



**INTERNATIONAL TROPICAL
TIMBER COUNCIL**

**COMMITTEE ON
REFORESTATION AND FOREST MANAGEMENT**

Distr.
GENERAL

CRF(XLVIII)/5
22 September 2014

ENGLISH ONLY

FORTY-EIGHTH SESSION
3 – 8 November 2014
Yokohama, Japan

**EX-POST EVALUATION REPORT ON
ITTO COMPLETED PROJECT PD 396/06 Rev.2 (F)**

**STRATEGY FOR DEVELOPING PLANTATION FORESTS:
A CONFLICT RESOLUTION APPROACH IN INDONESIA**

Prepared for ITTO

by

ZHUANG Zuofeng

Acknowledgements

I would like to offer my thanks to all the people who are involved in the mission, particularly to ITTO project manager Dr. Hwan-ok Ma, project officer Mr. Li Qiang and Ms Elsie Yang for their effective coordination and facilitation. Whilst there are too many to thank individually, who provided warm hospitality, facilitated my itinerary, shared information and gave strong supports during my visit to Indonesia, including Ms. Nining Ngudi Purnamaningtyas, deputy director of technical cooperation of the Center for International Cooperation, Ms. Lasmini Adi, secretariat of Directorate General of Forestry Utilization, and Mr. Irfan Cahyadi and Ms Teis Nuraini, Center for International Cooperation, and other people who provided technical, administrative and personal support for the evaluation. Mr. Andi Andriadi, the former project coordinator, who accompanied me in the field contributed a lot of valuable insights.

Sincere thanks are due to the people met during the field visits, particular the farmers, village group, village leader and the field staff of the plantation forest concessionaire of PT. Wira Karya Sakti who enthusiastically shared their experiences and visions with me for the future of their collaboratively managed forests.

ZHUANG Zuofeng

ACRONYMS

GOI	Government of Indonesia
ITTC	International Tropical Timber Committee
ITTA	International Tropical Timber Agreement
ITTO	International Tropical Timber Organization
LFM	Logical Framework Matrix
MOFI	Ministry of Forestry of Indonesia
PSC	Project Steering Committee
YPO	Yearly Plan of Operation
PIU	Project Implementing Unit

Contents

Executive Summary	1
1. INTRODUCTION	6
1.1 Background	6
1.2 Project Identification	6
1.3 Project Context	7
2. EVALUATION SCOPE, FOCUS AND APPROACH	8
3. PROJECT FACTS	9
4. FINDINGS, LESSONS LEARNED	11
4.1 Findings	11
4.1.1 Project Achievements	11
4.1.2 Project formulation and implementation	18
4.2 Lessons learned	23
5. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	25
5.1 Conclusions	25
5.2 Recommendations	26
6. REFERENCES	29
7. ANNEXES	30

Executive Summary

This ex-post evaluation is an assessment of ITTO supported project of *Strategy for Developing Plantation Forest: A Conflict Resolution Approach in Indonesia (ITTO PD 396/06 Rev. 2 (F))* by strengthening collaboration between farmer group and the plantation forest concessionaire. The primary purpose of the evaluations is: *“to guide or advice on the further implementation of the evaluated Project and/or on the formulation and implementation of future projects, to provide a concise diagnosis of PD 396/06 Rev. 2 (F) so as to point out the successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for successes and failures, and the contribution of the projects towards the achievement of ITTO's Objective 2000, and to draw lessons that can be used to improve similar projects in the future.”* The field visit took place on 17-23 August 2014, and the basic information about the Project is shown in the following table.

Project Title	Strategy for Developing Plantations Forest: A Conflict Resolution Approach in Indonesia
Project Number	ITTO PD 396/06 Rev. 2 (F)
Executive Agency	Directorate of Plantation Forest Development, Directorate General of Forest Utilization, Ministry of Forestry in collaboration with Provincial Forest Service of Jambi and Provincial Forest Service of South Kalimantan
Duration and Starting Date	Planned 36 months with a 19 months extension. Actual 55 months in total starting from December 2007
Budgets (US\$)	Total: US\$ 645,694 (ITTO grant US\$508,234, GOI contribution US\$137,640)
Country	Indonesia

Context and background

The social conflict among stakeholders especially between local community and plantation forest concessionaire was a major problem in determining the progress of plantation forest development in Indonesia. The collaborative forest management was desired as practical means to address this social conflict. However, in developing collaborative plantation forest, there were lack of strategy and mechanism for collaborative plantation forest in term of acceptance of current strategy in plantation forest development, availability of demonstration areas, and poor capacity of local community in adopting strategy and legal framework,

managing nursery and producing vegetative propagation, conducting appropriate planting and maintaining planted trees, and executing proper financial management.

Major achievements

Two specific objectives were achieved by the project, namely: 1) a collaborative plantation forest management approach is made available, and 2) conditions are established for the adoption of the approach by relevant stakeholders. The first specific objective was achieved by developing, adopting and demonstrating “Strategy, Legal Framework and Institutional Arrangement of Collaborative Plantation Forest Management”, “Collaborative Plantation Forest Development Strategy” and “Practical Mechanism of Conflict Resolution on Plantation Forest Development in Indonesia” in Jambi and South Kalimantan provinces. The second specific objective was materialized by improving capacity of farmer groups through various trainings. MOUs of collaborative plantation forest management between farmer groups and plantation forest concessionaire regulated the demonstration site activities.

Lessons learned

An appropriate time should be selected to conduct the ex-post evaluation using the main approach of LFM. Strategic solutions to conflicts of plantation forest management in Indonesia could be facilitated by strengthening governance with communication platforms and participation forums. The mid-term and long-term sustainability of the project would depend on the design and implementation of supportive policies and legal framework to apply and further improve the project's outcomes. Village nursery should be established to provide seedlings for the demonstration planting. Appropriate policy and institution such as communication forum would be needed at least within region governmental level. Training materials were only in local language, which were not applicable for future dissemination of project outputs.

Conclusions

The project addressed a real and critic problem of conflicts between local community and plantation forest concessionaire in plantation forest management. The strategy, legal framework, and mechanism developed by the project were practical, effective and applicable. The design was sufficient and the implementation strategy conformed to prevailing conditions and formulated assumptions. Planned activities were fitted to outputs indicators and specific objectives of the project.

Recommendations

For Executive Agency

- Project design should be well developed, which determines the success and effectiveness of a project. Key stakeholders and partners should be identified from the very beginning and their roles and responsibilities should be clarified at different phases in the project management cycle. Advantage and disadvantage situation should be assessed prior to the project implementation. If the approval process lasts a fair long time, situation of the project site should be reevaluated when the first YPO is developed to ensure the interventions of project are still valid and appropriate.
- Mechanism should be developed to motivate and encourage the local forest authorities and professionals to actively join the project implementation and follow-up maintenance. Government support and facilitation would be provided to ensure continuation of collaborative plantation activities under the MOU. Legislation should be available to ensure the long-term impact of the project achievement and sustainable management of the plantations in Indonesia.
- MOU should be a long term agreement and reviewed regularly to meet the changing situation and actual needs; MOUs should not only stipulate the rights and obligations of parties but also define benefit sharing rule of products and goods harvested from collaborative plantations. The farmer group and the concessionaire should collaboratively work out act plan to deal with the emerging troubles in the demonstrations under the MOU.

- Capacity building should be continuously provided for the villagers under the government capacity building programs. Technical supports from local forest authority still needed to help farmer group to monitor the growth of the planted trees, develop the management plan for the collaborative plantation forests.
- Collaborative plantation forest development could be extended in site level. The collaborative plantation forest development as conflict resolution approach offered by the project may very little compare to expanded conflicts happen in plantation forest development. However, it is recommended to implement the strategy and mechanism of collaborative plantation forest development to resolve the conflict at site level since it could show positive and promising results.

For ITTO

- Implementing a forest project for over three years, the mid-term evaluation is necessary and helpful and should be done on a proper time to guide the implementation over the project period and modify this implementation strategy to keep the project on the right track. The ex-post evaluation should be done soon after the project completion so as to get the right information about the project impact from the feedback of the project beneficiaries.
- The project design and the LFM should be well developed. The planned activities should be strongly linked to the achievement of project outputs and contributive to the project objectives. The logical connection amongst project development objective, specific objective, output and activity should be clearly analyzed.
- Field offices should be set up to closely connect to the project sites and the implementing approaches should be innovated. The project management team should consist of the technical team and implementing team, and the role of two teams should be clearly defined.
- The entry meeting and the exit meeting including representatives of the executive agency, project manager, key project staff and villagers are extremely important for the ex-post evaluation to define the experiences and lessons learned and their potential for dissemination and introduction elsewhere.

- All project documents and materials, particular the critic official letters on important decisions should be in English and well kept for a fairly long time for future check, usually at least five years after the project ends.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The Committee on Reforestation and Forest Management at its forty-seven session on 25-30 November 2013 decided to conduct the ex-post evaluation of ITTO Project PD 396/06 Rev. 2 (F) in order to establish how well the Project served its purposes, its degree of effectiveness and efficiency, and its sustainability, as well as to learn lessons and to draw conclusions and recommendations for ITTO and the project executive agency for future projects, by collecting information, on-spot assessment and in-depth analysis of the performance and impact of the project after its completion.

The ITTO Manual for project monitoring, review, reporting and evaluation (3rd edition, ITTO 2009) states that *“The purpose of an evaluation is to guide or advice on the further implementation of the evaluated Project and/or on the formulation and implementation of future Projects”* and that *“evaluation looks beyond the constituent elements of the Project, to the validity of its design and to its impact.”* This evaluation is an ex-post evaluation of ITTO supported project in Indonesia with developing new strategy and approach on plantations forest development. The primary purpose of this evaluation, as stated in the ToR (see Annex 1) is *“to provide a concise diagnosis of PD 396/06 Rev. 2 (F) so as to point out the successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for successes and failures, and the contribution of the projects towards the achievement of ITTO's Objective 2000, and to draw lessons that can be used to improve similar projects in the future.”*

1.2 Project Identification

The project was approved and fully funded by ITTO at the 41st ITTC Session in 2006. The agreement regulating the implementation of the project was forwarded to the Government of Indonesia on 18 July 2006 for signature and duly signed by all parties on 7 December 2006. The first disbursement of funds was made on 21 November 2007. Duration of the project was initially planned for 36 months and a 19 month-extension without additional funds was granted

by ITTO to fully achieve its expected objectives. The general information about the project evaluated are as follows.

Project Title: Strategy for Developing Plantations Forest: A Conflict Resolution Approach in Indonesia

Project Number: PD 396/06 Rev. 2 (F)

Executive Agency: Directorate of Plantation Forest Development, Directorate General of Forest Utilization, Ministry of Forestry in collaboration with Provincial Forest Service of Jambi and Provincial Forest Service of South Kalimantan

Duration: Planned 36 months with a 19 months extension. Actual 55 months in total starting from December 2007

Budgets (US\$): US\$ 645,694, in which,
ITTO grant US\$ 508,234, GOI contribution US\$ 137,640

Host Country: Indonesia

Target Area: Sub District of Mendahara Ulu, Region of Tanjung Jabung Timur, Jambi province; Sub District of Bintang Ara, Region of Tabalong, South Kalimantan province

1.3 Project Context

The Project aimed to increase production from plantation forests to meet domestic and export demand for raw materials thereby reducing reliance on natural forest extraction. Its specific objectives were that i) a collaborative plantation forest management approach is made available, and ii) conditions are established for the adoption of a collaborative plantation forest management approach by relevant stakeholders.

The Project fits into ITTO's strategic context in several aspects. It complies with ITTA 1994 objectives by contributing the process of sustainable development, enhancing the capacity of members to implement a strategy for achieving exports of tropical timber products from sustainably managed sources by year 2000, and encouraging member to support and develop

industrial tropical timber reforestation and forest management activities as well as rehabilitation of dependent on forest resources.

The project is also consistent with ITTO Yokohama Action Plan 2002 - 2006 in the field of Reforestation and Forest Management, specifically the goal of supporting activities to secure the tropical timber resource base and the goal of promoting sustainable management of tropical forest resources by developing innovative mechanisms and relevant legislative frameworks including incentives and market-based instruments to secure and expand the forest resources base; by encouraging and assisting members appropriately to secure the forest resource base through the implementation of forest policy, legislation and associated strategies, revised and updated national guidelines and regulations for forest utilization which ensure local stakeholder rights and secure conservation and environmental services; by monitoring and assessing the environmental, social and economic costs and benefits of forest plantation development and utilize the information to promote new plantations within the ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests; by encouraging and assisting members appropriately to test and enhance examples of collaborative forest management for tropical production forests and to establish and manage forests for multiple uses in close cooperation with local forest owners and communities living in forest areas.

2. EVALUATION SCOPE, FOCUS AND APPROACH

The evaluation was to learn lessons and to draw conclusions from this project for future projects by assessing all aspect of the project from its inception to its completion regarding administrative and financial matters, organization, communication, consultation and cooperation, technical matters, effectiveness and impact, relevance to ITTO, etc. The focus of this evaluation was guided by the evaluation framework described in ITTO Manual for project monitoring, review, reporting and evaluation (2009) and the detailed "Scope of Work" contained in the ToR (Annex 1).

The approach taken in conducting the evaluation included: desk review of project-related documents and ITTO guidelines/manuals of conducting ex-post project evaluation prior to the mission; meetings, interviews, consultations with project stakeholders and target beneficiaries in group or individually in Jakarta and Jambi province during a mission to Indonesia on 17-23 August, 2014; review of key project products including progress reports, minutes of PSC meetings and technical reports. Discussions also took place with relevant district officials, farmers and other stakeholders during the field visit (Annex 2).

At the end of the field mission a debriefing presentation (Annex 3) was made in Jakarta to representatives of the Indonesia Ministry of Forestry to present the key finding of the evaluation and to obtain their feedbacks.

3. PROJECT FACTS

The project “Strategy for Plantation Forest Development: A Conflict Resolution Approach in Indonesia” was a follow up project of ITTO pre-project PPD 56/02 (F): “Strengthening Central and Sub-National Institution to Enhance Plantation Forest Development in Jambi and South Kalimantan”, which carried out in 2004/2005. The pre-project identified key problems in developing plantation forest in Indonesia.

Among these problems, the social conflict among stakeholders especially between local community and plantation forest concessionaire had increasingly become a major problem in determining the progress of plantation forest development. The collaborative forest management was desired since it could provide other sources of welfare for the community surrounding forest areas and as it could also use as practical means to address social conflicts. However, in developing collaborative plantation forest, there were critical issues to be considered namely (i) lack of strategy and mechanism for collaborative plantation forest in term of acceptance of current strategy in plantation forest development, availability of demonstration areas; and (ii) poor capacity of local community in adopting strategy and legal

framework, managing nursery and producing vegetative propagation, conducting appropriate planting and maintaining planted trees, and executing proper financial management.

Based on the findings of the pre-project, the development objective of the project was defined to increase the production from plantation forests to meet domestic and export demand for raw materials thereby reducing the reliance on natural forest extraction. One specific objective of the project was to make available a collaborative plantation forest management approach and the other specific objective was to create enabling/favorable conditions for the adoption of the approach by relevant stakeholders. To fulfill both specific objectives, the project identified six outputs to achieve the objectives by addressing the key problems of plantation forest development relating to conflicts among stakeholders especially between communities living in and around forest areas with plantation forest concessionaires. The six outputs were:

- The strategy, legal framework and institution of the collaborative plantation forest management in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are accepted by all concerned stakeholders
- Demonstration areas for the collaborative plantation forest management in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are selected, prepared and agreed by all concerned stakeholders.
- The local community and industrial commercial plantation forest companies in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are able to adopt the strategy, legal framework and institution of the collaborative plantation forest management.
- 100 ha of demonstration areas of collaborative plantation forest of selected species are established each in Jambi and South Kalimantan.
- 10 farmers are well trained in establishing a small nursery and producing mass production of vegetative propagation of selected species, 10 selected persons from communities are trained in financial arrangement and management, and 50 farmers surrounding the project location are well-trained in planting and maintaining selected species.
- Contractual arrangement for the involvement of local stakeholders as project partners was adapted.

The project was executed by Directorate of Plantation Forest Development, Directorate General of Forest Utilization, Ministry of Forestry of Indonesia, with a total budget of US\$ 645,694, out of which ITTO grant US\$ 508,234 and the contribution of Government of Indonesia (GOI) in the amount of US\$ 137,460. Duration of the project was initially planned for 36 months and a 19 months extension without additional budget was approved by project steering committee and endorsed by the ITTO for accomplishing the planned project activities and fully achieving its expected objectives.

No mid-term evaluation was carried out within the project lifespan, including the planned project duration of 36 months and later the 19 months extension period. Progress reports were submitted the ITTO secretariat on a regular basis.

4. FINDINGS, LESSONS LEARNED

4.1 Findings

4.1.1 Project Achievements

Project objective and outputs were achieved in line with LFM

The project designed activities had a strong linkage with project outputs and project objectives as stated in the logical framework matrix (Annex 4). Implementation of the outputs had been facilitated with background studies and relevant stakeholders' consultations. The strategy for collaborative plantation forest management covered the topics of landscape spatial allocation for plantation forest development; institutional organization of a local/site management unit level; capacity enhancement for community and forest farmer empowerment; equity distribution in benefit sharing; building relationships that enhance social-political synergy; and retaining contextual stability of collaboration.

Vertically, six outputs were identified to achieve two specific objectives by implementing thirty-three activities to address the key problem of plantation forest development relating to conflicts among stakeholders especially between communities living in and around forest areas

with plantation forest concessionaires. See the details in LFM (Annex 4).

Output 1.1: The strategy, legal framework and institution of the collaborative plantation forest management in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are accepted by all concerned stakeholders, through implementing activity 1.1.1 - activity 1.1.5.

Output 1.2: Demonstration areas for the collaborative plantation forest management in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are selected, prepared and agreed by all concerned stakeholders, through implementing activity 1.2.1 - activity 1.2.3.

Output 2.1: The local community and industrial commercial plantation forest companies in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are able to adopt the strategy, legal framework and institution of the collaborative plantation forest management, through implementing activity 2.1.1 - activity 2.1.3.

Output 2.2: 10 farmers are well trained in establishing a small nursery and producing mass production of vegetative propagation of selected species, through implementing activity 2.2.1 - activity 2.2.4.

Output 2.3: 50 farmers surrounding the project location are well-trained in planting and maintaining selected species, through implementing activity 2.3.1 - activity 2.3.4.

Output 2.4: 100 ha of demonstration areas of collaborative plantation forest of selected species are established each in Jambi and South Kalimantan, through implementing activity 2.4.1 - activity 2.4.8.

Output 2.5: 10 selected persons from communities are trained in financial arrangement and management, through implementing activity 2.5.1 - activity 2.5.3.

Output 2.6 Contractual arrangement for the involvement of local stakeholders as project partners adapted, through implementing activity 2.6.1 - activity 2.6.2.

Horizontally, two specific objectives were achieved by the project, namely: 1) a collaborative

plantation forest management approach is made available, and 2) conditions are established for the adoption of the approach by relevant stakeholders.

The first specific objective of the project had been achieved through finalizing three policy documents for collaborative plantation forest development and establishing demonstration sites of collaborative plantation forest management in Jambi and South Kalimantan provinces. The strategy for developing collaborative plantation forest and the mechanism of collaborative plantation forest establishment through conflict resolution approach had been formulated and documented through the project technical reports of Volume 1 and Volume 4-A and Volume 4-B, namely:

- Technical Report Volume 1: “Output 1.1. The Strategy, Legal Framework, and Institution Arrangement of Collaborative Plantation Forest Management in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are accepted by all concerned stakeholders”.
- Technical Report Volume 4-A: “Strategy for Developing Collaborative Plantation Forest : A Conflict Resolution Approach in Indonesia”
- Technical Report Volume 4-B : “Practical Mechanism of Conflict Resolution on Plantation Forest Development in Indonesia”

The achievement of the second specific objective had been materialized through: identification of conflicts areas involving community and plantation forest concessionaries as well as an initial benefit sharing agreement between communities and plantation forest concessionaires; improved capacity of farmer groups in communications and plantation establishment through various trainings; demonstration site activities facilitating the effective designing and implementation of plantation activities; and two MOUs of collaborative plantation forest management agreed between farmer groups and plantation forest concessionaire.

The achievements in obtaining the six outputs were summarized as:

Output 1.1: The strategy, legal framework and institution of the collaborative plantation forest management in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are accepted by all concerned stakeholders.

- Two workshops on strategy for collaborative plantation forest management were held in Jambi and in South Kalimantan in 2009 to receive feedbacks on a first draft strategy.
- More discussions and consultations to improve the draft strategy were conducted with universities, NGOs, National Forestry Council and others, a strategy and mechanism for collaborative plantation forest management was endorsed by a National Workshop held in March 2012 with a positive response to the project outcome.

Output 1.2: Demonstration areas for the collaborative plantation forest management in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are selected, prepared and agreed by all concerned stakeholders.

- Potential areas facing conflicts between communities and plantation forest concessionaires were surveyed with identification of their willingness to work with the project.
- Demonstration areas were established for 50 hectares in South Kalimantan Province and 55 hectares in Jambi Province.

Output 2.1: The local community and industrial commercial plantation forest companies in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are able to adopt the strategy, legal framework and institution of the collaborative plantation forest management

- A participatory rural appraisal involving all stakeholders in the demonstration areas for the collaborative plantation forest was carried out to establish their legal framework, organization and institution for collaborative plantation forest management development.
- Two farmer groups were recognized and established in Jambi, Harepan Mulia Lestari with 23 farmers; and in Bina Hutan Lestari with 20 farmers.

Output 2.2: 10 farmers are well trained in establishing a small nursery and producing mass production of vegetative propagation of selected species.

- A training course on establishing a small nursery and mass vegetative propagation techniques of selected species and cash crops was organized with the production of a training manual. The training course motivated 10 farmers in the establishment and operation of a small nursery.

Output 2.3: 50 farmers surrounding the project location are well-trained in planting and maintaining selected species.

- A training was accomplished and trainees showed a positive response from their capacity improvements in managing plantations. All trainees were farmer groups in Jambi and South Kalimantan.

Output 2.4: 100 ha of demonstration areas of collaborative plantation forest of selected species are established each in Jambi and South Kalimantan.

- Technical planning for demo plot management was finalized in the two sites in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces; and seedlings of selected species at each demonstration area, using improved seeds provided by plantation companies were produced.
- Planted seedlings/trees intensively using available labor in surrounding areas with fertilizers are growing.

Output 2.5: 10 selected persons from communities are trained in financial arrangement and management.

- A manual for training on financial arrangement and management of small-scale plantations was prepared and published with the conduct of training courses on financial arrangement and management

Output 2.6 Contractual arrangement for the involvement of local stakeholders as project partners adapted.

- A public meeting to identify and formulate stakeholders' needs was organized.
- Two MOUs of collaborative plantation forest establishment in South Kalimantan and Jambi were agreed and signed by collaborative parties.

The demonstrations were successfully established and well managed

Strategy for collaborative plantation forest development had been adopted and implemented within two demonstration sites:

- In Jambi Province, the demonstration site was located in village of Pematang Rahim, Sub District of Mendahara Ulu, Region of Tanjung Jabung Timur. 55 hectares of collaboratively plantation forest was established and managed by farmer group “Harapan Mulia Lestari” and plantation forest concessionaire of PT. Wira Karya Sakti. The selected tree species of Jelutung (*Dyera*, sp) were planted and maintained.
- In South Kalimantan Province, the demonstration site was located in village of Panaan, Sub District of Bintang Ara, Region of Tabalong. 50 hectares of collaborative plantation forest was established and managed by farmer group “Bina Hutan Lestari” (20 farmer members) and plantation forest concessionaire of PT. Aya Yayang Indonesia. The selected tree species of Karet (Rubber, *Hevea* spp) and Sengon (*Paracerianthes auriculiformis*) were planted and maintained of each 20 hectares and 30 hectares.

The project had formulated the technical design and plan to manage designated demonstration sites of collaborative plantation forest in Jambi and South Kalimantan provinces. The technical design and plan was documented as The Project Technical Report Volume 2 entitled “Rancangan dan Rencana Teknis Pembangunan Hutan Tanaman Kolaborasi (Lokasi Demplot di Provinsi Jambi dan Kalimantan Selatan)”

To secure continuation of collaborative plantation forest management within two demonstration sites, the collaborative parties (farmer groups and plantation forest concessionaires) had been officially issued and signed the MOUs of collaborative plantation forests development. The MOUs will consequently stipulate the rights and obligations of both collaborative parties as well as define the benefit sharing of products and goods harvested from collaborative plantation areas.

Since the farmer group had been officially acknowledged, they had opportunity to join any community capacity building activities under the government program to enhance their technical capacity especially in optimizing utilization of demonstration sites. The plantation forest concessionaire set up the mutual benefit program by supporting demonstration site activities based on the signed MOU in term of financial and technical support.

The Directorate of Plantation Forest Development, Forestry Services in province continuously shared their contribution to maintain and monitor progress activities as well as in establishment of demonstration sites. The Ministry of Forestry issued policy and regulation on development of collaborative plantation forest between community and plantation forest concessionaire.

The capacity of farmer groups were enhanced

Farmers from farmer groups of two project provinces had been well trained. 10 selected farmers had been trained on techniques to establish nursery and mass production of seedling through propagation techniques, 50 farmers had been trained on planting and tree maintaining, and 10 farmers had been trained on financial arrangement and management. Supporting the training activities, the project had developed the training manual (modules) and published as Technical Reports Volume 3 entitled “Manual Pelatihan: (i) Teknik Persemaian dan Silvikultur; (ii) Penanaman dan Pemeliharaan Tanaman; (iii) Pengelolaan dan Manajemen Keuangan”

Project duration was extended to achieve the objectives

There was no major change on planned activities in term of methods and inputs. However, A 19 month extension without additional funding needed to rearrange some of project activities and keep project implementation on track in achieving project outputs and objectives. During the extension period, farmer groups and plantation forest concessionaires could enhance their collaborative spirit and implement strategy for collaborative plantation forest development through establishment of demonstration sites of collaborative plantation and conducted its related management activity. The extension was needed due to:

- The time needed to set up field activities as well as finding best quality of seedlings to be planted in demonstration areas.
- Instability of project management staff and less of intensive communication among stakeholders or project beneficiaries.

- Implementation of field activities needed to be fully consulted amongst the relevant stakeholders.
- Strategy and mechanism of collaborative plantation forest development needed to improve based on latest conditions.
- Strategy and mechanism of collaborative plantation forest development needed to disseminate to relevant stakeholders and collect responds to enhance its contents.
- Postponed or rearranged activities consequently postpone budget disbursement and delayed budget disbursement also affect the project implementation progress.

4.1.2 Project formulation and implementation

Project was well formulated and designed

The project fits into ITTO's strategy and comply with ITTA 1994 objectives in the aspects of contributing the process of sustainable development, enhancing the capacity of members to implement a strategy for achieving experts of tropical timber products, encouraging member to support and develop industrial tropical timber reforestation, management and rehabilitation.

The project was also consistent with ITTO Yokohama Action Plan 2002 – 2006 in terms of developing innovative mechanisms and relevant legislative frameworks, encouraging members to secure the forest resource base through the implementation of forest policy, legislation and associated strategies; monitoring and assessing the environmental, social and economic costs and benefits of forest plantation development; encouraging members to test and enhance examples of collaborative forest management.

On the other hand, the project addressed the critic issues of project target area and catered to the actual need of project intervention area. Social conflict had become the significant factor hindering the progress of plantation forest development and the collaborative forest management was desired by the local farmers and the plantation forest concessionaires. The poor capacity of local community on the plantation forest development and management could

not match the requirements of Indonesia to involving in the national community forest program.

The project addressed that social conflicts happened between community and plantation forest concessionaire was key problem that made ineffective progress of plantation forest development. It was nearly impossible to find clear and clean area for plantation forest development. The stakeholders desired to develop collaborative plantation forest since it could not only provide other sources of welfare for the community and it could also use as practical mean to address social conflicts. However, in developing collaborative plantation forest, there are lack of strategy and mechanism for collaborative plantation forest and lack capacity of local community in term of adopting strategy and legal framework, managing nursery and producing vegetative propagation, conducting appropriate planting and maintaining planted trees, and executing proper financial management.

Based on the above mentioned condition, the project was set up specific objectives of (i) A collaborative plantation forest management approach is made available, and (ii) Conditions are established for the adoption of the approach by relevant stakeholders. The specific objectives made to comply with the development objective that is increased wood production from plantation forests meets domestic and export demand for raw materials, thereby reducing reliance on natural forest extraction. In order to achieve the specific objectives, the project set up the project outputs, namely: (i) Develop strategy, legal framework and institution, and mechanism of collaborative plantation forest; (ii) establish demonstration sites and conduct appropriate collaborative plantation forest management; (iii) setting up condition to adopt collaborative plantation forest; (iv) enhance community capacity through training activity; and (vi) develop contractual arrangement for implementation of collaborative plantation forest development. In order to deliver the project outputs the project set up 33 project activities to be conducted.

Stakeholders were motivated and actively involved

The primary target beneficiaries were farmer groups of Harapan Mulia Lestari (Jambi) and Bina Hutan Lestari (South Kalimantan), plantation forest concessionaires of PT. Wira Karya Sakti (Jambi) and PT. Aya Yayang Indonesia (South Kalimantan), forestry services of Jambi province, South Kalimantan province and Tabalong region (South Kalimantan), and forestry and estate service of Tanjung Jabung Timur region (Jambi). The Directorate of Plantation Forest Development under the Directorate General of Forest Utilization, Ministry of Forestry as the project executing agency also was one of the key target beneficiaries. The target beneficiaries had participated in implementation of the project in various ways as follows:

- The Ministry of Forestry of Indonesia (MOFI), particularly Directorate General of Forest Utilization, had significantly participated in the implementation of the project by chairing the Project Steering Committee (PSC). Four PSC meetings had been conducted during project duration and provided advices and insights to direct project implementations in right track in achieving project outputs and objectives. The MOFI also had addressed and attended the national and local workshops organized by the project.
- The forestry services at provincial and regional levels shared their views in communications and consultation process, and participated local and national workshops, attended PSC meetings, as well as monitoring and advising of the field activities.
- Farmer groups took part in public consultation, local workshops, trainings, and planting and maintain planted trees in demonstration sites.
- Plantation forest concessionaires took part in project workshops and establishment of collaborative plantation forest in terms of providing, handling and transporting the seedlings.
- The ITTO has significantly contributed to the successful completion of the project by timely installing the funds and through continued participation in the monitoring of the project.

Implementation was arranged with high efficiency

In order to implement project activities, deliver project outputs and achieve specific objectives, the project set up LFM that stated assumptions or enabling conditions which should be fulfilled during the project duration. Fortunately, the assumptions were fulfilled during the project duration. By conducting implementation strategy in term of keep continuous communications with project partner, fitting project time schedule with field conditions, developing mutual collaboration between community and plantation forest concessionaire and consultation with local forestry services, the project consequently conducted all activities, deliver project outputs and achieve specific objectives.

There was no major change on planned activities in term of methods and inputs. However, the project was extended since some of project activities needed to be rearranged in order to keep project implementation on the right track in achieving project outputs and objectives.

The project was operationally managed by the PIU comprising the Project Coordinator and Secretary. Field operations were supported by the National Consultants, National Trainers, Forest Technicians, Forestry services at province level and regional Level. The project was also supported by commitments shared by plantation forest concessionaires and farmer groups either as project beneficiaries or project partners.

The project implementation was guided and advised by the Project Steering Committee (PSC) through yearly PSC Meetings. At the PSC Meetings, the Project Coordinator, National Consultants and National Trainers reported the ongoing Yearly Plan of Operations (YPO) and project activities progress to have endorsement, comment and recommendation from the PSC members. The PSC Meeting was held in order to direct the project.

Completion of project also supported by existing commitment of farmer groups and plantation forest concessionaires to keep spirit and motivation to collaborate and resolve the conflicts. Provincial and region governments also shared their attention and contribution to support project implementations.

Reporting system worked effectively

The project was managed in full compliance with the ITTO rules and procedures. During project duration, four YPOs, ten bi-annual progress reports and four yearly financial audit reports and final audit reports had been submitted to ITTO, which outlined the progress of the project implementation. Whilst these may not all contain critical evaluation, they do present details for scrutiny by ITTO and PSC members. Employment of project personnel, national consultants and national trainers and sub-contract activities as well as procurement of capital items were made with the approval of ITTO.

External influences were handled to a minimum level

The assumptions to fulfill project objectives were mostly fulfilled during the project implementation. Except a 19 month extension, there was no critical problems or differences occurred and influenced project outputs delivery and project objectives achievement.

The assumptions stated in the LFM were valid during the project duration. The government commits to enhance plantation forest development and broader access for the community in forest utilization as well as in developing plantation forest through community based plantation forests development.

The willingness of community and plantation forest concessionaire involved in conflicts to resolve the conflicts. They showed potential spirit to consider collaborative plantation forest development as conflict resolution approach. This condition appeared in both project locations of Jambi province and South Kalimantan province. The collaborative condition was slowly achieved after the project and national consultants supported by local forestry service conducted appropriate social consultation and communication.

Forest fire commonly happened very often in forest areas where demonstration sites were located. Fortunately, during project duration, long rainy seasons occurred in both project locations. Therefore, planting and maintaining planted trees could be implemented and tree growth were accordingly secured.

4.2 Lessons learned

Although many achievements made by the Project, several lessons had been learned from the project implementation, including:

- Plantation forests throughout Indonesia were in conflicts with indigenous peoples and local communities as well as migrant communities. The conflicts caused various problems as ineffective mechanisms in building trust among concerned stakeholders, unclear boundary and weak law enforcement, unclear local rights to forest-land ownership, inequity in benefit sharing, as well as slow process of resolving conflicts at local level. Consideration was given to the formulation of an acceptable mediation system which empowers local communities associated with plantations participate in the development of a small scale business enterprise. Strategic solutions to conflicts of plantation forest management could be facilitated by strengthening governance with communication platforms and participation forums, securing a clear framework of local rights, and speeding up the settlement process.
- Forestry Services in Jambi and South Kalimantan provinces had been encouraged to promote a collaborative plantation forest management framework as an alternative system to resolve conflicts of plantation forest development. However, the mid-term and long-term sustainability of the project will depend on the design and implementation of supportive policies and legal framework to apply and/or further improve the project's outcomes including the strategy for collaborative plantation forest developed as well as the continued maintenance of the demonstration sites.
- The implementation of the two MOUs of collaborative plantation forest signed between the farmer groups and plantation forest concessionaire would be an indicator to measure the project's sustainability in terms of the management of the demonstration sites. Since the farmer groups had been officially acknowledged by the two MOUs, the sustainability of the farmer groups could be maintained through community capacity building activities under the government program to enhance their technical capacity especially in optimizing utilization of demonstration sites.

- Stakeholders were agreed and desired that strategy of collaborative plantation forest development could be implemented as conflict resolution approach in plantation forest development. By adopting the strategy, conflicts could be transferred into a collaborative management of plantation forest, and the strategy could also be considered as an approach to enhance community access into plantation forest development as well as to improve their livelihood and welfare. However, the role of local government was very important since conflicts should be handled and resolved based on bottom up process.
- The activity of village nursery development should be maintained within the extension period. Due to some certain reasons, the village nursery was not established on schedule and could not produce seedlings for the demonstration site. The project then chose a much easy way and purchased the seedlings from the near markets. Even the project got a 19 month extension the activity of establishing the village nursery was still cancelled by the PSC in 2010/2011, although the project management team suggest to keep. This activity was one of the activities which the farmers directly could get involved and benefited. The village nursery could provide extra seedlings for supplementary planting of the demonstration site and supply seedlings to other places where the collaborative plantation forest development model was extended. Remove of the village nursery establishment in some extent reduce the impact of the project.
- Appropriate policy and institution such as communication forum would be needed at least within region governmental level. Similar institution would also be needed at provincial level to handle larger conflicts. Accordingly, certain policy and regulation, budget and standard of operating procedure in conflict resolution should be continuously provided.
- Training materials were only in local language, which were not applicable for future dissemination of project outputs. According to ITTO relevant regulations all the project documents, reports and important materials should be developed in English or in bilingual of English and local language.
- The purpose of ex-post evaluation is to provide valuable suggestion for the future project to improve the quality of the design. However, in the project document there is no element relating to the project impact or project influence of project results after the project

terminated. Meanwhile, in the LFM there are fewer information about project impacts and hardly find the indicators and verification means. The project impact or effects are often assessed rely on the feedback of the interviewees during the visit to the project targeted area. The evaluation may be inaccuracy in some extent.

- An appropriate time should be selected to conduct the ex-post evaluation. If the evaluation is made a long time after project completion it is often difficult to find the rights persons as project coordinator, project staff, experts, etc. and not easy collect the necessary project documents and other important project information. The evaluation is done only based on the second hand information. The evaluation of recently completed project usually has more favorable results than those have a delayed evaluation.

5. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 Conclusions

- The identification of the problem to be addressed was based on the findings of completed pre-project which revealed the problems facing by the plantation forest development and focused on social conflicts problems. The identification process was adequate. The project addressed a real and critic problem of conflicts between local communities and plantation forest concessionaire in plantation forest management.
- The strategy, legal framework, and mechanism developed by the project were practical, effective and applicable. Design of the project was derived throughout analysis with the aid of problem and objective trees. The design was sufficient and formulated implementation strategy conformed to prevailing conditions and formulated assumptions. Planned activities were fitted to outputs indicators and specific objectives of the project.
- Implementation of the project went smoothly despite the 19 months extension without additional funding was required for completing the project. The project needed to rearrange some field activities and sequence activity and time schedule adjustments in order to avoid unnecessary budget expenditure and to ensure effective achievement of the project objectives. The smooth implementation was attributable mainly to the timely

installment of funds by ITTO, availability of cooperating institutions and consultants as well as support by the primary beneficiaries (farmer groups and plantation forest concessionaires) and concerned government institutions and officials.

- The project was operationally managed by the PIU. All administrative procurements such as submission of YPO, biannual progress reports, and financial audit reports were accomplished and submitted to ITTO. Employment of project personnel, national consultants and national trainers and sub-contract activities as well as procurement of capital items were made with the approval of ITTO.
- The project achievements contributed a lot to issuing the new national policy on plantation forest development (Ministry of Forestry Regulation Number P.39/Menhut-II/2013 concerning "Local community empowerment through Forestry Partnership Development"). The project successfully achieved most of its planned outputs and its specific objectives and contributed to its development objective. The specific objectives of the project were achieved by delivering all planned outputs.
- The project got substantial supports and cooperation from government forest agencies, companies, farmers, as well as experienced national consultants and technicians, which made the project a success. The results of the project had been disseminated through the national workshops and seminars, meetings of the PSC and distribution of technical reports to relevant stakeholder's nationwide.
- An audit of the project finances by independent auditors was done to ensure that the project's finances are in order. This was of benefit and assurance for both the project PIU and for executive agency and ITTO.

5.2 Recommendations

For Executive Agency

- Project design should be well developed, which determines the success and effectiveness of a project. Key stakeholders and partners should be identified from the very beginning and their roles and responsibilities should be clarified at different phases in the project management cycle. Advantage and disadvantage situation should be assessed prior to the project implementation. If the approval process lasts a fair long time, situation of the

project site should be reevaluated when the first YPO is developed to ensure the interventions of project are still valid and appropriate.

- Mechanism should be developed to motivate and encourage the local forest authorities and professionals to actively join the project implementation and follow-up maintenance. Government support and facilitation would be provided to ensure continuation of collaborative plantation activities under the MOU. Legislation should be available to ensure the long-term impact of the project achievement and sustainable management of the plantations in Indonesia.
- MOU should be a long term agreement and reviewed regularly to meet the changing situation and actual needs; MOUs should not only stipulate the rights and obligations of parties but also define benefit sharing rule of products and goods harvested from collaborative plantations. The farmer group and the concessionaire should collaboratively work out act plan to deal with the emerging troubles in the demonstrations under the MOU.
- Capacity building should be continuously provided for the villagers under the government capacity building programs. Technical supports from local forest authority still needed to help farmer group to monitor the growth of the planted trees, develop the management plan for the collaborative plantation forests.
- Collaborative plantation forest development could be extended in site level. The collaborative plantation forest development as conflict resolution approach offered by the project may very little compare to expanded conflicts happen in plantation forest development. However, it is recommended to implement the strategy and mechanism of collaborative plantation forest development to resolve the conflict at site level since it could show positive and promising results.

For ITTO

- Implementing a forest project for over three years, the mid-term evaluation is necessary and helpful and should be done on a proper time to guide the implementation over the project period and modify this implementation strategy to keep the project on the right track. The ex-post evaluation should be done soon after the project completion so as to get

the right information about the project impact from the feedback of the project beneficiaries.

- The project design and the LFM should be well developed. The planned activities should be strongly linked to the achievement of project outputs and contributive to the project objectives. The logical connection amongst project development objective, specific objective, output and activity should be clearly analyzed.
- Field offices should be set up to closely connect to the project sites and the implementing approaches should be innovated. The project management team should consist of the technical team and implementing team, and the role of two teams should be clearly defined.
- The entry meeting and the exit meeting including representatives of the executive agency, project manager, key project staff and villagers are extremely important for the ex-post evaluation to define the experiences and lessons learned and their potential for dissemination and introduction elsewhere.
- All project documents and materials, particular the critic official letters on important decisions should be in English and well kept for a fairly long time for future check, usually at least five years after the project ends.

6. REFERENCES

- Project Document of Strategy for Developing Plantation Forest: A Conflict Resolution Approach in Indonesia (ITTO PD 396/06 Rev. 2(F)).
- Completion Report of ITTO PD 396/06 Rev. 2(F)
- ITTO Manual for Project Monitoring, Review, Reporting and Evaluation (3rd edition, 2009)
- ITTO Manual on Standard Operating Procedures for the ITTO Project Cycle, 2009
- Technical Report Volume 1: “Output 1.1. The Strategy, Legal Framework, and Institution Arrangement of Collaborative Plantation Forest Management in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are accepted by all concerned stakeholders”.
- Technical Report Volume 4-A: “Strategy for Developing Collaborative Plantation Forest : A Conflict Resolution Approach in Indonesia”
- Technical Report Volume 4-B : “Practical Mechanism of Conflict Resolution on Plantation Forest Development in Indonesia”
- MoU Signed between PT. Wirakarya Sakti Concessionaire and Harapan Mulia Lestari Farmer Group in Jambi Province.
- MoU Signed between PT. Aya Yayang Indonesia Concessionaire and Bina Hutan Lestari Farmer Group in South Kalimantan Province.
- Ministry of Forestry Regulation Number P.39/Menhut-II/2013 concerning "Local community empowerment through Forestry Partnership Development".

7. ANNEXES

Annex 1: Terms of reference for ex-post evaluation

Annex 2: Agenda for field visit to Indonesia

Annex3: Project Logical Framework Matrix

Annex 4: Management Response to ITTO Ex-Post Evaluation from EA

Annex 1

Terms of Reference

Ex-Post Evaluation of ITTO Project

PD 396/06 Rev.2 (F)

**Strategy for Developing Plantations Forest: A Conflict Resolution
Approach in Indonesia**

I. Background

ITTO is an intergovernmental commodity organization established in 1986 to administer the provisions and operation of the International Tropical Timber Agreement (ITTA), particularly in the promotion of international trade in tropical timber, the sustainable management of tropical forests and the development of tropical forest industries through international cooperation, policy work and project activities.

The Committee on Reforestation and Forest Management at its FORTY-SEVENTH SESSION (25-30 November 2013, Libreville, Gabon) decided to conduct the ex-post evaluation of the following completed project:

PD 396/06 Rev.2 (F)

**Strategy for Developing Plantations Forest: A Conflict Resolution
Approach in Indonesia**

The background information of the project is provided in Annex to the Terms of Reference.

II. Purpose and Scope of Evaluation

A) Purpose

The primary purpose of the evaluation is to provide a concise diagnosis of **PD 396/06 Rev.2 (F)** so as to point out the successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for successes and failures, and the contribution of the projects towards the achievement of ITTO's Objective 2000, and to draw lessons that can be used to improve similar projects in the future. The evaluation

should refer to the appropriate recommendations in the report on the Meta-Evaluation of previously evaluated ITTO projects [ITTC-JC(XLV/2)].

B) Scope of Work for the ex-post evaluation

a) Analyze and assess the project:

1. The overall role and contribution of the project in light of sectoral policies, development programmes, priorities and requirements to promote strategies for the development of plantation forests in Indonesia
2. The contributions of the specific technical reports in various forestry-related disciplines prepared by the project to the development of conflicts resolution approaches in plantation forests in Indonesia
3. The results and impact of the demonstration activities conducted by the project in Jambi and South Kalimantan, Indonesia
4. The effectiveness of dissemination of project results.
5. The overall post-project situation in the project's influence.
6. The unexpected effects and impacts, either harmful or beneficial, and the reasons for their occurrences.
7. The cost efficiency in the implementation of the project, including the technical, financial and managerial aspects.
8. Follow-up actions in order to enhance uptake of project results.
9. The project's relative success or failure, including a summary of the key lessons learnt; and the identification of any issues or problems that should be taken into account in designing and implementing similar projects in the future.

b) Provide a synthesis to:

1. assess the overall role and meaningful contribution of the project in achieving sustainable management of forest resources in tropical timber producing countries taking into account ITTO's objectives, the ITTO Yokohama Action Plan 2002-2006 and Objective 2000.
2. evaluate the overall contribution of the project to build capacity for conflicts resolution in plantation forests in Jambi and South Kalimantan, Indonesia.
3. evaluate the overall impact on and relevance of the project for ITTO and others as appropriate
4. evaluate the overall attainment of the objectives and assess the overall effectiveness of the project.
5. evaluate the overall appropriateness of the costs and cost structure and use of resources of the project.

And make recommendations on:

1. the needs for similar projects in the future;
2. innovative approaches/designs for projects to promote the consensus building capacity in conflicts situation in the establishment and implementation of plantation forests;
3. appropriate target groups, e.g. countries, government, organizations, forestry sector, local communities;
4. the organizational arrangements of such projects;
5. follow-up and evaluation practices; and

6. further actions needed to sustain or increase the intended effects on sustainable management of forest resources and Objective 2000 and to draw conclusions which may be of relevance to other ITTO projects.

III. Approach

A) Consultation during evaluation exercise

The consultant will maintain close liaison with ITTO and will carry out its work in close cooperation with the concerned Executing Agency and collaborating Agencies in Indonesia. Although the consultant should feel free to discuss with the authorities concerned all matters relevant to its assignment, it is not authorized to make any commitments on behalf of ITTO.

B) Activities

The work required in this evaluation will consist of:

1. Desk review of project-related documents and materials provided by ITTO.
2. Mission to Indonesia. The consultant will visit Jakarta, Jami and South Sumatra for a further desk review of project materials and to carry out evaluation work in the demonstration sites. The mission in Indonesia shall also include consultation with target groups to evaluate the project results and impact, and should include discussions with project stakeholders and target beneficiaries. Approximately ten working days are required for the mission.
3. Preparation of an Ex-post Evaluation Report for the project in accordance with the Scope of Work and the checklist contained in the ITTO Manual for Project Monitoring, Review and Evaluation. The report should be in English.
4. Preparation of an executive summary [see b) Scope of Work] of the ex-post evaluation report, focusing on the overall assessment of the project's relative success in contributing to ITTO's Objectives, the Objective 2000 and the ITTO Yokohama Action Plan 2002-2006, summarizing the key lessons learnt; and

identifying any issues or problems which constrained their contribution to the achievement of Objective 2000.

5. Presentation of the ex-post evaluation report (to be called: Overall Executive Summary) at a session of the Joint Committees during the Fifty Session of the International Tropical Timber Council (3-8 November 2014, Yokohama, Japan).
6. Preparation of an article for possible publication in the ITTO Tropical Forest Update (TFU), in consultation with the editor, containing an overview of the projects and summarizing the lessons learned from the evaluation work. Appropriate high-resolution photographs should be provided.

In writing the Ex-post Evaluation report, the consultant will have the opportunity to discuss its preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations with the ITTO Secretariat before the final version of the report is made. Responsibility for the final content of the report, however, remains with the consultant.

C) Duration of the assignment

The duration of the assignment will be one month for the consultant who will carry out the ex-post evaluation of the project. Travel time for visiting Indonesia will be approximately 10 working days. The remaining time will be used for preparation of the evaluation and report writing.

D) Proposed Work Schedule

- July 2014 Desk review
- August 2014 Mission to Indonesia (Tentatively 4-15 August)
- 20 August 2014 Submission of a draft report to ITTO Secretariat and to the Project Executing Agency for comments and suggestions
- 31 August 2014 Submission of the final ex-post evaluation report and the overall executive summary to ITTO Secretariat.

- September 2014 Preparation of an article for possible publication in the ITTO Tropical Forest Update (TFU), in consultation with the editor, containing an overview of the project and summarizing the lessons learned from the evaluation work.
- 3-8 November 2014 Presentation of the Final Report at a session of the Joint Committees during the Fifth Council Session in Yokohama, Japan together with a PowerPoint Presentation on the key findings, lessons learned and recommendations (Attending the ITTC on 3-5 November 2014 to make a presentation)

E) Proposed Consultant

- Dr. Zuofeng ZHUANG (China)

Annex 2

Schedule for Visit to Indonesia

Date/Day	Activities	Remarks
17 August 2014	Arrive in Jakarta	
18 August 2014	Entry Meeting with Ministry of Forestry at Manggala Wanabhakti Building, operational Room Block I, 4 th Floor	Officers from Ministry: Mr. Nining Ngudi Purnamaningtyas, Deputy Director of technical cooperation, center for international cooperation Ms. Lasmini Adi, head of sub division technical cooperation, secretariat of directorate general forestry utilization Mr. Andi Andriadi, former project coordinator of ITTO PD 396/06 Rev. 2 (F) Mr. Irfan cahyadi, head of sub division, center for international cooperation Ms. Septi dwi cahyawati, staff of directorate plantation forest utilization Mr. Wawan Kurniawan and Ms. Teis Nuraini, center for international cooperation
Morning 19 August 2014	Flight to Jambi	Accompanied by: Mr. Andi Andriadi, Ms. Septi dwi cahyawati, Mr. Wawan Kurniawan, Ms. Teis Nuraini
Afternoon 19 August 2014	Meeting with Provincial Forestry Office of Jambi	Staff from Technical Agency Unit of Production Forest Utilization of Directorate General of Jambi
20 August 2014	Field visit to Tanjung Jabung Timur demonstration site	Field Interviewees: Mr. Syamsuri, head of Pematary Ralum village Mr. Umar, head of farmer group of Harapan Mulya Lestari Mr. Fauzi and Mr. Maliki, field staff of PT. Wira Karya Sakti Plantation Forest Concessionaire. Representatives of farmers
21 August 2014	Flight to Jakarta	
22 August 2014	Debrief Meeting at Ministry of Forestry Office	Officers from Ministry: Ms. Nining Ngudi Purnamaningtyas, Ms. Lasmini Adi, Mr. Andi Andriadi, Mr. Irfan cahyadi, Ms. Septi dwi cahyawati, Mr. Wawan Kurniawan, and Ms. Teis Nuraini
23 August, 2014	Back to Beijing	

Annex 3

Logical Framework Worksheets

PROJECT ELEMENTS	INDICATORS	MEAN OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS
<p><u>Development Objective</u> plantation forests meets domestic and export demand for raw materials, thereby reducing reliance on natural forest extraction.</p>	<p>Establishment of collaborative forest management approach to plantation forests development, along with the demonstration areas and trained farmers</p>	<p>Documents on (i) the collaborative forest management approach to plantation forests development, (ii) demonstration areas, and (iii) training activities.</p>	<p>No changes in decentralization policy.</p>
<p><u>Specific Objective 1:</u> A collaborative plantation forest management approach is made available.</p>	<p>Establishment of collaborative forest management approach to plantation forests development acceptable to relevant stakeholders in Jambi and South Kalimantan</p>	<p>Documents on establishment of collaborative forest management approach to plantation forests development. Field Reports on the demonstration areas for the collaborative plantation forest management. Documents on stakeholders' agreement</p>	<p>All concerned stakeholders are committed to collaborative actions</p>
<p>Output 1.1: The strategy, legal framework and institution of the collaborative plantation forest management in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are accepted by all concerned stakeholders</p>	<p>Mutual understanding and agreement among stakeholders on collaborative plantation forest management establishment are achieved</p>	<p>Documents of development of a strategy of plantation development in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces Documents of mechanism of collaborative plantation forest establishment in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces Report of workshops Contract documents on rights and obligations of each party. Documents of legal framework for the conflict resolution approach</p>	<p>Stakeholders are committed to their roles and obligations.</p>
<p>Output 1.2: Demonstration areas for the collaborative plantation forest management in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are selected, prepared and agreed by all concerned stakeholders.</p>	<p>The rights and obligations of stakeholders of collaborative plantation forest management at demonstration sites are agreed</p>	<p>Contract documents between out-growers/ farmers and industrial plantation forest company Field Reports on the demonstration areas for the collaborative plantation</p>	<p>Stakeholders are committed to their roles and obligations.</p>

PROJECT ELEMENTS	INDICATORS	MEAN OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS
		forest management.	
<u>Specific Objective 2:</u> The adoption of the approach by relevant stakeholders	Demonstration areas are established, certain numbers of farmers are trained	Reports on training programs Documents on the establishment of demonstration areas Report on planting and maintenance of seedlings on demonstration areas.	Stakeholders actively participate
Output 2.1: The local community and industrial commercial plantation forest companies in Jambi and South Kalimantan Provinces are able to adopt the strategy, legal framework and institution of the collaborative plantation forest management	Contract documents of outgrowers/ farmers and plantation forest company on plantation forest establishment and collaborative forest management	Reports on socialization, facilitation and rural appraisal on collaborative plantation forest management Established capacity and stakeholders' networking.	Stakeholders are willing to cooperate. Continues support from local government.
Output 2.2: 10 farmers are well trained in establishing a small nursery and producing mass production of vegetative propagation of selected species	Training subjects and potential participants are identified Training modules and programs are available. 10 farmers are trained	Reports on training programs, including number of participants Documents of training modules	Instructors and trainees are committed to the program
Output 2.3: 50 farmers surrounding the project location are well-trained in planting and maintaining selected species	Training subjects and potential participants are identified Training modules and programs are available. 50 farmers are trained	Reports on training programs, including number of participants Documents of training modules	Instructors and trainees are committed to the program
Output 2.4: 100 ha of demonstration areas of collaborative plantation forest of selected species are established each in Jambi and South Kalimantan	Demonstration site plan is implemented Collaborative plantation forest management is established on 50 ha in Jambi Provinces and 50 ha in South Kalimantan Provinces	Documents on the implementation of demonstration sites establishment Report on planting and maintenance of seedlings in demonstration sites.	No extreme dry season
Output 2.5: 10 selected persons from communities are trained in financial arrangement and management	Training subjects and potential participants are identified Training modules and programs are available. 10 persons from villages are trained	Reports on training programs include number of participants Documents of training modules	Instructors and trainees are committed to the program
Output 2.6 Contractual arrangement for the involvement of local	<i>Participants/Stakeholders are identified. Public meetings are arranged</i>	<i>Contractual arrangement is available</i>	<i>All stakeholders are willing to provide their</i>

PROJECT ELEMENTS	INDICATORS	MEAN OF VERIFICATION	ASSUMPTIONS
<i>stakeholders as project partners adapted</i>	<i>Draft of contractual arrangement is arranged and agreed</i>		<i>commitments</i>

Annex 4

Management Response to ITTO Ex-Post Evaluation

Project Title : *Strategy for Developing Plantations Forest: A Conflict Resolution Approach in Indonesia*
Project ID : ITTO PD 396/06 Rev.2 (F):

A) Overall Response to the Evaluation:

(please insert your overall views on the evaluation report, e.g. structure, methodology and its conclusions)
Post evaluation was conducted quite well and the evaluator was good communicated and made his overview comprehensively. But since the evaluation was done in a short notice the Executing Agency did not has enough time to make preparation and coordinate with project stakeholders. Therefore the evaluator may not received better information of the project outcome.

**Evaluation Report
Recommendations***

B) Response to recommendations

(e.g. 'accept', 'partially accept' or 'reject' – please provide a brief explanation)

Recommendation 1

Project design should be well developed, which determines the success and effectiveness of a project. Key stakeholders and partners should be identified from the very beginning and their roles and responsibilities should be clarified at different phases in the project management cycle. Advantage and disadvantage situation should be assessed prior to the project implementation. If the approval process lasts a fair long time, situation of the project site should be reevaluated when the first YPO is developed to ensure the interventions of project are still valid and appropriate.

Accept

This recommendation is noted and would be consider as input in developing project plan especially project with timing/season sensitivity.

Government policy on conflict resolution is clearly to avoid repressive action. Advantage and disadvantage is also considered during development proposal and strategy. No single solution and strategy could be applied but adaptive and dynamic approach should also be considered.

In line with regulation no P 62/Menhut-II/ 2008, local community access to plantation forest has been accommodated. The project is strengthening the policy through Collaboration between forest concessionaires and local community.

Recommendation 2

Mechanism should be developed to motivate and encourage the local forest authorities and professionals to actively join the project implementation and follow-up maintenance. Government support

Accept

Local forest authorities were strongly involved in project implementation but it is recognized the need to strengthen coordination with local forest authorities after the project, to motivate them to actively take role in facilitating activities under Collaborative Forest Plantation MoU. Coordination would be engaged by Forest Utilization Development implementing unit in Jambi and Kalimantan Selatan Province.

<p>and facilitation would be provided to ensure continuation of collaborative plantation activities under the MOU. Legislation should be available to ensure the long-term impact of the project achievement and sustainable management of the plantations in Indonesia.</p>	<p><i>Ministry of Forestry would strengthen coordination with local government (district and provincial) to prompt their support and facilitation on activities continuation of collaborative plantation forest MoU developed by the ITTO PD 396 Project.</i></p> <p><i>Ministry of Forestry has issued decree no. P.39/Menhut-II/2013 on "Local community empowerment through Forestry Partnership Development", that regulate facilitation by local government to resolve conflict in plantation forest.</i></p>
<p>Recommendation 3</p> <p>MOU should be a long term agreement and reviewed regularly to meet the changing situation and actual needs; MOUs should not only stipulate the rights and obligations of parties but also define benefit sharing rule of products and goods harvested from collaborative plantations. The farmer group and the concessionaire should collaboratively work out act plan to deal with the emerging troubles in the demonstrations under the MOU.</p>	<p><i>Accept</i></p> <p><i>This recommendation in noted and would be considered in development of Ministry of Forestry regulation on collaborative forest plantation development.</i></p>
<p>Recommendation 4</p> <p>Capacity building continuously provided for the villagers. Although the farmer groups have been officially acknowledged and have opportunity to join any community capacity building program under the government program to enhance their technical capacity especially in optimizing utilization of demonstration sites, technical supports from local forest authority still needed to help farmer group to monitor the</p>	<p><i>Accept</i></p> <p><i>Recommendation would be informed to local government through Forest Utilization Development implementing unit.</i></p>

<p>growth of the planted trees, develop the management plan for the collaborative plantation forests.</p>	
<p>Recommendation 5</p> <p>The collaborative plantation forest development as conflict resolution approach offered by the ITTO PD.396/06 Rev.2 (F) may very little compare to expanded conflicts happen in plantation forest development. However, it is recommended to implement the strategy and mechanism of collaborative plantation forest development to resolve the conflict at site level since it could show positive and promising results.</p>	<p><i>Accept</i></p> <p><i>Conflict in plantation forest development is very dynamic with many stakeholders involve and variety circumstances, therefore resolution should be undertaken locally. Strategy and mechanism of collaborative plantation forest developed by the ITTO PD.396/06 Rev.2 (F) will be used as input for conflict resolution in other site/place.</i></p> <p><i>Ministry of Forestry, Indonesia has been committed to give more attention and intensify the conflict resolution and allocate a certain budget to facilitate conflict resolution.</i></p>

Name, Title and Institution of Respondent: Nining Ngudi Purnamaningtyas, Deputy Director for International Cooperation, Ministry of Forestry, Republic of Indonesia

Date, Signature: September 2014

* * *