds were received by the Executing Agency.				
		(2) Amount of expenditures in US dollar should be the same as amount shown in column (C) of the Financial Statement (exported with direct link from the Cash Flow Statement).				
		(3) Submit bank reconciliation statement along with the bank statements to support the remaining balances/funds in the Cash Flow Statement.				

ANNEX 2: Project Financial Statement

PROJECT FINANCIAL STATEMENT								
Project No. TFL028/12					Period ending on: June 2013 to November 30, 2014			
Project Title: Empowering Civil Society Organizations and other non-state Actors to Effectively Contribute to Forest Law Compliance In Ghana								
				Modified				
		Component	Original	Approved	Expenditures To-date			Available
			Amount	Amount	Accrued	Expended	Total	Funds
			(A)	(A)	(B)	(C)	(D)	(E)
					a/		{ B + C }	{ A - D }
I.	<u>Funds managed by Executing Agency</u>							
10.	Project Personnel							
11.	National Experts (long term)			\$57,010.00		\$57,010.00	\$57,010.00	\$0.00
	11.1 Project Coordinator			\$41,400.00		\$41,400.00	\$41,400.00	\$0.00
	11.3 Programme Driver			\$4,330.00		\$4,330.00	\$4,330.00	(\$0.00)
	11.4 Finance Manager			\$11,280.00		\$11,280.00	\$11,280.00	(\$0.00)
12.	Other Personnel							
14.	International Consultant(s)							
	14.1 Training on Tools of Engagement							
15.	Fellowships and Training							
19.	Component Total:			\$57,010.00		\$57,010.00	\$57,010.00	\$0.00
20.	Sub-contracts			\$22,049.40	\$8,500.00	\$13,083.55	\$21,583.55	\$465.85
	21	Materials Development and						

		Facilitation Fees						
	21.1	Materials on tools of engagement	\$800.00		\$800.00	\$800.00	\$800.00	\$0.00
	21.1	Materials on legality and sustainability	\$800.00		\$800.00	\$800.00	\$800.00	\$0.00
	22.0	Third Party Engagement						
	22.1	Training on legality and sustainability	\$2,000.00		\$1,800.00	\$1,800.00	\$1,800.00	\$200.00
	22.2	Training on tools of engagement	\$1,600.00		\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00	\$0.00
	22.3	Training on tools of engagement-refresher	\$1,600.00		\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00	\$0.00
	22.4	Forum for CSOs and industry	\$4,800.00		\$5,522.68	\$5,522.68	\$5,522.68	(\$722.68)
	23	Communication & and Visibility						
	23.1	Design and Publishing of Reports						
	23.3	Production of Banners and Stickers	\$1,949.40		\$960.87	\$960.87	\$960.87	\$988.53
	23.2	Distribution of Published Reports						
	24.0	Video Documentary						
	24.1	Dev't of Documentary	\$4,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$0.00	\$4,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$0.00
	24.2	Broadcasting of Documentary	\$4,500.00	\$4,500.00	\$0.00	\$4,500.00	\$4,500.00	\$0.00
	29.	Component Total:	\$22,049.40	\$8,500.00	\$13,083.55	\$21,583.55	\$21,583.55	\$465.85
30.		Travel, Meetings and Workshop	\$39,400.25		\$41,564.07	\$41,564.07	\$41,564.07	(\$2,163.82)
	31.	Daily Subsistence Allowance	\$5,000.00		\$6,429.60	\$6,429.60	\$6,429.60	(\$1,429.60)
		31.1 National Expert(s)/Consultant(s)	\$2,000.00		\$2,571.99	\$2,571.99	\$2,571.99	(\$571.99)
		31.2 International Consultant(s)						

		31.3 Vehicle Rental		\$3,000.00		\$3,857.61	\$3,857.61	(\$857.61)
	32.	International Travel						
		32.3 Air Tickets						
	33.	Local Transport Costs		\$34,400.25		\$35,134.47	\$35,134.47	(\$734.22)
		33.1 Workshop Meals and Refreshment		\$9,200.00		\$9,536.01	\$9,536.01	(\$336.01)
		33.2 Transportation for Participants		\$9,200.25		\$9,598.67	\$9,598.67	(\$398.42)
		33.3 Accomodation for Participants		\$15,200.00		\$15,205.90	\$15,205.90	(\$5.90)
		33.4 Venue for Workshop and Training		\$800.00		\$793.89	\$793.89	\$6.11
	39.	Component Total:		\$39,400.25		\$41,564.07	\$41,564.07	(\$2,163.82)
40.	Capital Items							
	44.	Capital Equipment		\$600.00		\$746.87	\$746.87	(\$146.87)
		44.1 Computer Equipment (laptop)		\$600.00		\$746.87	\$746.87	(\$146.87)
	49.	Component Total:		\$600.00		\$746.87	\$746.87	(\$146.87)
50.	General Office Expenses			\$7,200.00		\$7,200.00	\$7,200.00	\$0.00
	51.	Telephone & Internet						
	52.	Office Rent		\$7,200.00		\$7,200.00	\$7,200.00	\$0.00
	54.	Office Supplies						
	55	Distribution of Published Reports						
	59.	Component Total:		\$7,200.00		\$7,200.00	\$7,200.00	\$0.00

60.	Miscellaneous		\$3,000.0 0	\$3,000.0 0	\$0.00	\$3,000.0 0	\$0.00
61.	Sundry						
62.	Audit Costs		\$3,000.0 0	\$3,000.0 0	\$0.00	\$3,000.0 0	\$0.00
63.	Contingencies						
69.	Component Total:		\$3,000.0 0	\$3,000.0 0	\$0.00	\$3,000.0 0	\$0.00
70.	National Management Costs						
71.	Executing Agency Management Costs						
72.	Focal Point Monitoring						
79.	Component Total:						
	Sub-Total:	\$0.00	\$129,259 .65	\$11,500. 00	\$119,604 .48	\$131,104 .48	(\$1,844. 83)
80.	Project Monitoring & Administration						b/
81.	ITTO Monitoring and Review						b/
82.	ITTO Mid-term and Ex-post Evaluation						b/
83.	ITTO Programme Support Costs						b/
84.	Donor Monitoring Costs						
89.	Component Total:						b/
90.	Refund of Pre-Project Costs (Pre-Project Budget)						b/
	Sub-Total:			\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	b/

