

Report of Ex-post Evaluation

PD 271/04 Rev.3 (F)

Rehabilitation of Degraded Forest Land Involving Local Communities in West Java, Indonesia

**Prepared by
Don Gilmour and Baharuddin Ghazali**



46RFM-3b
9 October 2012

Acknowledgements

We would like to acknowledge the help of many people in carrying out this mission. The individual members of the Project, particularly the ex-project Team Leader, Mr Subarudi, provided technical, administrative and personal support for the evaluation. It was a pleasure to debate many aspects of sustainable forest management and general development with him. We were also accompanied in the field by Mr Abdul Rochim from the Forestry and Crop Estate Service of Ciamis District, who also contributed valuable local insights.

Particular thanks are due to the many people met during the field visits, particularly members of the farmers' groups who enthusiastically discussed their experiences and visions for the future of their forests.

Don Gilmour and Baharuddin Ghazali

List of acronyms

FLR	Forest and Land Rehabilitation
FORDA	Forest Research and Development Agency
FSCD	Forestry Service, Ciamis District
FCSCD	Forestry and Crop Estate Service, Ciamis District
Gol	Government of Indonesia
ITTA	International Tropical Timber Agreement
ITTO	International Tropical Timber Organization
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
LRSF	Land Rehabilitation and Social Forestry
PSC	Project Steering Committee
REDD	Reduced Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation

Contents

Executive summary	1
1. Introduction	3
2. Evaluation scope, focus and approach	3
3. Project facts	4
4. Findings, lessons learned	5
4.1 Findings	5
4.1.1 Project achievements.....	5
Project context.....	5
Outputs	7
Outcomes	8
Impact (Development Objective)	10
4.1.2 Project formulation and implementation	11
4.2 Lessons learned	12
5. Conclusions and recommendations	12
5.1 Conclusions	12
5.2 Recommendations.....	13
6. References	14
7. Annexes	15
Annex 1. Terms of reference for evaluation	
Annex 2. Schedule of activities and people met during evaluation	
Annex 3. Powerpoint presentation used for de-brief	

Executive summary

This ex-post evaluation is one of three being carried out as part of a thematic assessment of ITTO supported projects in Papua New Guinea and Indonesia with various degrees of community participation. The primary purpose of all three evaluations is: “...to provide a concise diagnosis...to point out the successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for successes and failures, and the contribution of the projects towards the achievement of ITTO’s Objective 2000, and to draw lessons that can be used to improve similar projects in the future.” The in-country component of the evaluation occurred between 2nd and 18th July 2012, and the basic information about the Project is shown in the following table.

Project name	Rehabilitation of Degraded Forest Land Involving Local Communities in West Java, Indonesia
Project number	PD 271/04 Rev.3 (F)
Implementing Agency	Forestry Service of Ciamis District in cooperation with Forestry Research and Development Agency (FORDA) and Directorate General of Land Rehabilitation and Social Forestry (LRSF)
Starting date and duration	March 2006; duration 27 months
Budget (US\$)	Total: USD 570,236 (ITTO contribution USD 493,236; Government of Indonesia contribution USD 77,000)
Country	Indonesia

Context and background

There is a large area of degraded forest land in Ciamis District, but most of this is in state owned land (particularly ex-crop estates, rather than in private land). Private forests were the explicit focus of the project’s activities. They cover 32,000 ha in the District (about 13 % of the total land area) and produce on average 360,000 m³ of logs per year to more than 500 sawmills in the District and beyond.

Major achievements

Through demonstration and training, the project provided skills to private forest owners to: (i) improve the quality of seedling production for planting in private forests, and (ii) apply silvicultural techniques (including planting, pruning and thinning) to improve the quality of their planted trees. These skills are still being used to advantage by farmers’ groups and individual farmers four years after the project concluded.

Lessons learned

A number of lessons have emerged from the Project’s implementation, and these include:

1. Support to motivated local community leaders is an effective mechanism to demonstrate and spread knowledge and information aimed at improving productivity of private forests. They can act as unofficial (but highly effective) extension agents to spread the information throughout their communities, and beyond.
2. The major impediment to improving livelihoods based on private forest management under the prevailing conditions in Ciamis relates to improving marketing conditions for timber produced from private forests.
3. An **enabling** regulatory framework that encourages farmers to invest in private forestry is more effective in achieving government policy objectives than an **enforcing** one that requires farmers to plant tree seedlings and protect forests.

Conclusions

Private forestry Ciamis District is well accepted and widely adopted by farmers and supported by the District government. Under these conditions, the project has effectively demonstrated various approaches to support and improve private forestry and make it even more productive. The work done by the project has been widely disseminated through the preparation and wide distribution of numerous publications and more particularly through the vehicle of numerous stakeholder workshops.

Overall, the project has been successful in achieving its planned Outputs and its (re-formulated) Specific Objectives and in contributing to its (re-formulated) Development Objective (its impact). Among the reasons for this achievement are:

- There was good support at the District level and among farmers' groups for the skills training which was at the heart of the project's activities.
- The implementation of the project was efficient and effective.

The Project has also made a significant contribution to the achievement of ITTO's strategic objectives.

Recommendations

For the Executing Agency (Forestry and Crop Estate Services, Ciamis District-FCSCD)

1. Provide technical and financial support to the nursery established by the project to ensure that it becomes (i) a beacon of excellence in the production of high quality seedlings, and (ii) a training centre for imparting skills and knowledge on all aspects of private forest management.
2. Continue to provide technical and financial support to farmers' groups to enhance their ability to manage their private forests sustainably.
3. Consider improving the enabling regulatory framework further to enhance the incentive structure for private tree growers to continue to engage in private forestry and receive an equitable share of the benefits.
4. Consider investigating approaches aimed at improving marketing of timber products in the District, including access by farmers to a competitive timber market.

For the Directorate General of Watershed Management Development and Social Forestry

5. Continue to refine the model for sustainable management of private forests and test its wider application across West Java and beyond.

For ITTO

6. Improve assessment of logical frameworks during project design so that outputs, specific objectives, development objectives and their respective success indicators are clearly defined and conform to good practice criteria.

1. Introduction

The ITTO Manual for project monitoring, review, reporting and evaluation (ITTO 2009) notes that: *“The purpose of an evaluation is to guide or advice (sic) on the further implementation of the evaluated Project and/or on the formulation and implementation of future Projects”* and that: *“evaluation looks beyond the constituent elements of the Project, to the validity of its design and to its impact.”* (p. 44.)

This evaluation is an ex-post evaluation and is one of three being carried out as part of a thematic assessment of ITTO supported projects in Papua New Guinea and Indonesia with various degrees of community participation. The primary purpose of all three evaluations, as stated in the ToR (see Annex 1) is *“...to provide a concise diagnosis of two projects related to Forest Rehabilitation [PD 271/04 Rev.3 (F) and PD 394/06 Rev.1 (F)] and one project related to Community Participation in SFM [PD 324/04 Rev.3 (F)] so as to point out the successful and unsuccessful outcomes, the reasons for successes and failures, and the contribution of the projects towards the achievement of ITTO’s Objective 2000, and to draw lessons that can be used to improve similar projects in the future.”*

The following table shows the basic statistics on the Project being evaluated.

Table 1. Basic information about the Project

Project name	Rehabilitation of Degraded Forest Land Involving Local Communities in West Java, Indonesia
Project number	PD 271/04 Rev.3 (F)
Implementing Agency	Forestry Service of Ciamis District in cooperation with Forestry Research and Development Agency (FORDA) and Directorate General of Land Rehabilitation and Social Forestry (LRSF)
Starting date and duration	March 2006; duration: 27 months
Budget (US\$)	Total: USD 570,236 (ITTO contribution USD 493,236; Government of Indonesia contribution USD 77,000)
Country	Indonesia
Location	Ciamis District, West Java, Indonesia

The Project Document describes how the Project fits into ITTO’s strategic context in several ways. It complies with the ITTA 1994 objectives by: contributing to sustainable development; promoting research and development leading to improved forest management and encouraging members to develop forest policies aimed at sustainable utilisation and conservation of timber producing forests. It is also consistent with the ITTO Yokohama Action Plan in the field of reforestation and forest management by: encouraging the involvement of non-government stakeholders in activities; promoting the conservation, rehabilitation and sustainable management of threatened forest ecosystems; promoting development of non-timber forest products and forest services; securing the forest resource base through the implementation of forest policy, legislation and associated strategies; establishing and managing forests for multiple uses in close cooperation with local forest owners and communities living in forest areas and establishing areas dedicated to biodiversity conservation in accordance with ITTO guidelines.

2. Evaluation scope, focus and approach

The purpose of the evaluation was outlined in the previous section, and its focus was guided by the evaluative framework described in ITTO (2009) and the detailed “Scope of Work” contained in the ToR (Annex 1).

No mid-term evaluation was carried out on the project during its implementation, although regular progress reports were produced. This ex-post evaluation was carried out by Dr Don Gilmour, an Australian forester and Dr Baharuddin Ghazali, a Malaysian forester. The approach

taken in conducting the evaluation included: desk review of documents prior to the mission (although some of the key technical reports were not made available prior to the commencement of the mission); meetings and interviews with key groups and individuals in Jakarta, Bogor, and Ciamis District during a mission to Indonesia between 2nd and 18th July, 2012; review of key project products (including progress reports, minutes of PSC meetings and technical reports). Discussion also took place with relevant District officials, farmers and other stakeholders during the field visits. Annex 2 shows the schedule followed and people met during the evaluation.

At the end of the field mission a de-briefing presentation was made in Jakarta to representatives of the Ministry of Forestry to present the key finding of the evaluation and to obtain feedback. The powerpoint presentation used at the de-briefing is included as Annex 3.

3. Project facts

The Project needs to be seen in the context of the changing dynamics of forest management in Indonesia. The country has been going through a radical process of reformation, including decentralisation, for some years, and this has impacted on the way in which forest management is carried out.

The Project Document provided a thorough analysis of the situation surrounding the unsustainable management of forests in Ciamis and surrounding Districts in West Java, including a threat analysis and the construction of a problem tree that identified the underlying, or root, causes of the degradation. It noted that Ciamis forests merit special attention given that land shortage in Ciamis has created problems of illegal logging and encroachment in the government forests.

The Project Document (ITTO 2006) noted that: *“(t)he failure of land and forest rehabilitation in almost all part of Indonesia is caused by ignoring the social and cultural aspects of communities living near the forest...”* (p. 9). It also noted that: *“It is recognized that the rehabilitation of degraded forest land in west Java is not possible without people participation. Rehabilitation program by company/ local government have been largely unsuccessful due to ...a failure to address local communities’ needs”.* (p. 6)

Building on this contextual analysis, the Project Document concluded that: *“The core activities (of the project) are directed to empower local communities on rehabilitation activities in such way that the activities of the project could improve the social welfare for the local people in the project area and its surroundings”.* (p. 19)

The stated focus of the core activities of the project’s intervention is on empowering local communities to be effective decision-makers, and to improve their socio-economic well-being. This is in accordance with international experience in restoration and rehabilitation. See for example the restoration Principles outlined in ITTO (2002); Lamb (2011); Lamb and Gilmour (2003) and Gilmour, *et al.* (2007). The consequence of this focus is that local empowerment should be a central plank of the project’s planning and implementation.

This central focus of rehabilitation through people’s participation is also in accordance with the government’s evolving regulatory framework. For example, the Minister of Forestry Decree No. 31/Kpts-II/2001 emphasised the importance of community based forest management to promote the active role of local communities in forest management (ITTO 2006).

This focus also accords with Principle 13 of the ITTO guidelines for the restoration, management and rehabilitation of degraded and secondary tropical forests (ITTO 2002). This Principle emphasises that management should be based on an adequate characterization of social, cultural, economic and biophysical aspects and that management plans should be adapted to each forest (ITTO 2006).

While the project was conceived and designed to address a local issue of wide spread forest loss and degradation in Ciamis District, there was a broader consideration. It was argued that

forest degradation was a major forest management concern throughout Java and beyond. The Project Document stated that: *“Rehabilitation through local community participation in Ciamis district will be a model rehabilitation approach in Java”*. (ITTO 2006, p. 5). Hence, an expectation was explicitly raised that the project would, based on its experiences, identify the key elements of a rehabilitation model, and describe how it can be applied. The statements in the Project Document indicate that the model should be based on effective community participation and empowerment.

Following the analysis outlined above, a Development Objective for the Project was formulated as:

To promote sustainable management of degraded forest lands through local communities involvement in rehabilitation activities for social, economic and environmental benefits

Two Specific Objectives were formulated as:

- 1. To rehabilitate degraded forestland area through local communities’ participation which follows the ITTO guidelines.**
- 2. To strengthen local institutional capacity for undertaking rehabilitation of degraded forestland and related activities in its utilization.**

It was proposed that these objectives be achieved through six outputs, three linked to each of the two Specific Objectives. A logical framework was constructed with activities identified under each of the outputs and this provided the basis of the project’s implementation and reporting.

The project was executed by the Forestry Service of Ciamis District¹ in cooperation with the Directorate General of Land Rehabilitation and Social Forestry (LRSF). A Project office was established in the offices of the Forestry Services, Ciamas District (FSCD). The Project was initially planned to run for 24 months (from March 2007 to February 2008) but continued for 27 months, until May 2008.

4. Findings, lessons learned

4.1 Findings

4.1.1 Project achievements

Project context

Before discussing the achievements of the Project it is important to locate the ITTO Project in the context of land use in Ciamas District and in particular the land use changes that have been taking place during the past several decades.

There is a long tradition of integrating trees into the farming systems in West Java and “people’s forests” have been an integral part of the landscape for generations (Dept of Forestry, 2008). This publication describes the government’s emphasis on encouraging tree planting on private land in West Java since the 1970s (see Box 1) and how these initiatives contributed to the practice of planting forest trees on private land for commercial purposes, which is currently widespread in the Province. It also noted that the government has long term targets, one of which is to achieve 45% of West Java under tree cover. The Provincial Forestry Office has a strategy to address critical lands, both government and private, and many of the key elements of the strategy resonate with the approach taken by the project (Dept of Forestry, 2008).

¹ In 2011 the Forestry Service of Ciamis District (FSCD) was amalgamated with the Crop Estate Service of Ciamis District to become the Forestry and Crop Estate Service of Ciamis district (FCSCD).

Box 1. Evolving farming and tree planting culture in West Java

The traditional subsistence culture of the people in West Java was to have a piece of land around their home and to work on that land to achieve self-sufficiency. Livelihood was based on cultivating the land with fruit trees and vegetables and perhaps rearing cattle (buffalos for the rice fields) or raising chickens. The system of mixed annual crops and fruit trees, with a minimum of land clearing, enabled people to maintain soil fertility and to farm sustainably.

With increasing population and the advent of the market economy the traditional subsistence culture has had to change and adapt. Problems of land shortage have arisen and government forests have been cleared for cultivation or converted to other forms of land use. Over the years the government has responded to these pressures in numerous ways:

1952: Government began a programme of encouraging **planting of fruit trees** on abandoned land to improve soil protection and raise soil fertility.

1956: Agriculture and Forestry Departments ran joint **National Greening campaigns**.

1972: The Governor of West Java, initiated an **agroforestry** drive in Bogor

1975 – 1976: The **greening project of land outside government forest land** was in full swing, particularly in West Java.

1990: Forestry Department pursued **national greening activities with large scale planting of *Albizia***, targeting critical areas.

Source: Adapted from Dept of Forestry (2008)

The contemporary landscape in Ciamis District is essentially a forested one consisting of a mosaic of relatively small patches of agricultural land integrated into areas of private forest managed under both agroforestry and pure forestry regimes. The upland, steeper areas of the District tend to be state owned forest of various categories, much of which is degraded, particularly those areas which were used for crop estates, but are now abandoned. The private forests represent a mature system with the age range of trees varying from recently planted seedlings to mature trees of more than 30 years. Much of the area is managed as agro forests with underplanting of crops such as cardamom. Overall, the private forests are extremely well managed to produce a mix of timber and non-timber products. This impressive process of afforestation of private land has clearly been underway in the District for many decades.

The available government data indicate that there is a large area of degraded forest in the District. However, it is universally accepted by everyone interviewed (government officials including extension staff, ex-project staff, individual farmers, farmers' groups and sawmillers) and supported by detailed field observations, that virtually all of this is in state owned land, particularly ex-crop estates, and not in private forest land. In fact, it was not possible to find any degraded private forest land during the mission.

Private forests were the explicit focus of the project's activities. They cover 32,000 ha in the Ciamis District (about 13 % of the land area in the District) and produce on average 360,000 m³ of logs per year that are processed in more than 500 sawmills in the district² (FORDA 2008) as well as by mills outside the District. Logs sourced from government forests contribute a further 49,000 m³ to the local industry (FORDA 2008). By and large, there are no land use or land tenure conflicts that concern private forests in the District.

Private forestry has received strong support from the District government. For example, in 2004, the tax on logs harvested from private forests was removed, thus providing an added stimulus to tree planting (Tiwa Sukrianto, ex-Head of FSCD, pers. com.). This is an excellent example of government creating an **enabling** regulatory environment (as opposed to an **enforcing** one) to achieve policy objectives.

² Provincial Forestry Office data (quoted in FORDA 2008) indicate that there were 538 sawmills in Ciamis District in 2006.

Under a central government initiative farmers are encouraged to form farmers' groups to provide a convenient interface for interaction with District extension staff. These groups are legal entities with bank accounts and the ability to raise loans for collective activities. In Ciamis District, farmers' groups (typically with 50-150 members) tend to operate collectively for activities such as the operation of seedling nurseries. However, farmers operate individually for almost everything else, including managing their agro forests (planting seedlings, applying silvicultural techniques, etc.) and selling timber and non-timber products. An average farmer might own less than one hectare of forest land (the 150 members of the Lumbung farmers' group own a total of about 100 ha of forest land).

Outputs

Activities for each Output were identified in the logframe in the Project Document and these formed the basis of developing annual workplans and budgets. While activities are important in their own right, they are particularly important in contributing to the higher level Project Outputs and, if the internal logic of the logframe is sound, to the Specific and Development Objectives. The following Box summarises progress in producing the Outputs as judged against the success indicators in the logframe.

Box 2. Summary of achievements in producing Outputs

Outputs 1.1: Nursery facilities established and operational

Success indicators (from logframe in Project Document):

A nursery established

Achievement:

- A nursery was established at Maloya;
- The FSCD funds current operations of the nursery from its normal budget;
- Seedling production is continuing, but has declined from 1.2 million in 2008 to 75,000 in 2012;
- Emphasis is still given to the use of certified seed to produce genetically superior seedlings;
- A manual of Standard Operating Procedures for the nursery was produced in 2007, and some of these procedures are being followed;
- The overall quality of operations has declined over the past few years.

Outputs 1.2: Farmers group on community forest is formed

Success indicators (from logframe in Project Document):

Forest farmers group established

Achievement:

- Socialisation of project approaches has been very effective in many parts of the District;
- Extensive socialisation and consultation took place with local FSCD extension staff;
- Ten farmers' groups were selected from pre-existing groups for capacity building work with the project (including one group known to be involved in illegal logging from state forests), with six of the 10 groups were selected for more intensive work;
- Four of the six groups are currently very active in promoting private tree planting and two, while still active, have little focus on forestry activities, perhaps because of distance from FSCD extension staff.

Outputs 1.3: Local people trained on technology of silvicultural system

Success indicators (from logframe in Project Document):

30 personnel have been trained on technology on silvicultural system. One-month national expert

Achievement:

- A training module was prepared on farmer group management and silviculture for

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> private forests; • Four training courses were conducted by FSCD extension staff and 103 farmers received training; • A group of farmers visited a farmers' group in Sumerdang District practicing improved silviculture in their private forests.
<p>Outputs 2.1: Formulation on forest management plan and, operational procedure of degraded land rehabilitation available</p> <p>Success indicators (from logframe in Project Document): Management plan formulated; A software system requirement is available. Three-month consultant.</p> <p>Achievement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A management plan for private forests in Ciamis District was formulated in 2008, and data collection commenced, but the process is not yet complete.
<p>Outputs 2.2: Stakeholder network on rehabilitation of degraded forest land established</p> <p>Success indicators (from logframe in Project Document): 50 persons participated on dialogue, consultancy and workshop. Consultant subcontract.</p> <p>Achievement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An informal but functional network is in place to connect key stakeholders (such as suppliers of certified seed; FSCD extension staff, etc.) necessary to achieve successful seedling production in government and private nurseries.
<p>Outputs 2.3: Staffs trained on Effective Extension to local peoples</p> <p>Success indicators (from logframe in Project Document): 20 staffs trained. Local transport and DSA (per diem)</p> <p>Achievement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training manual on "Professionalism of Extension" prepared in 2008; • Thirty FSCD extension officers participated in four training courses.

Outcomes

Project outcomes generally refer to the extent to which the Specific Objectives are achieved and include an assessment of related aspects such as sustainability and capacity development. The Specific Objectives defined in the Project Document are:

1. To establish rehabilitation of degraded forest land area through local communities participation following the ITTO guidelines

2. To strengthen local institutional capacity for undertaking rehabilitation of degraded forest land

The success indicators against which to judge achievement (as specified in the logframe in the Project Document) are:

Specific Objective 1: At the end of 2006, a nursery and planting materials of 4 species for 2,000 ha established.

Specific Objective 2: Steering and organizing committee of workshop; system are established; 30 staffs trained

A problem was experienced in evaluating the extent to which the project had achieved its Specific Objectives for two reasons: (i) the formulation of Specific Objective 1 is essentially the same as that for the Development Objective, i.e. both aim to achieve the rehabilitation of degraded forest land through community participation, and (ii) there was little or no degraded private forest land at the commencement of the project, so those parts of both Specific

Objectives that refer to “rehabilitation of degraded forest land” cannot be reported against effectively. It was felt that it was not possible to make a fair evaluation of the project’s achievements against the Specific Objectives as originally formulated. For this reasons, during the field visits to Ciamis District it was decided, after consultation with the project ex-Team Leader, to re-formulate both Specific Objectives and their respective success indicators.

Specific Objective 1 (re-formulated):

1. Private forests in Ciamis District managed sustainably by using high quality seedlings to replace harvested logs and applying improved silvicultural techniques.

Success indicators (re-formulated):

- Private tree growers sourcing high quality seedlings from a network of nurseries across the District to replace the trees harvested in their private forests;
- Private tree growers applying improved silvicultural techniques to their tree crops;
- Regulatory framework at District level to support private forest management.

The achievement of the Project in attaining the re-formulated Specific Objective 1 can be summarised in the following points:

- 700,000 seedlings were produced by the project nursery and 200 other nurseries in the District and planted in private forests, mainly to replace trees harvested (this is roughly equivalent to 2,100 ha of plantations)—the results of the planting have not been monitored;
- Through demonstration and training, the project provided skills to private forest owners to: (i) improve the quality of seedling production for planting in private forests, and (ii) apply silvicultural techniques (including planting, pruning and thinning) to improve the quality of their planted trees;
- These skills are still being used to advantage by farmers’ groups and individual farmers four years after the project concluded;
- About 140 private nurseries have been established in the District since the project commenced as part of a central government sponsored village nursery programme, and are still operating;
- A draft regulation to improve the regulatory framework relating to private forestry has been formulated and circulated in the District government.

Specific Objective 2 (re-formulated):

2. Strengthened local institutional capacity for managing private forest land in Ciamas District

Success indicators (re-formulated):

- Individual forest owners and functional farmers’ groups with the institutional capacity to manage their private forests successfully;
- FSCD extension staff with the necessary skills to provide technical and other support to private forest owners and farmers’ groups.

The achievement of the Project in attaining the re-formulated Specific Objective 2 can be summarised in the following points:

- Four of the six pre-existing farmers’ groups that were supported by the project are functioning effectively four years after the conclusion of the project, and are continuing to take leadership roles in practicing and promoting improved silvicultural management of private forests;
- Some of the skills acquired through project training (such as simple approaches to measuring log volume) have empowered farmers to negotiate fair prices with timber millers and middle men for their harvested logs;

- The Nursery Management Unit of the FSCD has incorporated the project nursery into its normal operations and allocated budget for its continued functioning;
- FSCD extension staff have the confidence and skills to support farmers' groups in improving the management of their private forests.

It can be concluded with confidence that the project has achieved both of its (re-formulated) Specific Objectives.

Capacity development

The project devoted substantial resources to capacity building of farmers' groups, individual farmers, government extension officers and wider stakeholder groups including researchers. This took the form of formal training courses conducted in various localities, study tours and workshops. Individual farmers were already practicing sustainable forestry and they were very open to learning new techniques and approaches that can help them to become more efficient and effective in their endeavours.

Sustainability

The location of the project office within the FSCD contributed significantly to sustainability of activities after the completion of the project. The nursery established by the project has continued to operate since the end of the project, but at a much reduced capacity that is steadily declining.

Impact (Development Objective)

The impact of projects relates to the extent to which they progress towards achieving their development objective. The Development Objective for the project, as stated in the Project Document is:

To promote sustainable management of degraded forest lands through local communities involvement in rehabilitation activities for social, economic and environmental benefits

Success indicator (from logframe in Project Document): Forest lands are rehabilitated at least 50% of the total area

However, as mentioned above, because of the overlap between Specific Objective 1 and the Development Objective, and the absence of degraded private forest land, it was also felt necessary to re-formulate the Development Objective and its success indicators in order to evaluate the achievements of the project more meaningfully. The re-formulation is as follows:

Development Objective 2 (re-formulated):

Private forest land in West Java managed sustainably to produce a mix of economic, social and environmental benefits.

This formulation reflects the statement made in the Project Document that: "*Rehabilitation through local community participation in Ciamis district will be a model rehabilitation approach in Java*". (p.5)

Success indicators (re-formulated):

- A model for sustainable management of private forests developed by the project accepted by other Districts in West Java as a viable approach.

Achievement:

The project began the task of identifying the building blocks of a model for the sustainable management of private forests. The building blocks include the production and distribution of high quality seedlings, the development of a business model for private forestry with the final result being a village as a sustainable private forest management unit (Subarudi, 2008).

The project has made some progress in contributing to this (re-formulated) Development Objective.

In summary, the Project has been successful in achieving its planned Outputs and its (re-formulated) Specific Objectives and in contributing to its (re-formulated) Development Objective (its impact). Among the reasons for this achievement are:

- There was good support at all levels of government and among the targeted rural populations.
- The implementation of the project was efficient and effective.

4.1.2 Project formulation and implementation

Project formulation and design

Apart from the caveats noted elsewhere in this report regarding the absence of degraded private forest land in the District, the project design was reasonably appropriate to the circumstances. In hindsight, a more explicit focus on supporting private forestry might have been more appropriate. The logframe in the Project Document has generally stood the test of time, particularly regarding the formulation of Outputs and Activities.

Implementation arrangements

Managerial and work efficiency were good as judged by reading reports and observing interactions between ex-project staff, District staff and farmers' group members as well as judging from the level of achievement in such a relatively short time frame and the high levels of satisfaction of the FSCD officials and farmers' groups.

Implementation of field activities and follow-up was done primarily through FSCD extension staff who regularly visited the farmers' groups that were working with the project. The project Team Leader also visited field sites on a regular basis. These arrangements all contributed to efficient functioning. The location of the project office within the FSCD contributed significantly to the integration of project activities into normal Forestry Service operations.

Project duration

The project duration was originally planned for 24 months, but was extended with a no-cost extension to 27 months.

Workplans

Annual Workplans were the major vehicles for planning, monitoring progress and reporting. They were constructed in conformity with the logframe in the Project Document, and proved effective in planning activities and tracking performance.

Reporting

Regular Progress Reports were prepared during the life of the project and submitted to ITTO and the FSCD. These used the logframe as the structure against which progress was reported. They also included a summary of the budget situation, the current annual workplan and comments on problems encountered.

Project steering and technical advice

A Project Steering Committee (PSC) was established with a mandate to have a general overview, supervisory, monitoring and support role for the project. Four PSC meetings were held and minutes prepared that recorded the result of deliberations. This institutional mechanism worked well and was perceived by project staff and others to have been very helpful.

Budget issues

The following table shows the original budget and the expenditure for each of the source of funds by the end of the project.

Table 2. Original budget and expenditure for each of the major funding sources

Source of funds	Original budget (USD)	Expenditure (USD)
ITTO	430,875.95*	430,875.95
Gol (in-kind)	77,000	113,722
TOTAL	507,875.95	544,597.95

*An additional amount of USD 63,546 was retained by ITTO for administration, monitoring and evaluation purposes.

The ITTO component of the project's accounts was subjected to formal audits, all of which were satisfactory. Final audited statements were submitted to ITTO.

4.2 Lessons learned

A number of lessons have emerged from the project's implementation, and from general experience with the successful private forestry operations in Ciamis District, that have relevance for the future both in the District and beyond. These include:

1. Support to motivated local community leaders is an effective mechanism to demonstrate and spread knowledge and information aimed at improving productivity of private forests. They can act as unofficial (but highly effective) extension agents to spread the information throughout their communities, and beyond.
2. The major impediment to improving livelihoods based on private forest management under the prevailing conditions in Ciamis relates to improving marketing conditions for timber produced from private forests.
3. An **enabling** regulatory framework that encourages farmers to invest in private forestry is more effective in achieving government policy objectives than an **enforcing** one that requires farmers to plant tree seedlings and protect forests.

5. Conclusions and recommendations

5.1 Conclusions

Private forestry in Ciamis District is well accepted and widely practiced by farmers and supported by the District government. Under these conditions, the project has demonstrated various approaches to support and improve private forestry and make it even more productive. The emphasis given to the production and distribution of high quality seedlings is appreciated by all stakeholders. Similarly, the introduction of improved silvicultural techniques is appreciated as it will lead to the production of higher quality logs in the future. The project also demonstrated approaches to strengthen the internal management of a small number of farmers' groups to make them more effective entities, and provided skills to individual farmers to give them a greater degree of power when negotiating with sawmillers and middle men to sell their logs. Project approaches for the production of quality seedlings have also been socialised through several local schools, thus influencing the coming generation of farmers. The work done by the project has been widely disseminated through the preparation and wide distribution of numerous publications and more particularly through the vehicle of numerous stakeholder workshops.

The Project Document raised expectations that: "*Rehabilitation through local community participation in Ciamis district will be a model rehabilitation approach in Java*" (ITTO 2006, p. 5), and the project began the task of identifying the building blocks of a model for the sustainable management of private forests. This endeavour has some strategic importance because of the changes taking place in the timber industry across the country. Logs sourced from private forests are becoming increasingly important for the local timber industry as the log supply from natural forests declines. In the future there seems little doubt that private forests will be increasingly called on to make up the shortfall. For this reason, the refinement and testing of a private forestry model is of increasing importance. The experiences of the project in Ciamis

could be relevant to other Districts, particularly in West Java, where private forestry has not reached the maturity that it has in Ciamis.

Overall, the project has been successful in achieving its planned Outputs and its Specific Objectives and in contributing to its Development Objective (its impact). Among the reasons for this achievement are:

- There was good support at the District level and among farmers' groups for the skills training which was at the heart of the project's activities.
- The project was well integrated into the operational structure of the Forestry Service of Ciamis District, which assisted with immediate uptake by District extension officers, and contributed to longer term sustainability of activities introduced during the project's life.
- The implementation of the project was efficient and effective.

As well as the local contribution in Ciamis District, the Project has made a useful contribution to the achievement of ITTO's strategic objectives, outlined in the ITTA 1994 Objectives and the Yokohama Action Plan, as shown in the following table.

Table 3. Contribution of the Project to ITTO's strategic objectives as outlined in the ITTA 1994 Objectives and the Yokohama Action Plan

ITTO strategic objectives	Project contributions
Contributing to sustainable development	The project tested and refined an approach to improve the quality of seedlings and the application of improved silvicultural systems for private forestry in Ciamis District.
Encouraging the involvement of non-government stakeholders in activities	The project operated directly with farmers' groups to increase their ability to access high quality seedlings for private forestry and to apply improved silvicultural techniques to their private forests. The project also involved school communities in its activities.
Securing the forest resource base through the implementation of forest policy, legislation and associated strategies	A draft regulation to improve the regulatory framework relating to private forestry has been formulated and circulated in the District government.
Establishing and managing forests for multiple uses in close cooperation with local forest owners and communities living in forest areas	The project supported the development of diverse agroforestry systems in private forests by (i) providing access to non-timber as well as timber species in nurseries, and (ii) providing access to knowledge and information about agroforestry models.

5.2 Recommendations

Recommendations for the Executing Agency (Forestry and Crop Estate Services, Ciamis District-FCSCD)

1. Provide technical and financial support to the nursery established by the project to ensure that it becomes (i) a beacon of excellence in the production of high quality seedlings, and (ii) a training centre for imparting skills and knowledge on all aspects of private forest management.
2. Continue to provide technical and financial support to farmers' groups to enhance their ability to manage their private forests sustainably.
3. Consider improving the enabling regulatory framework further to enhance the incentive structure for private tree growers to continue to engage in private forestry and receive an equitable share of the benefits.
4. Consider investigating approaches aimed at improving marketing of timber products in the District, including access by farmers to a competitive timber market.

Recommendations for the Directorate General of Watershed Management Development and Social Forestry

5. Continue to refine the model for sustainable management of private forests and test its wider application across West Java and beyond.

Recommendations for ITTO

6. Improve assessment of logical frameworks during project design so that outputs, specific objectives, development objectives and their respective success indicators are clearly defined and conform to good practice criteria.

6. References

Anon (2011) Kalupaten Ciamis Dalam Angka: Ciamis Regency in Figures, Tahun 2011.

Dept of Forestry (2008) Hutan Rakyat Jawa Barat: Status reset dan strategi engembangannya. (People's Forest in West Java—status and strategy for development). Balai Penelitian Kehutanan Ciamis, Badan Penelitian dan Pengembangan Hutan, Departemen Kehutanan.

FORDA (2008) Hutan Rakyat Jawa Barat. Research Status and Development Strategy. Forestry Research Institute of Ciamis.

Gilmour, D.A., P.B. Durst and K. Shono (2007) *Reaching Consensus. Multi-stakeholder processes in forestry: Experiences from the Asia-Pacific region*. FAO, Bangkok, Thailand.

ITTO (2002) *ITTO guidelines for the restoration, management and rehabilitation of degraded and secondary tropical forests*. ITTO Policy Development Series, No. 13.

ITTO (2006) Rehabilitation of degraded forest land involving local communities in West Java, Indonesia. Project Document: PD 271/04 Rev.3 (F).

ITTO (2008) Rehabilitation of degraded forest land involving local communities in West Java, Indonesia. Project Completion Report: PD 271/04 Rev.3 (F).

ITTO (2009) ITTO Manual for project monitoring, review, reporting and evaluation General Information Series #14, ITTO, Yokohama, Japan.

Lamb, David (2011) *Regreening the Bare Hills: Tropical Forest Restoration in the Asia-Pacific Region*. World Forests Volume VIII. Springer, Heidelberg, London, New York.

Lamb, D. and Gilmour, D.A. (2003) *Rehabilitation and Restoration of Degraded Forests*. Issues in Forest Conservation, IUCN and WWF, Gland, Switzerland.

Pretty, J. (1995) Participatory learning for sustainable development, *World Development*. 23, 1247-1263.

Subarudi (2008) Establishment of self-sufficient villages rehabilitation on forest and land. Forest Service Ciamis District and ITTO.

7. Annexes

Annex 1. Terms of reference for evaluation

Annex 2. Schedule of activities and people met during evaluation

Annex 3. Powerpoint presentation used for de-brief